



HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES ▪ NOVEMBER 2, 2016

MEETING INFORMATION

Location

City Council Chambers

2nd Floor, City Hall
One City Commons
400 South Orange Avenue

Time

4:00 p.m.

Members Present

Jeffery Thompson, Chair
Alyssa Benitez, Vice-Chair
Lucie Ghioto
Mark Lewis
Scott Sidler
Dena Wild

Members Absent

Sean Lackey
Vijay Marolia

OPENING SESSION

- Determination of Quorum
- Pledge of Allegiance
- Introduction of Board Members and Staff

CONSIDERATION OF THE OCTOBER 5, 2016 MINUTES

Dena Wild MOVED to approve the Minutes of the October 5, 2016 meeting. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (6-0).

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2016-00246, 625 Palmer Street

Applicant/Owner: Danny Chopra, 625 Palmer Street, Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Cherokee Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a carport in similar materials to the existing structure.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. All materials shall be similar to existing materials on the house.

2. Case No.: HPB2016-00247, 1001 E. Central Blvd.

Applicant/Owner: Michael Simonds, 1001 E. Central Blvd.
District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a shed-style dormer on the North East corner of the house for an additional 343 sq. feet of living space. All exterior siding, trim, windows, and finishes to match existing.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. All siding trim and eave materials and details shall match existing.
3. Windows shall match existing and be installed to match the existing windows.

Scott Sidler declared a voting conflict with Case No: HPB2016-00247. Mr. Sidler filled out Form 8B and gave it to Recording Secretary to be recorded.

Mark Lewis MOVED to approve the Consent Agenda. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (6-0).

REGULAR AGENDA

3. Case No.: HPB2016-00250, 317 Tampa Avenue

Applicant/Owner: City of Orlando, 400 S. Orange Avenue, Orlando, FL 32802
District: Orlando Historic Landmark (Commission District 5)

A request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a Tinker Field History Plaza that will include a historic timeline, plaques, monuments, refurbished original stadium seats, Florida State Historical Marker and a gateway entrance.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Final material selection and paint and concrete stain colors will require additional review by the Minor Review Committee.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation. He reviewed the history of the site, most notably its designation on the National Register of Historic Places in May 2004 and as a local Historic Landmark in March 2015. He showed images from historic postcards and photographs to show the site through time to its current condition. Walter Hawkins, City of Orlando's Director of Urban Development briefed the Board on the public review process and timeline of public meetings. He stated that the first community meeting on September 1, 2015 was attended by over 80 people and the second community meeting on February 17, 2016 had over 50 attendees. Mr. Hawkins also acknowledged the Community Planning Committee that includes citizen representatives from faith based institutions, local residents, and the local business community that have been involved in the research and development of this proposal. The committee included: Sara Van Arsdel, Green & Associates; Shirley Bradley, Bunch Manor Homeowners Association; Pastor Rolous Frazier, Jr., St. John Missionary Baptist Church; Ted Haddock, The Edward E. Haddock Jr. Family Foundation; John Kaminiski, KIMBEESTUDIOS; Elizabeth Thompson, Well'sBuilt Museum of African American History; and Tony Williams, Tony's Downtown Barber Shop. Mr. Forbes reviewed the proposed renderings and invited the Board Members and the members of the public present to view the proposed timeline that was displayed at the meeting. The Tinker Field History Plaza will include the timeline, plaques, monuments, refurbished original stadium seats, gateway entrance arch, and a State Historical Marker. Mr. Forbes reviewed each of these proposed elements. Mr. Forbes introduced Ted Haddock, who led the research efforts for the plaques and timeline information. He provided a history of local baseball and the local Civil Rights movement and the role Tinker Field played in both. He also provided an overview of the 14 proposed plaques which includes plaques listing the Spring Training Home MLB Teams, a list of Orlando's Minor League champion teams, Joe Tinker and the Original Stadium, and several plaques about notable figures in Tinker Field's history. Mr. Haddock also stated that his research has confirmed over 175 National Baseball Hall of Famers who played at Tinker Field, which may be the record for any baseball field in America. These names are proposed to be etched into the hard surface of the plaza in the location of each player's position. Mr. Haddock cited his resources and research methodology which includes the Orlando Sentinel archives, Orange County Regional History Center, Orlando Library newspaper archive, the Giamatti Research Center in Cooperstown, NY, and local history books. Mr. Haddock thanked the many citizen participants, the Friends of Tinker Field Foundation, city staff, and Commissioner Hill for their contributions.

Pastor Jake Stoval, 2389 W. Church Street, Orlando, Florida 32803, spoke as a local resident. He expressed his initial concern of a parking lot use for Tinker Field. He would like to see the spot of Martin Luther King, Jr.'s, speech commemorated. He did not feel enough communication has been made between the research committee and the surrounding community.

Shirley Bradley, 2127 Monte Carlo Trail, Orlando, FL 32805, represented six homeowner associations around Tinker Field. She also opposes any parking lot use for the site. She shared several memories of going to Tinker Field with her children. She attended multiple meetings and commended Ted Haddock's efforts to encourage citizen participation.

Pamela Newton, 1321 Concord Street, Orlando, FL 32805, stated that her husband was a photographer for the Jackie Robinson Little League, which played at Tinker Field in the 1990s. She suggested incorporating images of the local little leagues that played at Tinker Field to the proposed timeline to encourage additional local connection to the display.

The Board discussed the proposed history plaza. Dena Wild commended the extensive research. Ms. Wild asked if additional items such as local pictures can be added to the display. Mr. Forbes said that information can be added and updated. Mr. Forbes also stressed that verifying historical accuracy and creditable sources is an important part of the planning process. Ms. Wild also inquired about seating. Mr. Forbes stated that any benches should not interfere with the visual display of the baseball diamond and the name etchings. Any seating should be proposed on the perimeter of the plaza. Jeffery Thompson discussed the need for landscaping, especially sabal palms, which historic images show were around this location. Mark Lewis stated that the historic stadium seats should be increased. Mr. Thompson stated that the seats are representative of the people who watched the games or listened to Martin Luther King's speech and they are an important piece of the story. Ted Haddock likes the idea of additional stadium seats however, there are space and budget constraints. The seats date to 1908 and need to be protected under shelter. Mr. Lewis suggested that the seats could be figuratively enhanced, possibly by photographic images. Mr. Lewis also suggested that the pavilions could be more representative of the original stadium. Scott Sidler inquired what was salvaged from the demolition of the Tinker Field stadium. Mr. Forbes stated that the gates and some seats. He also asked if the gates would be functional and Mr. Forbes confirmed that they will be. Ms. Wild suggested that the final plans should include seating and trash cans. Mr. Lewis asked if there was anything planned for the space beyond the gates. Mr. Forbes stated that the history plaza is part of a phase I plan, future phases have not been proposed at this time. It is the intention that the gates will remain open to the field. Mr. Sidler stated that this is a great start to commemorate the historic ballpark and is hopeful for future phases to further preserve the landmarked field.

Dena Wild moved to APPROVE the request subject to Staff Conditions with the additional Condition 3. Landscaping and seating shall be included in the final design. Scott Sidler SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (6-0).

4. Case No.: HPB2016-00248, 126 Kennison Drive

Applicant/Owner: Julie and Greg Edwards, 126 Kennison Drive, Orlando, FL, 32801
District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to expand the roof over the front east-facing porch; cover the existing outdoor patio; expand dormers on the north and south of the 2nd floor; and to add a paved circular drive.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Circular drive is not consistent with the historic district and does not meet code and shall not be approved.
3. New dormer windows shall be similar in type and have a similar pattern to other windows in the house.
4. Recommend retaining the distinctive, historic front terrace walls with the curved cap.

Richard Forbes introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included images from the Sanborn Map, roof plans, elevations, 3-D renderings, and site photos. He also showed a historic image of the house which shows that the original architecture was in the Spanish Bungalow style. At some point, prior to districting, the house was enlarged and the style was altered to a Colonial Revival style. The structure is a non-contributing structure. Mr. Forbes explained Staff Conditions and showed the Board the remaining historic features from the original Spanish Bungalow which his conditions recommended retaining.

The Board discussed the historic terrace walls and agreed that it should be required to retain the walls. Jeffery Thompson suggested that the curved transom above the front door would not be appropriate to the Colonial Revival style. Alyssa Benitez stated that in her opinion that this should not be an issue since there is already an eclectic mix of styles. Mr. Thompson also stated that the porch is a welcomed addition as it may hide some of the previous alterations.

Lucie Ghioto moved to APPROVE the request subject to Staff Conditions with the alteration to restate Condition 4. Require retaining the distinctive, historic front terrace walls with the curved cap. Dena Wild SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (6-0).

5. Case No.: HPB2016-00252, 5 Hill Avenue

Applicant/Owner: Minesh Patel, 5 Hill Avenue, Orlando, FL 32801

District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to approve a Variance of 5 ft to allow a new 2-story garage-apartment to be located 10 ft., from the rear lot line, where a 15-ft rear setback is required; and to allow a Design Variance to allow the garage apartment to project in front of the principal structure, where garage-apartments are required to be flushed or recessed from the principal structure.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal to be reviewed and approved by the HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included images of the site and site plans. He explained that this case has been before the Board and the Board of Zoning Adjustment before, however the applicant has allowed his variances and Certificates of Appropriateness to expire twice. The HPB has already approved the design and they are only reviewing the variance. Mr. Forbes clarified that since the last time this case has come before the HPB that the City Code has changed which now give the HPB purview of setback variances in Historic Districts.

The Board discussed the orientation of the house which is on a corner lot and the front façade faces the street side yard. Dena Wild stated that the proposal is visually acceptable though not technically allowable.

Lucie Ghioto moved to APPROVE the request subject to Staff Conditions. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (6-0).

OTHER BUSINESS

- There were no General Appearances
- Announcements
 - Mr. Forbes announced that the 2017 Historic Preservation Board Calendar will be presented to City Council on November 14. The HPB is encouraged to attend
 - Michael Arrington has resigned from the Board
 - The Marsh House in Lake Eola Park was adopted by City Council as an Orlando Historic Landmark on October 24th.
- Elections of Chair and Vice-Chair:
 - Jeffery Thompson NOMINATED Alyssa Benitez for Chairperson. The Nomination was voted on and passed by a Unanimous Voice Vote (6-0).
 - Dena Wild NOMINATED Lucie Ghioto for Vice-Chairperson. The Nomination was voted on and passed by a Unanimous Voice Vote (6-0).
- Report on Minor Reviews (October)

ADJOURNMENT

Jeffery Thompson, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:25 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Kyle Shephard, Assistant City Attorney
 Jason Burton, City Planning
 Frank Usina, Venues
 Walter Hawkins, Economic Development
 Craig Borkon, Venues

Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary
 Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
 Cindy Light, Communications & Neighborhood Relations
 Michele Brennan, Communications & Neighborhood Relations



Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer



Heather M. Bonds, Recording Secretary