



# APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD

## AGENDA

September 22, 2016

### OPENING SESSION:

- Chairman Jeffrey Bush called the meeting to order at 2:01 P.M.
- Christel Brooks, ARB Recording Secretary, conducted the Roll Call.
- Determination of a quorum was confirmed.
- Chairman Jeffrey Bush read the Welcome, General Rules of Order and the Appeals process.

### MEETING INFORMATION

#### Location:

Sustainability Conference  
Room  
2nd Floor, City Hall  
One City Commons  
400 South Orange Avenue

#### Time:

2:00p.m.

#### Board Members Present:

Jeffrey Bush, Chair  
Justin Ramb, Vice Chair  
Catherine Price  
Fulvio Romano  
John Paul Weesner

#### Board Member Absent:

Matt Taylor  
Greg Witherspoon

### MINUTES

A motion was made by John Paul Weesner and seconded by Catherine Price to approve the July 21, 2016 ARB Meeting Minutes. The motion carried unanimously 5-0.

### ANNOUNCEMENTS

There were no announcements.

### CONSENT AGENDA:

#### 1. 250 N. Orange Avenue – First Green Bank

Owner/Applicant:	Sentinel Capital North Orange LL/Danny Sharff
Location:	250 N. Orange Avenue
District:	5
Project Planner:	Ken Pelham

ARB2016-00053

Request for a Major  
Certificate of Appearance  
Approval for two (2) high rise  
and (2) wall signs for First  
Green Bank.

Recommended Action:  
with the following conditions:

Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request

1. The signs must be consistent with the design as proposed.
2. The high rise signs must not project more than 12" from the wall.
3. Any holes or blemishes left from the removal of previous signs must be patched and finished to match the surrounding wall finishes prior to installation of the new signs.

ARB approval does not constitute approval to fabricate and install the sign. All required building, sign, structural, and wind load requirements must be met and all appropriate building and sign permits must be obtained prior to installation of the signs.

## 2. 111 N. Orange Avenue – Nature's Table Sign

Owner/Applicant: G and I VIII/Guy Bennett  
Location: 111 N. Orange Avenue  
District: 5  
Project Planner: Ken Pelham

ARB2016-00055 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance  
Approval for a 96 sq ft sign for Nature's Table  
Cafe.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following conditions:

1. No other additional window signs may be installed in this set of windows while these signs remain.
2. ARB approval does not constitute approval of the permit nor approval to keep the signs. All required sign permits must be obtained in order to keep the signs.

A motion was made by John Paul Weesner and seconded by Catherine Price to approve the Consent Agenda as presented. The motion carried unanimously.

## REGULAR AGENDA:

### 1. 400 W. Livingston Street – AFP Marriott Hotel – Marriott Hotel

Owner/Applicant: AFP Marriott Hotel/Marriott Hotel  
Location: 400 W. Livingston Street  
District: 5  
Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2016-00057 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance  
Approval for a new 3 level parking garage and  
hotel rooftop bar.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following conditions:

1. Ground Level Elevation
  - a. Opaque Wall – A 36-inch tall opaque wall shall be added to the ground floor ~~perimeter of the parking garage, of the east façade of the parking garage~~ to provide security and shield headlight glare.
  - b. Garage Openings – Openings on the ground level of the parking garage shall be filled with a security grade architectural mesh.
2. Lighting
  - a. Photometrics – A photometric plan including light fixture specifications that meet the City of Orlando's lighting code shall be submitted with the building permit application.
  - b. Light fixtures – The maximum height of roof deck light fixtures shall be 15-feet.
  - c. Internal Lighting – Internal light fixtures shall be shielded to reduce glare and light

spill from the garage.

Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation that reviewed the aspects of the proposed project and the Staff conditions of approval.

Tim Lemons, architect and applicant, addressed the Board and requested that Condition 1A requiring 36-inch tall opaque wall at the ground level be removed from the conditions of approval. He stated the wall was not necessary for security purposes because there would be a security fence along the property line that would secure the garage area from the south. He also stated the opaque wall would add an unnecessary cost to the construction of the garage.

Board discussion ensued regarding the request.

A motion was made by Justin Ramb to approve the application and accept the staff conditions with the modification of removing Condition 1A, the opaque wall, from the conditions of approval. Fulvio Romano requested a friendly amendment to the motion to keep the opaque wall only on the ground floor east elevation of the parking garage. Justin Ramb accepted the friendly amendment. The motion was seconded by Catherine Price and the motion carried unanimously, 5-0.

## 2. 617 W. Central Blvd. – Tubbs Brewing

Owner/Applicant:	Ryan Young
Location:	121 S. Orange Avenue #820
District:	5
Project Planner:	Doug Metzger

ARB2016-00059	Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance for a façade renovation fencing/wall and outdoor entertainment area.
---------------	--

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following conditions:

### 1. Streetscape

#### A. Streetscape Design Guidelines

- i. All improvements in the streetscape zone including new driveway cuts are required to comply with the design and construction requirements of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines as they may be amended from time-to-time.
- ii. City Services Easement—For City maintenance purposes, a city services easement shall be provided by the applicant for any portion of the streetscape zone outside of the right-of-way.
- iii. Pedestrian Crossings—The pedestrian crossings at the proposed driveway cuts on W. Central and N. Terry Avenues shall be level and at the same grade as the sidewalk adjacent to the driveway. A pavement treatment that clearly defines the pedestrian zone shall be utilized. Reflective paint alone is not acceptable, but may be used in conjunction with pavers or other surfaces to outline the pedestrian path for night time safety.

## 2. Architecture

### A. Design Intent

- i. ARB Staff fully supports the architectural direction and theme of the Tubbs Brewing project.
- ii. Continued focus on the design and details at the base, through the middle and at the top of the building, including architectural lighting will continue to be critical.
- iii. Final architectural plans, elevations, materials and finishes shall be reviewed by ARB staff during the building permit process.

### B. General Architecture Comments

- i. W. Central Avenue Planters – The proposed planters along the W. Central façade, because of the lack of sufficient streetscape width, shall not be permitted to encroach into the W. Central right-of-way.
- ii. Entry Canopy – The bottom of the proposed entry canopy shall be a minimum of 12-feet above finished grade. The applicant will need to secure a right-of-way encroachment agreement with the City for any portion of the canopy that extends into the W. Central Ave. right-of-way.
- iii. Window Surrounds and W Beams – The proposed 10-inch projecting window surrounds and vertical “W” beams shall be permitted so long as the applicant can demonstrate that these features do not extend into the W. Central Ave. right-of-way.
- iv. Exterior Doors—A minimum 4”x6” security view panels shall be provided in all pedestrian accessible exterior doors including emergency exit doors to provide visibility and security for pedestrians exiting the building.
- v. Windows—A minimum of 15% transparency shall be provided on all floors facing the street. All glass at the ground level shall be clear. Minimum light transmittance shall be 80%. High performance or Low-e glass with a minimum transmittance of 60% may be considered as an alternative. No windows at the ground floor level shall be dry-walled or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance. Tinted, reflective, or spandrel glass does not count towards meeting the transparency requirements.
- vi. Outdoor Dining Area—Final detailing and layout of the proposed outdoor dining area will require an ARB Minor [staff] Review prior to issuance of a certificate of occupancy for the outdoor entertainment area. The ARB review shall include proposed site furniture, tables, chairs, planters, signage and any other proposed improvements.

### C. Perimeter Walls and Fencing

- i. Fence/Wall Height – Per the City’s Land Development Code [LDC] the maximum fence/wall height on the property shall be 6-feet.
- ii. Masonry/Corten Steel Wall – The proposed masonry/corten steel wall shall run the entire length of the W. Central and N. Terry Ave. project frontage. The wall shall be setback 2-feet from the back of the sidewalk along W. Central and N. Terry Ave. and shall be no more than six-feet tall. The proposed W. Central and N. Terry gates shall be no more than 10-feet tall.
- iii. Other Fencing – Any other fencing on the site shall be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as architectural mesh or aluminum-picket fencing. Chain link fencing is prohibited.

### D. Loading/Delivery Area

- i. Paving – The loading/delivery area shall, at a minimum, be paved with asphalt.
- ii. Separation – The loading and delivery area shall be clearly delineated and

separated from the outdoor entertainment area through the use of concrete vertical curbing or a concrete ribbon curb with bollards.

- iii. Dumpster Enclosure – The dumpster area shall be enclosed by masonry walls with decorative metal gates. The enclosure shall have a smooth stucco finish and shall be painted to match the color of the warehouse building.
  - iv. Final Site Plan – There are inconsistencies between the site plan and landscaping plan. Therefore the final site plan, hardscape/landscape plan, and civil engineering plans including all ground and roof mounted exterior mechanical equipment, stormwater and drainage plans, shall be submitted for an ARB Minor [Staff] Review prior to issuance of building permits for construction.
3. Lighting – A lighting plan compliant with the City's lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M.] including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures shall be submitted for ARB review and approval prior to issuance of building permits.

#### 4. Mechanical Equipment

- A. Venting & Exhaust—All potential venting and exhaust shall be directed to the roof of the building and shall not be visible from the public right-of-way. Exhaust venting is not permitted on any street facing building façade. All other venting and exhaust for mechanical equipment and other utilities shall be a minimum of 12 ft. above grade and shall be integrated with the building design so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the building. Exterior vent panels shall be painted to match the building façade color surrounding them.
- B. Transformer Area Screening—Transformer areas outside the building envelope shall be screened on three sides with decorative, opaque walls and a hedge that is 36-inches tall at the time of planting.
- C. Mechanical Equipment—All ground mounted and rooftop mechanical equipment shall be screened from view and meet the screening conditions of the Land Development Code. An interior screen wall or parapet for rooftop mechanical equipment shall be required. The interior screen wall or parapet shall be the same height as the installed mechanical equipment height.
- D. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventer[s] shall be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view where necessary. They shall be clearly identified on the final utilities plan.
- E. Final Elevations—The location and configuration of all exterior venting and mechanical equipment shall be depicted on the building elevations. Final building elevations with venting depicted shall be submitted for ARB Staff review prior to issuance of building permits.

#### 5. Signage

- A. Water Tower – Signage shall not be permitted on the water tower feature. However an artistic mural with no commercial messages may added to the water feature if approved by the Planning Official through a Determination and through an ARB Minor Review.
- B. Identity Signage – The signage as presented in this application is generally acceptable. However, prior to submittal of sign permits the applicant shall submit a Master Sign Plan for ARB Minor Review. The Master Sign Plan shall include the design, size, square footage and type of all proposed exterior signage for the building and the outdoor entertainment area.

6. ARB Approvals and Construction Observation

- A. ARB approval does not grant permission to begin or to construct any proposed improvements. All required building and engineering permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction.
- B. Prior to the commencement of construction the general contractor, developer and architect will schedule a coordination meeting with ARB Staff to review the ARB conditions of approval and the ARB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction.
- C. The general contractor shall schedule periodic meetings with the ARB Staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and any potential ARB compliance issues.
- D. Prior to final inspection ARB Staff shall review the project site for compliance with the ARB conditions of approval.

Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation that reviewed the aspects of the proposed project and the Staff conditions of approval.

Discussion ensued regarding the aspects of the project including the proposed design and height of the perimeter fence.

Justin Ramb stated that the application lacked sufficient consistency and information and that he was not sure the application was complete enough to vote on. John Paul Weesner Jeff Bush and Fulvio Romano concurred with Mr. Ramb's assessment.

A motion was made by Justin Ramb to defer the case to the next ARB Meeting. The motion was seconded by Fulvio Romano. The motion carried unanimously.

3. 500 S. Magnolia Avenue – GDC Magnolia – Magnolia Hotel Courtesy Review

Owner/Applicant:	GDC Magnolia/Rich Demarco
Location:	500 S. Magnolia Avenue
District:	5
Project Planner:	Doug Metzger

ARB2016-00054	Request for a Courtesy Review for construction of a new 10-story, 110 room hotel and restaurant.
---------------	--

Recommended Action:	Courtesy Review, no action required
---------------------	-------------------------------------

1. Downtown Appearance Review Board Approval

This project is located in the DDB/CRA Overlay District, which requires Appearance Review Board (ARB) approval for new construction projects. This project is required to receive a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval from the ARB prior to submittal of building permits for vertical construction.

2. Streetscape

A. Streetscape Design Guidelines

- i. All streetscape design and construction is required to comply with the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines as they may be amended from time-to-time.
- ii. City Services Easement—A city services easement shall be provided by the applicant for any portion of



the 15-foot streetscape zone along S. Anderson Street outside of the right-of-way and for any portion of the 11-foot streetscape zone along S. Magnolia.

- iii. Maintenance Agreement— The applicant shall enter into a maintenance and agreement with the City to define the maintenance and liability responsibilities for the streetscape zone on this project site.

B. General Streetscape Requirements:

- i. Street Lights – Double acorn 40-watt LED streetlights, consistent with the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines and spaced per OUC lighting requirements, shall be used on S. Anderson and S. Magnolia Ave. in the streetscape zone.
- ii. Curbing—All curbing for the project shall be Type F vertical curb with gutter pan.
- iii. Corner Treatments and Furniture Zone — A 6-inch thick concrete sub-base for the first 5-feet from back of curb shall be required in the corner treatments, accessibility ramps and streetscape furniture zone transitioning to a 4-inch thick concrete sub-base to the back of sidewalk. Corner treatments shall provide two directional accessibility ramps at each corner perpendicular to the centerline.
- iv. Valve and Junction Boxes—All at-grade vaults, junction, valve, control boxes and vaults in the streetscape zone shall be traffic bearing grade boxes and lids, painted per the downtown streetscape standards.
- v. Pedestrian Crossings—The pedestrian crossings at the motor court and service drive shall be level and at the same grade as the sidewalk adjacent to the driveway. A pavement treatment that contrasts with the vehicle lanes shall be used in order to clearly define the pedestrian zone. Reflective paint alone is not acceptable but may be used in conjunction with pavers or other surfaces to outline the pedestrian path for night time safety.
- vi. Building Entries—Building entries should face the street and be recessed, so the entry doors do not conflict or open directly into the pedestrian clear zone.
- vii. Pedestrian Clear Zone — In no instance shall vertical structures or obstructions be allowed in the required pedestrian clear zone.

C. S. Anderson St.

- i. Width—The streetscape zone width on S. Anderson Street shall be 15-feet from the back-of-curb. The furniture zone shall be a minimum of 5-feet wide and include double acorn street lights and under-story trees in decorative planters. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 8-feet wide and located in the arcade space between the building column and the face of the building. Because of the reduced pedestrian clear zone width, outdoor dining and sidewalk cafes shall not be permitted along the S. Anderson Street frontage.
- ii. Treatment 4 —The S. Anderson streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 4 in the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines. A 5-foot wide sidewalk grid with a 2-inch troweled edge and medium broom finish perpendicular to the centerline shall be installed from back-of-curb to the back-of-sidewalk or building face.

D. S. Magnolia Avenue

- i. Width—The streetscape zone width on S. Magnolia Avenue shall be a minimum of 10-feet from the back-of-curb. The furniture zone shall be a minimum of 4-feet wide and include double acorn street lights. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 6-feet wide. Because of the reduced pedestrian clear zone width, outdoor dining and sidewalk cafes shall not be permitted along the S. Magnolia Ave. frontage.
- ii. Treatment 4 —The S. Magnolia streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 4 in the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines. A 5-foot wide sidewalk grid with troweled edge and medium broom finish shall be installed from the back-of-curb to the back-of-sidewalk or building face.

3. Architecture

A. Design Intent

- i. ARB Staff supports the architectural direction and theme of the project. Continued focus on the design and details at the base, middle and skyline of the building including architectural lighting will continue to be critically important through the design and development process.
- ii. ARB Approval – Final architectural plans, elevations, materials and finishes shall be submitted for ARB

Final Review and approval prior to submittal for building permits.

B. General Architectural Comments

- i. Balconies, Canopies and Awnings — Balconies, canopies and awnings on the building may project into the city services easements. Canopies or awnings that project into the right-of-way will require Transportation Engineering approval. Balconies and canopies shall be no less than 17'-6" above finished grade to meet maintenance access requirements.
- ii. Exterior Doors—A minimum 4"x6" security view panels shall be provided in all pedestrian accessible exterior doors including emergency exit doors to provide visibility and security for pedestrians exiting the building.
- iii. Transparency – All ground floor building walls facing a street shall contain a minimum of 30% transparent materials or glass. A minimum of 15% transparency shall be provided on all other floors above the ground level. All glass at the ground level shall be clear. Minimum light transmittance shall be 80%. High performance or low-e glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%. No windows at the ground floor level shall be dry-walled or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance. Tinted, reflective, or spandrel glass does not count towards meeting the transparency requirements.
- iv. Skyline Architecture – The proposed rooftop architecture should provide a unique identity to the building within the Downtown skyline. Refinement of the skyline architecture should continue to be addressed during the final design process. Additional architectural fenestration or features should be considered. Special attention should also be paid to the lighting of the skyline architecture.
- v. South Elevation – Because of transparency limitations a public art display and artistic lighting should be architecturally integrated into the design of the south façade.
- vi. Service Area—Decorative doors or gates that are architecturally integrated with the building design shall be utilized at the loading area. The doors or gates shall be closed when the loading area is not in use.

4. Lighting

- A. A lighting plan compliant with the City's lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M.], including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures, shall be submitted for ARB review and approval prior to issuance of building permits.
- B. It is encouraged that the skyline architecture of the building be significantly lit in order to make the building unique in the night time skyline.
- C. Night time building elevations shall be submitted for ARB staff review prior to submittal of building permits.

5. Mechanical Equipment

- A. Venting & Exhaust—All restaurant venting and exhaust shall be directed to the roof of the building and shall not be visible from the public right-of-way. Restaurant venting is not permitted on any street facing façade of the building. All other vents and exhaust shall be a minimum of 12 ft. above grade and shall be integrated into the building design so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the building. Exterior vents shall be painted to match the color of the façade around them.
- B. Transformer Area Screening—Transformer areas outside the building envelope shall be screened with landscaping including a hedge that is 48-inches tall at the time of planting.
- C. Mechanical Equipment—All ground mounted and rooftop mechanical equipment shall be screened to the top of the equipment and meet the screening conditions of the Land Development Code. An interior screen wall or parapet for rooftop mechanical equipment may be required. The interior screen wall or parapet shall be the same height as the installed mechanical equipment height.
- D. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventer[s] shall be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view as necessary. They shall be clearly identified on the final utilities plan.
- E. Fencing—Any fencing on the site shall be an open, CPTED-approved fencing, such as architectural mesh or aluminum or wrought-iron picket fencing. Chain link fencing is prohibited.
- F. Electric Meters and Switch Boxes — Electric meters and switch boxes mounted to exterior walls shall not be located on street facing facades
- G. Final Elevations—The location and configuration of all exterior venting and mechanical equipment shall be



depicted on the building elevations. Final building elevations with venting depicted shall be submitted for ARB Staff review prior to submittal of building permits.

6. Signage

All signage shall meet the requirements of Chapter 64 of the Land Development Code [LDC]. High-rise signs are permitted consistent with Sec. 64.400, Downtown Special Sign District of the LDC, but will require an ARB Major Review prior to permitting. All other signage will require an ARB review prior to submittal for sign permits.

7. Telecommunications Equipment Screening

- A. Buildings should be designed to accommodate future placement of telecommunications equipment. Screening areas should be built into rooftop areas so that the placement and screening of the equipment does not become an afterthought.
- B. DAS — Distributed Antennae Systems [DAS] for life safety, police department and fire department localized communication services should to be integrated into the building architecture

8. ARB Construction Observation

- A. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction, the general contractor, developer and architect shall schedule a coordination meeting with ARB Staff to review the ARB conditions of approval and the ARB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction.
- B. The general contractor shall schedule periodic meetings with the ARB Staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the ARB conditions of approval.
- C. Prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy ARB Staff shall review the project site for compliance with the ARB conditions of approval.

9. Model

Prior to permitting, a physical 1"= 100' scale model of the project should be provided for the DDB/CRA model located in the Downtown Information Center.

Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation outlining the project. Rich Demarco, the applicant also discussed the initial project features and concepts. The Board complimented Mr. Rich Demarco on the design of the project.

This was a Courtesy Review and therefore no action was taken by the Board.

## NEW BUSINESS:

1. Conversations in Inclusiveness Training - This year Mayor Dyer invited ALL City board members to participate in a Conversations in Inclusiveness training similar to the one that our City staff did this year. The City Clerk's office has arranged five sessions in two different weeks with the hopes that all City Board members will be able to participate. For many of our citizens, our City boards are their first point of contact so we think it is important that our board members have the same training that our staff had.

## OTHER BUSINESS:

ARB Minor Reviews completed since the July ARB Meeting:

- 1. ARB2016 – 00041 – 486 N. Orange Avenue – Crescent Central Station – Planet Smoothie Sign
- 2. ARB2016 – 00042 – 400 W. Livingston Street – Marriott Hotel – Exterior landscaping and painting
- 3. ARB2016 – 00043 – 420 E. Church Street – Artwork Panels

4. ARB2016 - 00044 - 486 N. Orange Avenue - Greenbeat Sign
5. ARB2016 - 00045 - 529 N. Magnolia Avenue - Fence
6. ARB2016 - 00046 - 519 N. Magnolia Avenue - Fence
7. ARB2016 - 00049 - 486 N. Orange Avenue - Crescent Central Station - Elegant Tailor Sign
8. ARB2016 - 00050 - 822 W. Central Blvd. - Reroof and rooftop equipment
9. ARB2016 - 00051 - 486 N. Orange Avenue - Crescent Central Station - Envy Nails Sign
10. ARB2016 - 00060 - 617 N. Magnolia Avenue - Wall Sign

### OLD BUSINESS:

Doug Metzger gave a Soccer Stadium Appeal Update.

**ADJOURNMENT:** THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:54 PM.

**NEXT MEETING:** THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, OCTOBER 20, 2016 AT 2:00 PM.

### STAFF PRESENT:

Melissa Clarke, Assistant City Attorney II  
Walter Hawkins, Acting Executive Secretary  
Doug Metzger, City Planning  
Terrance Miller, City Planning  
Christel Brooks, Board Secretary

Kenneth Pelham, City Planning  
Shannen Stegman, City Planning  
Jason Burton, City Planning  
Richard Forbes, City Planning

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
WALTER HAWKINS, ACTING EXECUTIVE SECRETARY  
\_\_\_\_\_  
CHRISTEL BROOKS, BOARD SECRETARY