

# APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD

# MEETING INFORMATION

# **MINUTES - MAY 17, 2018**

#### Location

Manatee A & B Conf. Rm. 6th Floor, City Hall 400 South Orange Avenue

**Time** 

2:00 p.m.

**Board Members Present:** 

Fulvio Romano, Chair

John Paul Weesner

**Daniel Gordon** 

Mike Mulhall

Jeff Arms

Absent:

Margaret Brock

Patrick Panza

# **OPENING SESSION**

- Chairman Fulvio Romano called the meeting to order at 2:01 p.m.
- Ashley Edwards, Recording Secretary, conducted the Roll Call and determination of a quorum was confirmed.
- Ashley Edwards, Recording Secretary read the Welcome, General Rules of Order and the Appeals process.

# **NEW BUSINESS:**

# **MINUTES**

 John Paul Weesner moved to approve the April 19, 2018 ARB Meeting Minutes. The motion was seconded by Jeffrey Arms. The motion carried 5-0

PUBLIC COMMENT: NONE.

CONSENT AGENDA: NONE.

# **REGULAR AGENDA**

445 W. Amelia St.

Owner/Applicant:

Tyrone Smith

Location:

445 W. Amelia St.

District:

5

Project Planner:

Doug Metzger

ARB2018-10006

Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance

Approval for the Orlando Technical College high-

rise sign.

<sup>1.</sup> Per Sec. 64.246 the text of the high-rise sign must flow white at night. Logos may glow in color. This must be noted on all sign permit documents.

- 2. The building façade must be repaired and patched after removing the existing high-rise sign and before the new high-rise sign is installed.
- 3. The final design and construction must be in strict compliance with the proposed design, except where potentially required space is adequate for the dimensions of the current sign design. Adjustment of size may be required at that time. Any other changes must be requested in writing and significant changes will require a new ARB approval.
- 4. Approval is for the sign only, and does not include any other signs.
- 5. Individual letters must be individually mounted as shown; a connecting raceway is not allowed.
- 6. ARB approval does not grant permission to construct or install, All necessary permits must be obtained prior to installation of the new high-rise sign.

<u>John Paul Weesner moved to approve the project with staff comments. The motion was seconded by Mike Mulhall. The motion carried 5-0.</u>

### 2. 642 W. Church St., Lion's Den

Owner/Applicant:

Richard Faulker/ Randy Bumbalough

Location:

642 W. Church St.

District:

5

Project Planner:

Doug Metzger

ARB2018-10015

Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for the addition of a rooftop bar and related structure.

Recommended Action:

ARB Staff has reviewed the Lion's Den improvements, at 642 W.

Church St. and recommends APPROVAL with the following

conditions:

#### 1. Streetscape:

- A. Building Entries—Doorways must not swing open into the streetscape zone. Building entries should be recessed into the façade so that ingress, egress and entry doors do not conflict or open directly into the pedestrian clear zone.
- B. Sidewalk Cafés Prohibited—Because of the very limited streetscape zone in this area sidewalk cafes are not permitted.

### 2. Architecture

- A. Design Intent:
  - i. ARB staff supports the design concepts for the restoration and exterior improvements of this building and site in the Parramore Heritage National Register Historic District.
  - ii. The design and improvements proposed for this building will have a positive impact on the surrounding area.
- B. Rear Porch and Rooftop Addition—The rear porch and rooftop structure is approved as submitted. Permit plans will be reviewed by ARB staff for consistency with the ARB approval.
- C. Water Table: Every effort should be made to restore or comparably replace the tile water table base on the north and west facades of the building. Alternative treatments of this area will require ARB staff approval.
- D. Storefront System: The storefront system for the entire building must be the same and may not be varied for individual tenant spaces. A folding storefront system and not roll-up doors must be utilized in the large open areas of the storefront.
- E. Streetwall—The streetwall that screens the parking area must be opaque, no more than 36-inches tall and must be architecturally integrated with the building design.
- F. Landscape and Hardscape—ARB staff will review final landscape and hardscape plans, including paving and striping plans for the parking area during the permit review process.
- G. Transparency:
  - i. The ground floor building walls facing all streets must contain a minimum of 15% transparent materials.
  - ii. All glass at the ground level must be clear with a minimum light transmittance of 80%. High performance or Low-e glass

may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%.

- iii. No windows must be dry-walled, or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance.
- iv. Tinted, reflective, or spandrel glass does not count towards meeting the transparency requirements.

#### 3. Site Lighting

- A. A lighting plan compliant with the City's lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M.], including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures, must be submitted for ARB Final Review and approval prior to submittal of vertical building permits.
- B. The lighting plan must include security level lighting for the parking area.

#### 4. Mechanical Equipment

- A. Rooftop Mechanical Equipment Rooftop mechanical equipment must be screened to the height of the mechanical equipment with parapets. louvered panels or perforated metal screen walls.
- B. Venting & Exhaust—All potential restaurant venting and exhaust must be directed to the roof of the building and must not be visible from the public right-of-way. Restaurant venting is not permitted on any façade of the building, nor is it permitted to vent over or towards pedestrian areas. All other venting and exhaust for mechanical and other utilities must be integrated with the building design so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the building. Venting and louver panels must be painted to match the surrounding façade area.
- C. Transformer—Transformers must be screened on three sides with a hedge that is 36-inches tall at the time of planting.
- D. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventer[s] must be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view where necessary. They must be clearly identified on the final utilities plan in the Final ARB submittal. Backflow preventers may also be incorporated into the interior of the parking garage.
- E. Fencing—Any fencing on the site must be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum picket or welded wire. Chain link fencing is prohibited.

#### 5. Signage

- A. ARB Approval—All signage must be approved by a separate ARB application prior to submittal of sign permits. Based on chapter 64 of the Land Development code the site is entitled to 190 s.f. of sign copy area.
- B. Tenant Space Signs—Tenant space and The Perch signs must be halo-lit three dimensional letters with no visible racetracks.
- C. Lion Mural—The lion mural on the Parramore Avenue façade is a sign and will require a sign permit.

#### 6. ARB Approval

- A. Permits—ARB approval does not grant permission to construct or install improvements. All applicable permits must be obtained prior to commence of demolition and/or construction activities.
- B. Modifications to the approved ARB plans must be submitted to ARB staff for review and approval. Significant modifications may require additional approval by the Appearance Review Board.

A Board discussion ensued regarding the species of vegetation on the green wall. The Board suggested the applicant look into the vitality and maintenance cost of the chosen foliage and

Mike Mulhall moved to approve the project with the additional condition that the applicant seek an alternative option for the green screen, and to change the pearlings to tube steel for longevity, these changes can be reviewed and approved at staff level. The motion was seconded by John Paul Weesner. The motion carried 5-0.

# 3. 333 N. Rosalind Ave, Rosalind and Livingston Multi-Family

Owner/Applicant:

**Brooks Stickler** 

Location:

333 N. Rosalind Ave

District:

5

Project Planner:

Doug Metzger

ARB2017-00022

Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for the design of a new 13-story, 389-unit multifamily building with 14,000 s.f. of retail space and a 52 space integrated parking garage.

#### Recommended Action:

ARB Staff has reviewed the proposed Rosalind & Livingston project at 333 N. Rosalind Ave. and recommends APPROVAL of the 13-story, 389 unit multi-family building with a 452-space parking garage, associated amenities and 14,000 s.f. of ground floor retail with the following conditions:

#### 1. Streetscape

- A. Streetscape Design Guidelines:
  - i. All streetscape design and construction is required to comply with the design and construction requirements of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines and the conditions in this staff report.
  - ii. Maintenance Agreement—The applicant must enter into a maintenance agreement with the City to define maintenance responsibilities for the streetscape zone and any proposed outdoor dining areas inside of the right-of-way.
  - iii. City Services Easement—A city services easement must be provided by the applicant for any portion of the 15-foot streetscape zone outside of the right-of-way.
- B. General Streetscape Requirements:
  - i. Structural Soil To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas structural soil, or a Planning Official approved equivalent, must be installed around all canopy street trees consistent with Detail 3.4-O and 3.4-P of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Guidelines.
  - ii. Street Lights Double acorn LED streetlights consistent with the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines must be used on N. Rosalind Ave., E Livingston St. and Ridgewood Ave. They will be spaced based on OUC lighting requirements.
  - iii. Corner Treatments-Intersection corner treatments at N. Rosalind Ave and E. Livingston St. and Ridgewood Ave.
  - i. must be Lawrenceville brick and installed with a 6-inch thick concrete sub-base for the first 6-feet from back of curb transitioning to 4-inches to the outward edge of the 15-foot streetscape zone. Corner treatments at Rosalind and Livingston must provide two directional pedestrian ramps at each corner perpendicular to the centerline of the roadway tney are crossing. A single pedestrian ramp is required at the Ridgewood and Livingston intersection.
  - ii. Corner Clip—A 10-foot corner clip must be provided at the intersection of N. Rosalind Ave. and E. Livingston St. in order to move the existing traffic signal poe outside of the pedestrian clear zone.
  - iii. Materials—Materials in the streetscape must be those approved in the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines.

    Specialty pavers and furniture other than those in the streetscape design guidelines are not permitted in the required streetscape zone.
  - iv. Valve and Junction Boxes—All at grade junction, valve and control boxes in the required streetscape zone must be vehicle bearing grade boxes and lids.
  - v. Building Entries—Doorways must not swing open into the required streetscape zone. Building entries should be recessed into the façade so that ingress, egress and entry doors do not conflict or open directly into the pedestrian clear zone.
  - vi. Curbing and Curb Cuts—All existing curb cuts must be removed and the streetscape and the curbing along the entire project frontage restored during construction. All curbing in the ROW must be Type A curb and gutter per the Land Development Code [LDC] and Engineering Standards Manual [ESM].

#### C. E. Livingston Street:

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on E. Livingston St. must be a minimum of 13-feet from back-of-curb. The furniture zone must be a minimum of 5-feet along the entire project frontage. The concrete sub-base in the furniture zone must be 6-inches thick. The pedestrian clear zone [sidewalk] must be a minimum of 8-feet in width.
- ii. Treatment 2—The streetscape treatment on E. Livingston St. must match Treatment 2 of the Streetscape Design Guidelines. The furniture zone must be 5-feet wide with hex pavers. The pedestrian clear zone must be a minimum of 8-feet wide and must have a Lawrenceville brick window pane with concrete sidewalk cells. The sidewalk cells must have a 2-inch troweled edge with a medium broom finish, The broom finish must be perpendicular to the centerline of the street. On-street parking on E. Livingston must be retained.
- iii. Pedestrian Crossing— The pedestrian crossing at the garage entry must be raised to be at the same grade as the sidewalk adjacent to the driveway with a continuous Lawrenceville brick crosswalk. The grade transition from street grade to sidewalk grade must occur in the 6-foot furniture zone. The driveway ramp may be concrete.
- iv. Street Trees—Street tree wells must be 6-feet by 9-feet, the use of tree grates is optional. The street trees on E. Livingston St. must be high rise live oak trees.

#### D. N. Rosalind Avenue:

- i. Width--The minimum streetscape width on N. Rosalind Ave. must be a minimum of 15-feet from the back-of-curb. The furniture zone must be a minimum of 5-feet along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone must be a minimum of 10-feet in width. The sub-base in the furniture zone must be a minimum of 6-inch thick concrete transitioning to a 4-inch thick concrete sidewalk in the pedestrian clear zone.
- ii. Treatment 2 The streetscape treatment on N. Rosalind Ave. must match Treatment 2 of the Streetscape Design Guidelines. The furniture zone must be hex pavers. The pedestrian clear zone must have a Lawrenceville brick window

- pane with concrete sidewalk cells. The sidewalk calls must have a 2-inch troweled edge with a medium broom finish; the broom finish must be perpendicular to the centerline of the street.
- iii. Street Tree Wells—Street tree wells must be 5-feet by 9-feet, the use of tree grates is optional. The street trees on N. Rosalind Ave. must be high rise live oak trees.
- iv. Sidewalk Café--A Sidewalk cafe may be be permitted to extend into the 15-foot streetscape zone in front of the N. Rosalind retail/restaurant space. The sidewalk café must meet the requirements in the Land Development Code [LDC] including the preservation of a 5-foot pedestrian clear zone adjacent to the furniture zone.

#### E. Ridgewood Avenue:

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on Ridgewood Ave. must be 13-feet from the back-of-curb. The furniture zone must be a minimum of 5-feet along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone must be a minimum of 8-feet in width. The sub-base in the furniture zone must be a minimum of 6-inch thick concrete transitioning to a 4-inch thick concrete sidewalk in the pedestrian clear zone.
- ii. Treatment 4 —The streetscape treatment on Ridgewood Ave. must be Treatment 4 with concrete sidewalk cells from the back-of-curb to the interior edge of the sidewalk. The sidewalk calls must have a 2-inch troweled edge with a medium broom finish; the broom finish must be perpendicular to the centerline of the street.
- i. Street Tree Wells—Street tree wells must be 6-feet by 9-feet, the use of tree grates is optional. The street trees on Ridgewood Ave. must be high rise live oak trees.
- ii. Transition—The streetscape should transition to a 7-foot wide grass parkway strip and a 6-foot wide sidewalk on the east side of the parking garage entry drive.

#### 2. Architecture

- A. Design Intent: ARB staff does support the design intent and development of the Rosalind & Livingston project. ARB staff desires to work with the development team in order to advance the building design and to help deliver a distinctive project that will enhance both the Orlando skyline and life at the street level.
- B. Rosalind Vista Terminus The proposed design of the south façade treatment that terminates the long vista to the north on Rosalind Avenue is distinctive and will make this façade a memorable terminus. The architectural element must include a lighting element that helps the façade glow at night. Prior to submittal of building permits the applicant must submit a lighting plan for the skyline of the building.
- C. Rosalind and Livingston Intersection The proposed design of the northwest façade treatment on Rosalind Avenue is distinctive and will make this façade a memorable terminus. The architectural elements must also include a lighting element for to ensure a distinctive night time appearance. Prior to submittal of building permits the applicant must submit a lighting plan for this building facade.
- D. The Parking Garage Spandrel glass, or an Appearance Review Official approved alternative, must be utilized on the ground floor of the parking garage along Livingston to obscure views of the loading dock and compactor area,

### E. Transparency

- i. The ground floor building walls facing all streets must contain a minimum of 30% transparent materials. A minimum of 15% transparency must be provided on all floors facing the street above the ground level.
- ii. All glass at the ground level must be clear, except as noted in Condition E. above, with a minimum light transmittance of 80%. High performance or low-e glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%.
- iii. No windows must be dry-walled, or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance.
- iv. Tinted, reflective, or spandrel glass does not count towards meeting the transparency requirements.

#### 3. Lighting

- A. A lighting plan compliant with the City's lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M.] including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures must be submitted for ARB staff approval prior to approval of vertical building permits.
- B. It is encouraged that the top of the building be appropriately lit in order to make the building distinct in the night time skyline.

#### 4. Mechanical Equipment

- A. Rooftop Mechanical Equipment Rooftop mechanical equipment must be screened to the height of the mechanical equipment with parapets. louvered panels or perforated metal screen walls.
- B. Venting & Exhaust—All potential restaurant venting and exhaust must be directed to the roof of the building or the east façade and must not be visible from the public right-of-way. Restaurant venting is not permitted to vent over or towards pedestrian areas. All other venting and exhaust for mechanical and other utilities must be integrated with the building design so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the building. Vents and louvered panels must be painted to match the surrounding façade area.
- C. Transformer—Transformers must be screened with decorative, opaque walls and gates up to 6-feet in height or they must be located inside of the parking garage.
- D. Backflow Preventer—The proposed backflow preventer [BFP] location is too close to the Rosalind/Ridgewood intersection and is not acceptable. The BFP must be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view where necessary. ARB Staff's preferred location is in the 20-foot bufferyard on the east side of the parking garage. The BFP must be clearly identified on the final utilities plan in the Final ARB submittal. Backflow preventers may also be

incorporated into the interior of the parking garage.

E. Fencing—Any fencing on the site must be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum picket or welded wire. Chain link fencing is prohibited.

#### 5. Signage

- A. Master Sign Plan—A Master Sign Plan [MSP] for the building, including both low-rise and high-rise signage must be submitted for a separate ARB Major approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy. The MSP shall clearly show how signage will be allocated throughout the project including the type, style, location, and sign area.
- B. The project site is outside of the Downtown Special Sign District.
- C. High-Rise signs—Two high rise are allowed per Sec. 64.246, but they must be identical in size and content and will require a Conditional Use Permit because of the project's proximity to residentially zoned districts. The inclusion of high-rise signs will also reduce the total sign allowance for low rise signage by 50%

#### 6. Telecommunications Equipment Screening

Buildings should be designed to accommodate future placement of telecommunications equipment. Screening areas should be built into rooftop areas so that the placement and screening of the equipment does not become an afterthought.

#### 7. Model

Prior to permitting, a physical 1"= 100' scale model of the project should be provided for the DDB/CRA model located in the Downtown Information Center.

<u>Jeffrey Arms moved to approve the project with the above staff conditions. The motion was seconded by John Paul Weesner The motion carried 4-1. With Mike Mulhall opposing.</u>

### 4. 330 Broadway Ave, Fountain Vu 5

Owner/Applicant:

Mark Kinchla

Location:

330 Broadway Avenue

District:

4

Project Planner:

Doug Metzger

ARB2017-10026

Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for the construction of five (5) 4,010 s.q. f.t. living area 4

story four bed, four one-half bath townhouses

overlooking Lake Eola.

Recommended Action:

ARB Staff has reviewed the proposed Fountain Vu 5 townhouse project at 330 Broadway Avenue, and recommends APPROVAL

with the following conditions:

#### 1. Streetscape

#### A. Streetscape Design Guidelines

- i. All streetscape design and construction is required to comply with the design and construction requirements of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines, as they may be amended from time-to-time, and the conditions of approval in this staff report.
- ii. Maintenance Agreement—If required, the applicant shall enter into a maintenance agreement with the City to define maintenance responsibilities for the streetscape and other aspects of the public realm.
- iii. City Services Easement—A city services easement shall be provided by the applicant for any portion of the streetscape zone outside of the right-of-way.

### B. General Streetscape Requirements:

- i. Curb and Curb Cuts—All existing curb cuts along the project street frontages must be removed during construction. The curb cut area must be replaced with a vertical concrete curb and grassed parkway strip.
- ii. Existing Street Trees The large existing oak trees, in the parkway strips between the sidewalk and back-of-curb, along E. Ridgewood and Broadway must be preserved. Trimming may occur to accommodate the new structure. However, the City Arborist must approve any proposed trimming, prior to the trimming.
- iii. Pedestrian Crossings--The pedestrian crossings at the driveway cuts must be level and at the same grade as the

- sidewalk adjacent to the driveway.
- iv. Pedestrian Clear Zone In no instance shall vertical structures or obstructions be allowed in the required pedestrian clear zone [sidewalk].
- v. Specialty Paving Specialty pavers and other materials not consistent with the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines shall not be permitted inside the right-of-way or city services easements of the streetscape zone. Specialty paving, materials and vertical structures are permitted outside of the City maintained streetscape zone.
- 2. Tree Preservation/Mitigation—A tree removal permit is required to remove trees. As part of the tree removal permit process the Applicant shall work with the City arborist to evaluate the viability of the existing on-site trees and if any mitigation will be required for the removal of any trees.

#### 3. Architecture

- A. Windows—The windows on all facades shall be recessed 1 to 3 inches from the façade to provide additional design texture and shadow lines on the building façades. The addition of window sills or trim treatments is also recommended.
- B. Transparency
  - i. Per Traditional City requirements the ground floor building walls facing all streets must contain a minimum 15% of transparent materials. A minimum of 15% transparency shall be provided on all other floors facing the street above the ground level.
  - ii. All glass at the ground level must be clear. Minimum light transmittance must be 80%. High performance or Low-E glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%.
  - iii. No windows at the ground floor level may be dry-walled, or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance.
  - iv. Tinted, reflective, spandrel glass or glass block does not count towards meeting the transparency requirements.
- **4. Lighting** A lighting plan compliant with the City's lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M.], including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures, must be submitted with the building permit documents.

#### 5. Mechanical Equipment

- A. Transformer Area Screening—Transformer areas outside the building envelope must be screened, at a minimum, with landscaping on three sides that is 4-feet in height at the time of planting. Transformers should not be located between any façade and the street.
- B. At-Grade Mechanical Equipment—At-grade mechanical equipment must be screened with walls and/or vegetation that is the same height as the equipment it is screening. In no instance may mechanical equipment be located between a building and any street, public or private.
- C. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventer[s] must be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view where necessary. They must be clearly identified on the utilities plan.
- D. Fencing—Any fencing on the site must be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum picket, architectural mesh or welded wire. Chain link fencing is prohibited.
- E. Final Elevations—The location and configuration of all exterior venting and mechanical equipment shall be submitted for ARB Staff review prior to submittal of building permits.

#### 6. Model

Prior to permitting, a physical 1"= 100' scale model of the project should be provided for the DDB/CRA model located in the Downtown Information Center.

A Board discussion ensued regarding the new façade of the building and overall size of the project.

John Paul Weesrier moved to defer the project to the June 21, 2018 meeting. The motion was seconded by Fulvio Romano. The motion carried 5-0.

# OTHER BUSINESS

- A. ARB Minor Reviews completed since the March ARB Meeting:
  - a. ARB2018-10013 125 E. Pine St. Update exterior lighting
  - **b.** ARB2018-10014 47 E. Robinson St. Paint Façade white, install new sign
- B. Creative Village Development Review Committee Projects for Approval:
  - 1. No cases for the April CVDRC, the monthly meeting was cancelled.

# **OLD BUSINESS: None**

### DATE OF NEXT MEETING

THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, JUNE 21 2018 AT 2:00 PM.

# **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business to come before the Appearance Review Board, Chairman Fulvio Romano adjourned the meeting at approximately 4:43 p.m.

### STAFF PRESENT

Walter Hawkins, Director of Urban Development
Doug Metzger, City Planning
Ashley Edwards, Board Secretary
Sarah Taitt, Assistant City Attorney II
Shannon Stegman, Project Manager I
Mary-Stewart Droege, Project Manager
Kimberley Allonce, Economic Development Coordinator III
Terrence Miller, Planner II
Michaelle Petion, Planner III

Walter Hawkins, Executive Secretary

Ashley Edwards, Recording Secretary