

# 2nd ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES RQS18-0120 Engineering Services for IBRWRF Pretreatment Improvements Project April 5, 2018 – 8 a.m.

Tarpon (4<sup>th</sup> Floor) & House (7<sup>th</sup> Floor) Conference Rooms City Hall, 400 S. Orange Ave., Orlando, FL

The purpose of the subject meeting was to hold discussions and hear presentations from shortlisted firms and then review, score, and rank each of those firms.

### **Committee Members Present:**

Robert Rutter, Project Manager II (Chair)
Paul Deuel, Wastewater Asst. Division Manager
Robert Rang, Treatment Plant Manager
Anthony Shorter, Treatment Plant Operator Chief
LaChisha Lewis, Contract Compliance Investigator II, Executive Offices/MWBE Office

### **Other City Personnel Present:**

Roger Cooper, Contract Administrator (Facilitator)
Fabio Henao, Purchasing Agent II
Kristina Fries, Project Manager II (Technical Advisor)
Roy Pelletier, Wastewater Project Consultant (Technical Advisor)

### **Members of the Public Present:**

None

#### **Actions/Discussion/Motions:**

Meeting began at 8:00 a.m. on April 5, 2018. Postings were for more than 48 hours in advance, and there was a quorum present. City staff introduced themselves and signed the attendance roster. Discussions continued with the Presentation Schedule of Shortlisted Firms.

#### **Presentation Schedule of Shortlisted Firms:**

| <u>Time</u>        | <u>Date</u> | Company Name                       | Meeting Room           | <u>Floor</u>    |
|--------------------|-------------|------------------------------------|------------------------|-----------------|
| 8:00 – 8:50 a.m.   | 4/5/18      | Carollo Engineers, Inc.            | Tarpon Conference Room | 4 <sup>th</sup> |
| 9:00 - 9:50 a.m.   | 4/5/18      | D&B Engineers and Architects, P.C. | House Conference Room  | 7 <sup>th</sup> |
| 10:00 – 10:50 a.m. | 4/5/18      | Atkins North America, Inc.         | Tarpon Conference Room | 4 <sup>th</sup> |
| 11:00 – 11:50 a.m. | 4/5/18      | WSP USA, Inc.                      | House Conference Room  | 7 <sup>th</sup> |

The Facilitator asked the Committee for approval of the first Meeting Minutes of February 28, 2018. These Minutes had been distributed by email to all Committee Members. A motion was made by <u>Robert Rutter</u> and seconded by <u>Anthony Shorter</u> to accept those Minutes as written. The motion carried unanimously.

Committee Members were advised that Qualification Statements must be independently scored by each Member; that Committee Members should not indicate what score he/she gives to a particular firm; and that Committee Members must not attempt to influence other Committee Members in their scoring.

The meeting was then turned over to the technical Committee Chair, who conducted discussions with the Committee members. At the end of those discussions, each Committee Member individually scored and ranked each firm. The consolidated results of those rankings are as follows:

### 2<sup>nd</sup> Committee Meeting Minutes continued April 5, 2018

- 1. WSP USA, Inc.
- 2. Carollo Engineers, Inc.
- 3. Atkins North America, Inc.
- 4. D&B Engineers and Architects, P.C.

A motion was made by <u>Paul Deuel</u> and seconded by <u>Robert Rutter</u>, to accept the rankings and to recommend to City Council for the Chief Procurement Officer to commence negotiations for a contract with the top ranked firm in ranked order until successful. There were no members of the general public present. The motion carried unanimously.

A motion was made by <u>Robert Rutter</u> and seconded by <u>Anthony Shorter</u>, to adjourn at 12:37 pm. on April 5, 2018. The motion carried unanimously.

These minutes are considered to be the official minutes of the RQS18-0120 Advisory Committee Meeting held on April 5, 2018, and no other notes, tapes, or other recordings taken by anyone takes precedence.

Submitted by:

Reviewed by:

Reviewed and Accepted by:

Roger Cooper, CPPO, C.P.M. (Facilitator)

Contract Administrator

Teddi McCorkle, CPPB, C.P.M.

Assistant CPO

Robert Rutter (Chair)
Project Manager II

Public Works

Attachment: Individual and Consolidated Scoring and Rating Spreadsheet

## RQS18-0120 Engineering Services for IBRWRF Pretreatment Improvements Project Final Scoring

### **COMMITTEE MEMBERS:**

| Bob    | Robert | Paul Deuel | Anthony | LaChisha |
|--------|--------|------------|---------|----------|
| Rutter | Rang   | Paul Deuel | Shorter | Lewis    |

### CONSOLIDATED RANKING:

|                                    | Bob<br>Rutter | Robert<br>Rang | Paul Deuel | Anthony<br>Shorter | LaChisha<br>Lewis | Total | Ranking |
|------------------------------------|---------------|----------------|------------|--------------------|-------------------|-------|---------|
| Atkins North America, Inc.         | 3             | 3              | 3          | 4                  | 3                 | 16    | 3       |
| Carollo Engineers, Inc.            | 2             | 2              | 2          | 1                  | 1                 | 8     | 2       |
| D&B Engineers and Architects, P.C. | 4             | 4              | 4          | 3                  | 4                 | 19    | 4       |
| WSP USA, Inc.                      | 1             | 1              | 1          | 2                  | 2                 | 7     | 1       |

### **INDIVIDUAL SCORING AND RANKING:**

| NO.                     | POSSIBLE<br>POINTS | Atkins North<br>America, Inc. | Carollo<br>Engineers, Inc. | D&B Engineers<br>and Architects,<br>P.C. | WSP USA,<br>Inc. |
|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------|--|------------------|
| A                       | 25                 | 22                            | 24                         | 17                                       | 24               |
| В                       | 15                 | 14                            | 15                         | 11                                       | 15               |
| С                       | 16                 | 14                            | 15                         | 14                                       | 15               |
| D                       | 15                 | 11                            | 14                         | 11                                       | 14               |
| Е                       | 10                 | 10                            | 10                         | 10                                       | 10               |
| F                       | 4                  | 3                             | 4                          | 1  | 4                |
| G                       | 5                  | 0                             | 0                          | 5  | 4                |
| Н                       | 10                 | 7                             | 10                         | 6  | 10               |
| TOTAL<br>POINT<br>VALUE | 100                | 81                            | 92                         | 75                                       | 96               |
| Bob Rutter<br>Ran       | king               | 3                             | 2                          | 4  | 1                |

| NO. | POSSIBLE<br>POINTS | Atkins North<br>America, Inc. | Carollo<br>Engineers, Inc. | D&B Engineers<br>and Architects,<br>P.C. | WSP USA,<br>Inc. |
|-----|--------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------|--|------------------|
| A   | 25                 | 20                            | 25                         | 15                                       | 25               |
| В   | 15                 | 10                            | 15                         | 10                                       | 15               |
| С   | 16                 | 14                            | 15                         | 14                                       | 15               |
| D   | 15                 | 10                            | 15                         | 5  | 15               |
| Е   | 10                 | 8                             | 9                          | 7  | 10               |
| F   | 4                  | 3                             | 4                          | 1  | 4                |
| G   | 5                  | 0                             | 0                          | 5  | 4                |
| Н   | 10                 | 10                            | 9                          | 4  | 10               |

| TOTAL<br>POINT<br>VALUE | 100 | 75 | 92 | 61 | 98 |
|-------------------------|-----|----|----|----|----|
| Robert Rang             |     | 2  | 2  | 1  | 1  |
| Ranking                 |     | 3  | 2  | 4  |    |

| NO.                     | POSSIBLE<br>POINTS | Atkins North<br>America, Inc. | Carollo<br>Engineers, Inc. | D&B Engineers<br>and Architects,<br>P.C. | WSP USA,<br>Inc. |
|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------|--|------------------|
| A                       | 25                 | 23                            | 25                         | 20                                       | 25               |
| В                       | 15                 | 13                            | 14                         | 13                                       | 15               |
| С                       | 16                 | 14                            | 15                         | 14                                       | 15               |
| D                       | 15                 | 14                            | 15                         | 13                                       | 15               |
| Е                       | 10                 | 10                            | 10                         | 10                                       | 10               |
| F                       | 4                  | 3                             | 4                          | 1  | 4                |
| G                       | 5                  | 0                             | 0                          | 5  | 4                |
| Н                       | 10                 | 8                             | 10                         | 6  | 10               |
| TOTAL<br>POINT<br>VALUE | 100                | 85                            | 93                         | 82                                       | 98               |
| Paul Deuel              | Paul Deuel         |                               | 2                          | 4  | 1                |
| Ran                     | king               | 3                             | 2                          | 4  | 1                |

| NO.                     | POSSIBLE<br>POINTS | Atkins North<br>America, Inc. | Carollo<br>Engineers, Inc. | D&B Engineers<br>and Architects,<br>P.C. | WSP USA,<br>Inc. |
|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------|--|------------------|
| A                       | 25                 | 15                            | 25                         | 20                                       | 25               |
| В                       | 15                 | 5                             | 15                         | 10                                       | 15               |
| С                       | 16                 | 14                            | 15                         | 14                                       | 15               |
| D                       | 15                 | 5                             | 15                         | 15                                       | 10               |
| Е                       | 10                 | 8                             | 8                          | 10                                       | 6                |
| F                       | 4                  | 3                             | 4                          | 1  | 4                |
| G                       | 5                  | 0                             | 0                          | 5  | 4                |
| Н                       | 10                 | 8                             | 10                         | 5  | 10               |
| TOTAL<br>POINT<br>VALUE | 100                | 58                            | 92                         | 80                                       | 89               |
| Anthony Short           | Anthony Shorter    |                               | 1                          | 3  | 2                |
| Ran                     | king               | +                             | 1                          | 3  | <u> </u>         |

| NO. | POSSIBLE<br>POINTS | Atkins North<br>America, Inc. | Carollo<br>Engineers, Inc. | D&B Engineers<br>and Architects,<br>P.C. | WSP LISA. |
|-----|--------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------|--|-----------|
| A   | 25                 | 20                            | 25                         | 20                                       | 20        |
| В   | 15                 | 15                            | 15                         | 10                                       | 13        |
| С   | 16                 | 14                            | 15                         | 14                                       | 15        |
| D   | 15                 | 15                            | 15                         | 10                                       | 15        |
| Е   | 10                 | 10                            | 10                         | 10                                       | 10        |

RQS18-0120 Engineering Services for IBRWRF Pretreatment Improvements Project Final Scoring

| F                         | 4   | 3  | 4  | 1  | 4  |
|---------------------------|-----|----|----|----|----|
| G                         | 5   | 0  | 0  | 5  | 4  |
| Н                         | 10  | 6  | 10 | 5  | 9  |
| TOTAL<br>POINT<br>VALUE   | 100 | 83 | 94 | 75 | 90 |
| LaChisha Lewis<br>Ranking |     | 3  | 1  | 4  | 2  |