

MEETING
INFORMATION**Location**

First Floor: Temporary
City Council Chambers
Orlando City Hall
One City Commons
400 South Orange Ave.

Time

4:00 p.m.

Board Members**Present**

Lucie Ghioto,
Chairperson

Laurie Burns

Beth Hobart

Tim Lemons

Kevin Motschall

Jeffery Thompson

Dena Wild

Absent

Mark Lewis

Scott Sidler

MINUTES ▪ JUNE 6, 2018

OPENING SESSION

- Determination of Quorum
- Pledge of Allegiance
- Introduction of Board Members and Staff
- Consideration of the May 2, 2018 Minutes

Jeff Thompson MOVED to approve the Minutes of the May 2, 2018 meeting.
Beth Hobart SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED
by unanimous voice vote (7-0).

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2018-10041, 209 E. Amelia St.

Applicant David Runnels, 233 W. Park Avenue, Winter Park, 32789

Owner: Clay Heinz, 209 E. Amelia St, Orlando, FL 32803

District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a two story garage with apartment above containing 884 square feet of living space.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.
4. All materials and details to match the existing house.
5. All windows shall simulate historic wood, double-hung, windows and shall have mullions between ganged windows of 8 inches to be similar to historic paired windows.
6. Windows shall be inset to be similar to historic wood windows in the main house and be consistent on both first and second floors.
7. Window trim details shall be similar to main house.
8. French doors shall have a muntin pattern compatible with the style of the house and simulate true divided light doors.
9. Proposed eave and gable details shall be consistent with the existing eave and gable details.

10. Proposed block and mortar joints shall be similar to the main house.
11. Second floor windows on rear elevation shall be non-vision.
12. West side yard setback shall be 5 feet.

Jeff Thompson MOVED to APPROVE the Consent Agenda. Beth Hobart SECONDED the Motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by an unanimous voice vote (7-0).

REGULAR AGENDA

2. Case No.: **HPB2018-10104, 1016 Delaney Avenue**

Applicant/Owner: James Hutcherson, 1016 Delaney Avenue, Orlando, FL 32806

District: Lake Copeland Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a one story 510 square foot addition to the rear of the home. The applicant is requesting a one foot variance to the required 6 foot side yard setback so that the addition may be inline with the house at 5 feet.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.
4. All siding and roof materials shall be similar to the existing materials.
5. The wide window on the south side of the addition shall be a pair of windows similar in size to the existing paired windows.
6. All materials and details to match the existing house.
7. Allow the 1 foot side yard variance for the addition to be 5 feet from the north side property line so that it is inline with the existing house.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included images from the Sanborn Map, site photos, proposed site plan, proposed elevations, existing elevations, and existing survey. He reviewed the Conditions of Approval and stated that the reason this case is not on the consent agenda is because of the requested variance.

Dena Wild asked if the owner concurs with conditions; Mr. Forbes confirmed that they do. Jeffery Thompson asked if the rear fenestration is under purview of the Board; Mr. Forbes stated that non-visible reviews are not under purview in this district. Mr. Thompson questioned if wood siding is under the vinyl siding and if it would be more appropriate to require wood siding be used in the addition if Code states that the existing material be used on any new additions. Mr. Forbes clarified that the vinyl siding was put on prior to districting. In the future, an owner could decide to restore the wood siding. At this time, vinyl siding is being proposed which matches the existing material.

Dena Wild MOVED to APPROVE the request subject to staff conditions. Tim Lemons SECONDED the Motion.

The Board briefly discussed the proposed and existing siding materials.

The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a voice vote (6-1; Thompson opposed).

3. Case No.: HPB2018-10113, 125 Wisteria Avenue

Applicant: William Murphy, 10 E. Rosevear St., Orlando, FL 32804
Owner: Jeffrey Phillips, 1206 N. Mills Avenue, Orlando, FL 32804
District: Lake Copeland Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to retroactively approve changes to the house including removal and replacement of historic clay tile roof, removal of historic windows, change location of front door and material changes to the driveway, porch floor and walkway.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting. Major modifications may require additional HPB approvals.
2. HPB approval does not grant permission to commence construction activity. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
3. HPB Construction Observation. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect must schedule a coordination meeting with HPB Staff to review the HPB conditions of approval and the HPB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction. The general contractor must schedule periodic meetings with the HPB staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the HPB conditions of approval.
4. All visible windows shall be replaced with windows that have dimensional exterior and interior muntins to simulate historic wood, double hung, divided light windows and shall have mullions between ganged windows to be similar to the historic paired windows.
5. Windows shall be inset to be similar to the historic wood windows that were removed.
6. The front door shall be replaced with a more compatible door and either have a muntin pattern compatible with the windows and simulate true divided light doors or a wood Spanish style door. Additional review is required.
8. Roof tiles shall match the historic tiles and shall require additional sample review.
9. Roof edge tile detail shall match the historic condition.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included a series of images from Google Streetview to illustrate changes, he also showed images from the 1982 Florida Master Site File, site map, location of windows, and current images to show the more recent changes. Mr. Forbes stated that the replacement of the windows would not have been approved and that the windows that have been used would not have been approved. He cited the standards concerning the moved location of the door, which states that entrances should not be moved from their original location.

Mr. Thompson asked what the original porch floor material was, which Mr. Forbes referred to the 1982 Master Site File image which showed concrete. At some point, colorful tiles were installed, which have since been removed and replaced with travertine tiles. Mr. Lemons asked if it is known where the front door was originally oriented. Mr. Forbes says that it appears that the door was located on the side of the porch, but the original door was replaced prior to this configuration, as evident in pictures. There is also very little case history in the file for this property since districting.

The Board was provided copies of two emails from neighbors in opposition of the retro-active changes:

- Barbara and John Ramb, 122 Wisteria Avenue, Orlando, FL
- Debra Botwin (Debbie Klein), 128 Wisteria Avenue, Orlando, FL

Debbie Klein, 128 Wisteria Avenue, Orlando, FL 32806, spoke as the neighbor across the street and on behalf of her neighbors, John and Barbara Ramb. Ms. Klein has lived in the house since 1986 and is saddened to see "a gem" of the neighborhood so drastically changed. She stated that the entrance door was to the side. She also stated that the new owner began on the interior and never posted permits and that the exterior changes happened very swiftly and "under the table". She feels that all of the Mediterranean architectural elements have been removed and the house is now more of a contemporary style. She also stated, per her neighbors, that the garage was demolished during these changes. She supports returning the house to all of its original configurations, colors, and style.

Jeff Phillips, 8843 Elliotts Ct., Orlando, FL 32836, spoke as the owner. He stated that there were issues with the tile roof and that it was removed and tar paper put down with the intention of installing a shingle roof. He says he will install a tile roof, per Staff recommendation. He addressed the garage and stated that it was there during his purchase negotiations,

however, it was demolished prior to his final purchase and that the Bank may have had it demolished. Mr. Phillips is also agreeable to changing the colors, per the neighbor's request.

William Murphy, 840 Kenilworth Drive, Orlando, FL 32803, is a neighbor of Mr. Phillips and is assisting him. He stated that Mr. Phillips is agreeable to most of Staff's recommended changes. He requested to keep the door in the new location, centered in the porch.

Dena Wild asked Mr. Fobes why Staff does not recommend that the door be moved back to the side location. Mr. Forbes stated because there was no definitive records of where the door was located. The earliest pictures, from 1982 seemly show the door located to the side but there were no other records to prove this. The Board discussed the location of the door. Mr. Thompson felt that the door should be restored to the original location, as this location is a trait of Mediterranean Revival architecture and makes this structure unique. Lucie Ghioto stated that it is more aesthetically pleasing in the new location however, that is not a consideration of the Historic Preservation Board. Ms. Ghioto asked Staff if the door were moved back to the side position, if the fill-in stucco would match when covering up the opening of the new location. Mr. Forbes stated that the stucco pattern should be able to be matched. Mr. Lemons felt that it is unfortunate that this work was done without proper review and permits and that the authenticity should be restored to this house. Mr. Lemons also stated that the paint color wasn't reviewable in this district. Kevin Motschall, also felt that the side door was unique to Mediterranean architecture and should be restored especially because this major change would not have likely been approved if it had come before the Board prior to being changed. The Board continued to discuss the door location and the edge and end cap details on the roof.

Jeff Thompson MOVED to APPROVE the case subject to staff conditions, with the following modifications:

#6. The front door and windows on the front porch shall also be restored to their original location and configuration. Additional review is required.

#8. Roof tiles shall match the historic tiles and the decorative historic ridge end caps shall be restored, which shall require additional sample review.

Kevin Motschall offered a friendly amendment to not alter Condition 8 to require the ridge end caps be restored. Mr. Thompson did not accept the friendly amendment.

The Motion failed due to lack of a SECOND

Tim Lemons MOVED to APPROVE the case subject to staff conditions, with the following modifications to

#6. The front door and windows on the front porch shall also be restored to their original location and configuration. Additional review is required. Kevin Motschall SECONDED the Motion, which was voted on and PASSED by a unanimous voice vote (7-0).

4. Case No.: HPB2018-10127, 4165 Pappy Kennedy Street.

Applicant: Vikki Johnson, PO Box 152, Mt. Rainier, MD 20712
 Owner: Arthur Kennedy Life Estate, 5330 SW 184th Way, Miramar, FL 33029
 District: Commission District 6

Consideration of Landmark Nomination proposal. The owners/family members are requesting Historic Local Landmark Status for their father's/grandfather's home.

Recommended Action: Recommend to City Council to accept the Historic Preservation Board recommendation to nominate this site for Landmark Status.

Dena Wild MOVED to APPROVE the Landmark Request. Laurie Burns SECONDED the Motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by a unanimous voice vote (7-0).

OTHER BUSINESS

- General Appearances: None
- Announcements:
 - The calendar contest is underway and will wrap up July 13, 2018
 - Elena Pathek from the Board Review Board spoke to the HPB about the Board Review Board's role and asked that the HPB members fill out a form to provide recommendations.
- Report on May Minor Reviews (27)

ADJOURNMENT

Lucie Ghioto, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:00 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary
Jason Burton, City Planning
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Sarah Taitt, Assistant City Attorney



Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer



Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary