2nd ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES RFP17-0181- Executive Level Disaster Consulting Services Request for Proposals April 13, 2017 – 9:00 a.m.

Dolphin Conference Room, 4th Floor, City Hall, 400 S. Orange Ave., Orlando, FL

The Advisory Committee for the above project convened on April 13, 2017, at 9:00 a.m. at the City Hall in Orlando, Florida. The purpose of this meeting is to review the responsive proposals to the RFP and review, score, and rank each of those firms.

Committee Members Present:

- 1. Michael Carroll, Solid Waste Division Manager (Chair)
- 2. Laurie Nossair, Deputy City Clerk
- 3. William Spinelli, Controller
- 4. Ashley Connolly, Fiscal Manager, Public Works
- 5. Manuel Soto, Emergency Manager

PROCUREMENT REPRESENTATIVES:

Teddi McCorkle, Senior Contract Administrator (Facilitator) Maureen S. Bowman, Purchasing Agent II

Actions/Discussion/Motions:

Teddi McCorkle, Facilitator, introduced herself and took the following actions:

- 1. Called the meeting to order at 9.05 a.m.
- 2. Reminded everyone that the meeting is being recorded.
- 3. Had all Committee members and others present introduce themselves.
- 4. Advised the Committee that a quorum was established.
- 5. Announced that the meeting was publicly posted for more than 48 hours in advance.
- 6. Asked all attendees to sign the sign-in sheet.
- 7. Reminded the Committee of the Public Input Procedures and indicated that no one was present from the public.

A copy of the March 27, 2017, 1st Committee Meeting Minutes has been distributed to the Committee for review. A motion was made by <u>Manny Soto</u> and seconded by <u>Bill Spinelli</u>, to accept the March 27, 2017 1st Committee Meeting Minutes as written. The motion carried unanimously. No one from the public was present.

Actions/Discussion/Motions:

References – Were previously transmitted to Committee members for their review and there was a general discussion regarding references received.

Dun and Bradstreet -Ashley Connelly reported to the Committee members her findings.

Following the discussion of the scoring criteria, the Committee discussed each Proposer. Committee members individually scored and ranked each proposal. The resulting Final Ranking is as follows:

- 1. Witt O'Briens, LLC
- 2. Tetra Tech, Inc.
- 3. Atkins North America, Inc.
- 4. GP Strategies Corporation
- 5. David M. Shapiro Disaster Planning and Recovery Consultants, Inc.

A motion was made by <u>Manny Soto</u> and seconded by <u>Laurie Nossair</u> to accept the ranking and evaluations of the proposals, and recommend to City Council that the Chief Procurement Officer negotiate and execute a contract with one (1) Proposer in the ranked order until successful. No one was present from the public. Discussion ensued. Motion carried unanimously.

<u>Teddi McCorkle</u> reminded the Committee that all the rules are still in place until a contract is signed and that all proposals and evaluation materials will be collected after the meeting is adjourned.

Mike Carroll, Chair, adjourned the meeting at 11:11 a.m.

These minutes are considered to be the official minutes of the RFP17-0181 2nd Advisory Committee Meeting held on April 13, 2017, and no other notes, tapes, or other recordings taken by anyone takes precedence.

Reviewed and Accepted by:

Teddi McCorkle, CPPB, C.P.M.

(Facilitator) Sr. Contract Administrator

Procurement & Contracts Division

Reviewed and Accepted by:

Michael Carroll (Chair)

City of Orlando

Solid Waste Division Manager

Attachments: Scoring Sheets and Final Tabulation

Sign-in Sheets

CITY OF ORLANDO PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACTS DIVISION SIGN-IN SHEET 2nd COMMITTEE MEETING

SOLICITATION NUMBER:

RFP17-0181

DATE: April 6, 2017

TIME: 9:00 a.m.

TITLE:

EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

LOCATION: City Hall at One City Commons, 400 South Orange Avenue, 4th Floor, Tarpon Conference Room, Orlando, Florida

| COMPANY NAME & ADDRESS DEPARTMENT/BUREAU | | | EMAIL **DO NOT LEAVE BLANK** |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|--------------------------------------|
| Procurement and Contracts Division City Hall at One City Commons 400 South Orange Avenue, 4 th Floor Orlando, Florida 32801 | Maureen S. Bowman Purchasing Agent II | (407) 246-2363 | Maureen.bowman@cityoforlando.n et |
| Procurement and Contracts Division City Hall at One City Commons 400 South Orange Avenue, 4 th Floor Orlando, Florida 32801 | Teddi McCorkle Facititator Senior Contract Administrator Checke | (407) 246-2332 | teddi.mccorkle@CityofOrlando.net |
| Solid Waste Division City of Orlando 1028 Woods Avenue Orlando, Florida 32805 | Michael Carroll Chaire Solid Waste Division Manager W Carroll | (407) 246-3050 | michael.carroll@CityofOrlando.net |
| City of Orlando City Hall at One City Commons 400 South Orange Avenue, 2 nd Floor Orlando, Florida 32801 | Laurie Nossair Deputy City Clerk Sollle Engold | 407-246-3538 | laurie.nossair@cityoforlando.net |

CITY OF ORLANDO PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACTS DIVISION SIGN-IN SHEET 2nd COMMITTEE MEETING

SOLICITATION NUMBER:

RFP17-0181

DATE: April 6, 2017

TIME: 9:00 a.m.

TITLE:

EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

LOCATION: City Hall at One City Commons, 400 South Orange Avenue, 4th Floor, Tarpon Conference Room, Orlando, Florida

| COMPANY NAME & ADDRESS DEPARTMENT/BUREAU | COMPANY REPRESENTATIVE (PLEASE PRINT YOUR NAME & PROVIDE SIGNATURE) | TELEPHONE # | EMAIL **DO NOT LEAVE BLANK** |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------|------------------------------------|
| Business and Financial Services Division City Hall at One City Commons 400 South Orange Avenue, 4 th Floor Orlando, Florida 32801 | William Spinelli Controller | 407-246-2165 | william.spinelli@cityoforlando.net |
| Public Works Department City Hall at One City Commons 400 South Orange Avenue, 8 th Floor Orlando, Florida 32801 | Ashley Connolly Fiscal Manager AMUM Connol | 407-246-2768 | ashley.connolly@cityoforlando.net |
| Fire Support Services Bureau Fire Emergency Management City of Orlando | Manuel Soto, Jr. Emergency Manager | 321-235-5438 | manuel.soto@cityoforlando.net |
| | | | |

| Committee | Michael | Laurie | William | Ashley | Manuel |
|-----------|---------|---------|----------|----------|--------|
| Members> | Carroll | Nossair | Spinelli | Connolly | Soto |

CONSOLIDATED RANKINGS:

| | Michael Carroll | Laurie Nossair | William Spinelli | Ashley Connolly | Manuel Soto | Total | Ranking |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------|-------------------|---------------------|--------------------|----------------|-------|---------|
| Atkins North America | 3 | 3 | 3 . | 3 | . 3 | 15 | 3 |
| David M. Shapiro Disaster Planning and Recovery Consultants, Inc. | 4 | 4 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 23 | 5 |
| GP Strategies Corporation | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 21 | 4 |
| Tetra Tech, Inc. | 2 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 8 | 2 |
| Witt O'Brien's LLC | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 1 | 7 | 1 |

INDIVIDUAL SCORINGS / RANKINGS:

| NO. | POSSIBLE POINTS | Atkins North America | David M. Shapiro Disaster Planning and Recovery Consultants, Inc | GP Strategies Corporation | Tetra Tech, Inc. | Witt O'Brien's LLC |
|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|
| Α | 50 | 40 | 38 | 33 | 48 | 49 |
| В | 20 | 17 | 14 | 14 | 18 | 19 |
| С | 30 | 29 | 27 | 30 | 28 | 28 |
| TOTAL POINT VALUE | 100 | 86 | 79 | 77 | 94 | 96 |
| Michael Carrol Rani | | 3 | 4 | 5 | 2 | 1 |

| NO. | POSSIBLE POINTS | Atkins North America | David M. Shapiro Disaster Planning and Recovery Consultants, Inc | GP Strategies Corporation | Tetra Tech, Inc. | Witt O'Brien's LLC |
|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|
| A | 50 | 40 | 38 | 40 | 45 | 50 |
| В | 20 | 20 | 20 | 18 | 20 | 20 |
| C | 30 | 30 | 20 | 20 | 28 | 29 |
| TOTAL POINT VALUE | 100 | 90 | 78 | 78 | 93 | 99 |
| Laurie Nossair Rani | king | 3 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 1 |

| NO. | POSSIBLE POINTS | Atkins North America | David M. Shapiro Disaster Planning and Recovery Consultants, Inc | GP Strategies Corporation | Tetra Tech, Inc. | Witt O'Brien's LLC |
|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|
| A | 50 | 41 | 38 | 33 | 46 | 44 |
| В | 20 | 15 | 12 | 11.5 | 17 | 18 |
| С | 30 | 26 | 22 | 28 | 25 | 24 |
| TOTAL POINT VALUE | 100 | 82 | 72 | 72.5 | 88 | 86 |
| William Spin Ri | elli anking | 3 | 5 | 4 | 1 | 2 |

| NO. | POSSIBLE POINTS | Atkins North America | David M. Shapiro Disaster Planning and Recovery Consultants, Inc | GP Strategies Corporation | Tetra Tech, Inc. | Witt O'Brien's LLC |
|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|
| A | 50 | 45 | 30 | 30 | 48 | 47 |
| В | . 20 | 17 | 14 | 10 | 17 | 19 |
| Ċ | 30 | 29 | 15 | 30 | 28 | 26 |
| TOTAL POINT VALUE | 100 | 91 | 59 | 70 | 93 | 92 |
| Ashley Conno | olly nking | 3 | 5 | 4 | 1 | 2 |

| NO. | POSSIBLE POINTS | Atkins North America | David M. Shapiro Disaster Planning and Recovery Consultants, Inc | GP Strategies Corporation | Tetra Tech, Inc. | Witt O'Brien's LLC |
|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|
| Α | 50 | 35 | 25 | 30 | 40 | 45 |
| В | 20 | 15 | 10 | 10 | 17 | 19 |
| C | 30 | 15 | 10 | 15 | 20 | 25 |
| TOTAL POINT VALUE | 100 | 65 | 45 | 55 | 77 | 89 |
| Manuel Soto Ra | nking | 3 | 5 | 4 | 2 | 1 |

t**h** 1

Atkins North America David M. Shapiro Disaster

Disaster GP
Planning and Strategies

Corporation

Tetra Tech, Inc. Witt O'Brien's LLC

Recovery Consultants,

Inc

86

90

79

77

94

96

| 82 | 72 | 72.5 | 88 | 86 |
|----|----|------|----|----|
| | | | | |

| 91 | 59 | 70 | 93 | 92 |
|----|----|----|----|----|

| Atkins North America | David M. Shapiro Disaster Planning and Recovery Consultants, | GP Strategies Corporation | Tetra Tech, Inc. | Witt O'Brien's LLC | |
|-------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|--|
| 414 | 333 | 352.5 | 445 | 462 | |
| 65 | 45 | 55 | 77 | 89 | |

Inc

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: _ | Asniey | Connelly | Date: April 13, 2017 |
|---------------------|--------|-----------------|----------------------|
| | | • | |

Firm Name: Atkins North America, Inc.

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 45 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 17 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 29 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 91 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | ralue; etc.) | 3 |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

Ashley Comalley

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: | | Ashley Connelly | Date: April 13, 2017 |
|-------------------|---------|--------------------------|----------------------|
| Firm Name: | David M | I. Shapiro Disaster Plan | ning and Recovery |
| | Consult | ants, Inc. | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 30 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 14 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | i 5 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 59 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | alue; etc.) | 5 |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

Committee Member: Ashley Connelly Date: April 13, 2017

Firm Name: **GP Strategies Corporation**

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 30 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 10 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 30 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 10 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | alue; etc.) | 4 |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: | | Ashley Con | nelly | Date: April 13, 2017 |
|-------------------|-------|------------|-------|----------------------|
| Firm Name: | Tetra | Tech, Inc. | _ | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 48 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 17 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 28 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 93 |
| KING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * flects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | alue; etc.) | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

anly Comothy

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: | | Ashley Connelly | Date: Apri | 1 13, 2017 |
|-------------------|---------|-----------------|------------|------------|
| | | | | |
| Firm Name: | Witt O' | Brien's, LLC | | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 47 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 19 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 20 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 92 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | 2 | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: | | Laurie Nossair | <u>Date: April 13, 2017</u> |
|-------------------|----------|---------------------|-----------------------------|
| | | | |
| Firm Name: | Atkins N | North America, Inc. | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 40 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 20 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 30 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 90 |
| KING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * lects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | 3 | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

Racine Enonair

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: | | Laurie Nossair | Date: April 13, 2017 |
|-------------------|---------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Firm Name: | David N | A. Shapiro Disaster Pla | nning and Recovery |
| · | Consult | ants, Inc. | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 38 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 20 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 20 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 78 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point value; etc.) | | 4 |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

Larevie Enmar

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

Firm Name: **GP Strategies Corporation**

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 40 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 18 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 20 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 78 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | alue; etc.) | 4 |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, secondranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

Laure ensoin

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: | Laurie Nossair | Date: April 13, 2017 |
|-------------------|----------------|----------------------|
| | | |
| Firm Name: Tetra | Tech, Inc. | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 45 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 20 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 28 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 93 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point value; etc.) | | 2 |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

Lacure Enosan

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: _ | | Laurie Nossair | Date: April | 13, 2017 |
|---------------------|---------|----------------|----------------------------------------------|----------|
| | | | | |
| Firm Name: | Witt O' | Brien's, LLC | <u>. </u> | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 50 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 20 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 29 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 99 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point value; etc.) | | 1 |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

Laverie Enopair

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: Mcnue | Date: April 13, 2017 |
|-------------------------|----------------------|
| Firm Name: ATKINS | <u>.</u> |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE | |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|----|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | * | 36 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | | 15 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | X | 15 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 65 | |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point value; etc.) | | 3 | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

.

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

Committee Member: __ Date: April 13, 2017

Firm Name:

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE | |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|----|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | X | 24 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | L | 10 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 3 | vo |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 45 | |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point value; etc.) | | 5 |]. |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, secondranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

Committee Member: VY Canuel Jo Date: April 13, 2017

Firm Name: CP Strates, e orp

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE | |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|-----|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 1 | 3,0 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | B | VO |
| Price Proposal | 30 | X | 15 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 55 | |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point value) | alue; etc.) | 4 | |

* Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

Committee Member: Manuel Soto Date: April 13, 2017

Firm Name: Tetra Tech

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE | |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|----|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 3 | цi |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | | 17 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | X | 2 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 77 | |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * #1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point va | alue; etc.) | 2 | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

Committee Member: Vanue Soto Date: April 13, 2017

Firm Name: Witt O'Brien's

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE | |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|----|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 8 | 49 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | X | 19 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | ¥ | 15 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 9 | |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | alue; etc.) | | |

* Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: | Michael Carroll | Date: April 13, 2017 |
|-------------------|-----------------|----------------------|
| | | |
| | | |

Firm Name: Atkins North America, Inc.

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 4D |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 17 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 29 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 86 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | 3 | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

MWland

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee M | lember: | Michael Carroll | Date: April 13, 2017 |
|-------------|---------|-----------------------|----------------------|
| Firm Name: | David I | A. Shapiro Disaster P | lanning and Recovery |
| | Consult | tants, Inc. | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 38 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 14 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | mc mc |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 79 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | 4 | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

MWanol

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: | Michael Carroll | Date: April 13, 2017 |
|-------------------|-----------------|----------------------|
|-------------------|-----------------|----------------------|

Firm Name: **GP Strategies Corporation**

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 33 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 14 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 30 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 77 |
| ANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * 1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | alue; etc.) | 5 |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

MWland

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Men | nber: Michael Carroll | Date: April 13, 2017 |
|---------------|-----------------------|----------------------|
| | | |
| Firm Name: | etra Tech, Inc. | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 48 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 18 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 28 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 94 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | alue; etc.) | 2 |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

MWCand

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: | | Michael Ca | rroll | Date: Ar | oril 13, 201 | 7 |
|-------------------|---------|--------------|-------|----------|--------------|---|
| | | | | | | |
| Firm Name: | Witt O' | Brien's, LLC | | | | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 49 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 19 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 28 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 96 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | alue; etc.) | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

MWCanol

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member: | | William Spinelli | Date: April 13, |
|-------------------|-----------|------------------|-----------------|
| <u>2017</u> | | | |
| | At Kins | | |
| Firm Name: _ | 124 1/1/7 | | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 41 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 15 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 26 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 82 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | 3 | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee N 2017 | Member: | William Spinelli | Date: April 13, |
|---------------------|---------|------------------|-----------------|
| Firm Name: | 2ma | : | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 38 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 12 |
| Price Proposal | 22 | |
| TOTAL SCORE | 72 | |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point value) | 5 | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

If the

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee Member | : <u>William Spinelli</u> | Date: April 13, |
|------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|
| <u>2017</u> | | |
| | • | |
| Firm Name: | GP STRAtebies | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 33 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 11.5 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 28 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 72.5 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point value) | 4 | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

W M

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee 1 | Member: | William Spinelli | Date: April 13, |
|-------------|---------|------------------|-----------------|
| <u>2017</u> | | | |
| | . 10 | | |
| Firm Name: | TET | A TECH | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 46 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 17 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 25 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 8 8 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | alue; etc.) | 1 |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.

M

RFP17-0181 EXECUTIVE LEVEL DISASTER CONSULTING SERVICES

| Committee N | Леmber: | William Spi | nelli | Date: April 13, |
|-------------|---------|-------------|-------|---------------------|
| <u>2017</u> | | | | |
| | | | | |
| Firm Name: | With | o' Brien | | |

| RATING FACTORS | MAXIMUM POINTS | ITEM SCORE |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|---------------|
| References, Proposers Experience, Staff Experience, and Financial Stability | 50 | 44 |
| Strategic and Operating Plan | 20 | 18 |
| Price Proposal | 30 | 24 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 100 | 86 |
| RANKING BASED ON ABOVE POINTS * (#1 reflects the highest point value; #2 is the next highest point v | 2 | |

^{*} Each Advisory Committee member's top-ranked firm will be assigned one (1) point, second-ranked firm two (2) points and so on. After accumulating the members' scores, the Proposer with the lowest score shall be ranked first, the next lowest score shall be ranked second, and so on. In the event of a tie, the tied Proposers' total scores from each member will be added and compared. The Proposer with the highest point total will be ranked highest of the tied Proposers.