

APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD

MEETING INFORMATION

MINUTES - JULY 20, 2017

Location

Sustainability Conf. Rm. 2nd Floor, City Hall One City Commons 400 South Orange Avenue

Time

2:00 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Justin Ramb, Chair

Patrick Panza

Daniel Gordon

John Paul Weesner

Absent:

Margaret Brock

Fulvio Romano, Vice Chair

OPENING SESSION

- Chair, Justin Ramb. called the meeting to order at 1:59 p.m
- Ashley Edwards, Recording Secretary, conducted the Roll Call and determination of a quorum was confirmed.
- Chair, Justin Ramb read the Welcome, General Rules of Order and the Appeals process.

NEW BUSINESS

NONE.

MINUTES

John Paul Weesner moved to approve the June 15, 2017 ARB Meeting Minutes. The motion was seconded by Patrick Panza. The motion carried 4-0.

CONSENT AGENDA: None.

REGULAR AGENDA

1. 532 W. Church St.

Owner/Applicant:

Patrick Fore

Location:

532 W. Church St.

District:

5

Project Planner:

Doug Metzger

ARB2017-00028

Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for the

substantial improvement of the property including a building addition, façade and canopy renovation, outdoor dining area and parking area improvements.

Recommended Action:

Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following conditions:

- 1. Limits of Approval—This ARB approval is limited to the 532 W. Church Street proposed façade and building improvements, the proposed building addition, the outdoor dining area owned by the CRA, the parking area owned by the City of Orlando and the access improvements located on the Royal Palm Elks Lodge property. This approval does not cover any proposed improvements outside the above areas.
- 2. Rehabilitation Standards—Because the building is a contributing structure to the Holden-Parramore National Register Historic District all rehabilitation work must be done in accordance with all applicable U.S. Secretary of the Interior's "Standards for Rehabilitation" as follows:
 - A. Every reasonable effort shall be made to provide a compatible use for a property which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, or site and its environment, or to use a property for its originally intended purpose.
 - B. The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features shall be avoided when possible.
 - C. All buildings, structures, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.
 - D. Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building,
 structure, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.
 - E. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, or site shall be treated with sensitivity.
 - F. Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features shall be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
 - G. The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that could damage the historic building materials shall be discouraged.
 - H. Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to any project.
 - I. Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural materials, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood or immediate environment.
 - J. Contemporary design for new construction shall not be discouraged when such new construction is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood or immediate environment.
 - K. Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.

3. Façade Renovations and Improvements

- A. Building Colors—Proposed building colors are approved as submitted.
- B. Cornice—The proposed cornice obscures the historic architecture of the parapet and is not approved. The existing parapet design must be preserved and stabilized.
- C. Paint Removal—ARB staff supports rehabilitating the front façade to the original brick, but does not support the use of sandblasting. The applicant should utilize a less structurally invasive technique such as "stick and peel" or Drummond Smart Strip.
- D. Outdoor Dining Area—The surface of the outdoor dining area must be Lawrenceville brick to match the brick in the adjacent streetscape.
- E. Outdoor Dining Area Canopy and Pergola—The profile and material of the outdoor dining area canopy and pergola must match the material and profile of the Church Street canopy.
- F. Storefront System—The front entry doors on Church Street must be recessed, similar to the adjacent tenant space, so that the entry doors do open directly into the limited pedestrian clear zone of the streetscape.
- G. Exterior Doors—A minimum 4"x6" security view panel shall be provided in all pedestrian accessible exterior doors, including emergency exit doors, to provide visibility and security for pedestrians exiting the building.

4. Site Improvements

- A. Elks Access Drive— The concrete elks access drive is acceptable as submitted. Non-concrete areas need to be 57 stone.
- B. Parking and Rear Yard—the parking area and rear yard must be surfaced with 57 stone per City engineering standards.
- C. Parking Stop Bars—The parking space stop bar must be concrete and painted yellow to ensure day and night time visibility. The bars must be anchored in place with a re-bar rod a minimum of 24-inches in length.

- D. Dumpster Enclosure—The dumpster enclosure must be concrete block with a smooth stucco finish on the exterior to match the existing building finish. The top of the dumpster enclosure must include a cap or decorative band that simulates the top of the existing building parapet. Landscaping, must include a hedge a minimum of 36-inches tall at the time of planting and maintained at a minimum height of 48-inches on both the north and south sides of the enclosure. The landscaping on the north side of the enclosure must also include understory trees to reduce views of the enclosure from the street.
- E. Streetwall—a 36-inch tall opaque street wall must be construct from the western side of the building to the Elks Lodge entry drive, including a break for the ADA parking space pedestrian connection to the streetscape.
- F. Perimeter Fence—the rear yard perimeter fence must be black vinyl-coated chain link fence a maximum of 8-feet tall with a top and bottom rail. All posts, rails and fixtures must also be black.
- G. Streetscape—Any damage to the Church Street streetscape during construction or rehabilitation activities must be repaired prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy for The District tenant space by the applicant or contractor.

5. Lighting

- A. Parking Are Lighting—Lighting must be provided for the side and rear parking areas. The light fixtures must be shielded and comply with the City lighting ordinance. The maximum foot candles [f.c.] at the property line must be zero f.c. per city code.
- B. All exterior lighting and fixtures will be reviewed by ARB Staff during the building permit process. All exterior lighting must comply with the City lighting code and a photometric plan must be included in the permit documents.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Utilities

- A. Venting & Exhaust—All restaurant venting and exhaust shall be directed to the roof of the building, unless an acceptable alternative is approved by the Appearance Review Officer. Restaurant venting is not permitted on any street facing façade of the building and must not be visible from the public right-of-way. All other vents and exhaust must be a minimum of 12 ft. above grade and must be integrated into the building design so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the building. Exterior vents shall be painted to match the color of the façade around them.
- B. Transformer Area Screening—Transformer areas outside the building envelope shall be screened with landscaping including a hedge that is 48-inches tall at the time of planting.
- C. Mechanical Equipment—All ground mounted and rooftop mechanical equipment shall be screened to the top of the equipment and meet the screening conditions of the Land Development Code. An interior screen wall or parapet for rooftop mechanical equipment may be required. The interior screen wall or parapet shall be the same height as the installed mechanical equipment height.
- D. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventer[s] shall be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view as necessary. They shall be clearly identified on the final utilities plan.
- E. Electric Meters and Switch Boxes Electric meters and switch boxes mounted to exterior walls shall not be located on street facing facades.

7. Signage and Murals

- A. ARB Approval—All exterior signage and murals must be submitted for an ARB Minor Review prior to submittal of sign permits.
- B. Projecting Blade Sign—The projecting blade sign on the Church Street façade should be relocated to the space between the two eastern stucco panels on the Church Street façade. The sign may project no more than 4-feet from the front façade and not extend above the top of the parapet.
- C. Murals—Proposed murals must be hand painted by an artist and must comply with the City mural guidelines and policies.

8. ARB Approval

- A. Permits—ARB approval does not grant permission to construct or install improvements. All applicable permits must be obtained prior to commence of demolition and/or construction activities.
- B. Modifications to the approved ARB plans must be submitted to ARB staff for review and approval. Significant modifications may require additional approval by the Appearance Review Board.

<u>Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation highlighting the conditions of approval. A Board discussion ensued regarding the façade and proposed artwork.</u>

John Paul Weesner moved to approve based on staff conditions and subject to the additional condition that the applicant bring the landscape master plan including the outdoor dining area and specific materials to be used on the site back to the ARB for final review and approval. The motion was seconded by Patrick Panza The motion carried 4-0

2. 400 W. Robinson St.

Owner/Applicant:

State of Fiorida/Maxwell Spann

Location:

400 W. Robinson Street

District:

5

Project Planner:

Doug Metzger

ARB2017-10004

Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for the renovation of the plaza area between the two office towers and the addition of ADA parking spaces on

Beggs St.

Recommended Action:

Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following

conditions:

1. Streetscape

A. Streetscape Design Guidelines

- i. The Beggs Avenue streetscape design and construction is required to comply with the design and construction requirements of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines and the conditions in this staff report.
- ii. City Services Easement—A city services easement shall be provided by the applicant for any portion of the 15-foot streetscape zone outside of the right-of-way.
- iii. Maintenance Agreement—The applicant shall enter into a maintenance agreement with the City to define maintenance responsibilities for the streetscape zone and any proposed outdoor dining areas.
- B. General Streetscape Requirements:
 - i. Street Trees High rise live oaks trees shall be planted as the primary street tree on Beggs Avenue along the back of the sidewalk.
 - ii. Structural Soil To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas, structural soil or a Planning Official approved equivalent shall be installed around all canopy street trees consistent with Detail 3.4-O and 3.4-P of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Guidelines.
 - iii. Street Lights Double acorn LED streetlights, consistent with the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines shall be used along Beggs Avenue and spaced based on OUC lighting requirements.
 - iv. Valve and Junction Boxes—All at grade junction, valve and control boxes in the streetscape zone shall be traffic bearing grade boxes and lids. Box lids must be painted a color that matches the adjacent streetscape material.

2. Site Improvements

- A. Design Intent ARB Staff supports the design intent, site plan, materials, furniture and proposed finishes of in the ARB application package.
- B. Beggs Ave. On-Street Parking—ARB Staff supports the addition of on-street parking spaces along Beggs Ave. However, approval of the City Parking Division and the Transportation Engineering Division will be required prior to submittal of building permits.

3. Lighting

- A. Parking Are Lighting—Lighting must be provided for the side and rear parking areas. The light fixtures must be shielded and comply with the City lighting ordinance. The maximum foot candles [f.c.] at the property line must be zero f.c. per city code.
- B. All exterior lighting and fixtures will be reviewed by ARB Staff during the building permit process. All exterior lighting must comply with the City lighting code and a photometric plan must be included in the permit documents.

4. ARB Approval

- A. Permits—ARB approval does not grant permission to construct or install improvements. All applicable permits must be obtained prior to commence of demolition and/or construction activities.
- B. Modifications to the approved ARB plans must be submitted to ARB staff for review and approval. Significant modifications may require additional approval by the Appearance Review Board.

<u>Doug Metzger gave a Power Point presentation giving a brief overview of the project and highlighting the conditions of approval. A Board discussion ensued regarding the placement of the parking spaces.</u>

Danny Gordon moved to approve based on staff conditions and subject to an additional condition that the streetscape treatment plan and proposed parking area be reviewed at the August 17, 2017 ARB meeting. The motion was seconded by John Paul Weesner. The motion carried 4-0

3. 692 N. Orange Avenue

Owner/Applicant:

Samir Obeid, Magic Pet, LLC/Casey Nelson

Location:

692 N. Orange Avenue

District:

5

Project Planner:

Doug Metzger

ARB2017-10005

Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for the renovation of the building facades and other site

plan improvements.

Recommended Action:

Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following

conditions:

1. Streetscape

- A. Width—The subject property will provide enough land area along W. Colonial Drive and N. Orange Avenue to provide a 15-foot wide streetscape zone from the back-of-curb.
- B. City Services Easement—A city services easement shall be provided by the applicant for any portion of the 15-foot streetscape zone outside of the right-of-way.

2. Façade Renovations and Improvements

- A. **Building Colors**—The proposed building colors are generally acceptable. Final building colors must be submitted to ARB Staff for approval prior to issuance of building permits.
- B. **Materials**—The proposed buildings materials and uses are approved as submitted. Final materials and finishes will be approved by ARB Staff during the building permit process.
- C. Exterior Doors—A minimum 4"x6" security view panel shall be provided in all pedestrian accessible exterior doors, including emergency exit doors, to provide visibility and security for pedestrians exiting the building.

3. Site Improvements

- A. Street Wall—Per the Land Development Code [LDC], a 36-inch tall masonry opaque street wall to screen the parking area will be constructed in conjunction with the development of the streetscape by the CRA/Downtown Development Board.
- B. Parking Landscape Buffer— A minimum 48-inch wide landscape buffer must be provided by the applicant between the inward edge of the streetscape zone and the parking spaces along Colonial Drive and N. Orange Avenue.
- C. Interim Landscape Condition—The proposed site improvements will be completed before the new streetscape can be constructed. Therefore prior to the issuance of a certificate of occupancy Magic Pet will install scd or groundcovers from the back of the existing sidewalks on Colonial Drive and N. Orange Avenue to the edge of the 48-inch parking landscape buffer described in Condition B.
- D. Driveway Cut—15-feet behind the edge of pavement the driveway cut on Orange Ave must be reduced to 24-feet in width and located as far south of the Orange and Colonial intersection as is feasible. A 25-foot radius transition per the Engineering Standards manual must extend from 15-feet behind the edge of pavement to the edge of pavement. A 6-inch vertical curb must be install from the edge of the driveway radius to the existing vertical curb along Orange Ave. The existing sidewalk must also be replaced.
- E. Building Landscape—Per LDC requirements a 36-inch landscape zone is required between the face of building and the parking area.
- F. Parking Stop Bars—The parking space stop bar must be concrete and painted yellow to ensure day and night time visibility. The bars must be anchored in place with a re-bar rod a minimum of 24-inches in length.

- G. **Dumpster Enclosure**—The dumpster enclosure must be concrete block with a smooth stucco finish on the exterior and painted to match the existing building finish. The top of the dumpster enclosure must include a decorative cap or band.
- H. ADA Parking Crosswalk—The crosswalk between the handicap parking space and the building entrance must constructed with a material that contrasts with the driving surface.
- 4. **Lighting**—A lighting plan compliant with the City's lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M.] including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures shall be submitted for ARB Staff review and approval prior to issuance of building permits for the exterior improvements.

5. Mechanical Equipment and Utilities

- A. Mechanical Equipment—All ground mounted and rooftop mechanical equipment shall be screened to the top of the equipment and meet the screening conditions of the Land Development Code. An interior screen wall or parapet for rooftop mechanical equipment may be required. The interior screen wall or parapet shall be the same height as the installed mechanical equipment height.
- B. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventer[s] shall be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view as necessary. They shall be clearly identified on the final utilities plan.
- C. Electric Meters and Switch Boxes Electric meters and switch boxes mounted to exterior walls shall not be located on street facing facades.
- 6. Signage All exterior signage and must be submitted for an ARB Minor Review prior to submittal of sign permits.

7. ARB Approval

- A. Permits—ARB approval does not grant permission to construct or install improvements. All applicable permits must be obtained prior to commence of demolition and/or construction activities.
- B. Modifications to the approved ARB plans must be submitted to ARB staff for review and approval. Significant modifications may require additional approval by the Appearance Review Board.

<u>Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation highlighting the aspects of the project and the conditions of approval. Mr. Metzger also mentioned the CRA's consideration of contributing to the revitalization of the right-of-way streetscape, A Board discussion ensued regarding the overall layout of the parking lot.</u>

John Paul Weesner moved to approve based on staff conditions and subject to an additional condition that the site improvements and site plan be reviewed at the August 17, 2017 ARB meeting. The motion was seconded by Danny Gordon. The motion carried 4-0.

OTHER BUSINESS

- A. ARB Minor Reviews completed since the June ARB Meeting:
 - 1. ARB2017-00025 101 Lake Ave. Installation of public art sculpture piece.
 - 2. ARB2017-00026 131 N. Orange Ave. Addition of Sidewalk Café.
 - ARB2017-00027–400 S. Orange Ave Addition of public space recycling.

B. Creative Village Development Review Committee Projects for Approval:

1. No cases for the July CVDRC, the monthly meeting was cancelled.

OLD BUSINESS: None

DATE OF NEXT MEETING

THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, AUGUST 17, 2017 AT 2:00 PM.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Appearance Review Board, Chairman Justin Ramb adjourned the meeting at approximately 3:40 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Sarah Taitt, Assistant City Attorney II
Walter Hawkins, Director of Urban Development
Doug Metzger, City Planning
Christel Brooks, Administrative Specialist
Ashley Edwards, Board Secretary
Richard Forbes, Senior Planner
Terrance Miller, Planner II
Christopher DeLoatche, Planning Technician
Jason Burton, Chief Planner
Shannon Stegman, Project Manager I

Walter Hawkins, Acting Executive Secretary

Ashley Edwards, Recording Secretary