



HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES ▪ SEPTEMBER 7, 2016

MEETING INFORMATION

Location

City Council Chambers
2nd Floor, City Hall
One City Commons
400 South Orange Avenue

Time

4:00 p.m.

Members Present

Jeffery Thompson, Chairperson
Alyssa Benitez, Vice-Chairperson
Sean Lackey
Mark Lewis
Vijay Marolia
Scott Sidler
Dena Wild

Members Absent

Michael Arrington
Lucie Ghioto

OPENING SESSION

- Jeffery Thompson, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.
- Determination of Quorum. Pledge of Allegiance. Introduction of Board Members and Staff

CONSIDERATION OF THE AUGUST 3, 2016 MINUTES

Alyssa Benitez MOVED to approve the Minutes of the August 3, 2016 meeting. Mark Lewis SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (7-0).

REGULAR AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2016-00181, 1216 E. Ridgewood Street

Applicant/Owner: Joseph Neal, 1216 E. Ridgewood Street, Orlando, FL 32803
District: Colonialtown South Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new detached two-story garage apartment with 576 s.f. of living space.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Increase depth of eaves to match house and use a similar eave detail.
3. Use a hip roof similar to main house.
4. Ganged windows shall have an 8 inch mullion between them to be more similar to historic ganged windows.
5. Windows shall have similar trim and installation depth to main house and be consistent on both first and second floor.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included images of the site including the driveway and rear yard, a site survey, proposed elevations, and the proposed site plans.

Chairman Jeffery Thompson inquired if there was rear elevation and fenestration requirements. Mr. Forbes clarified that the non-visible alterations are not reviewed in the Colonialtown South Historic District. Sean Lackey asked about the eave positions, which Mr. Forbes reiterated Staff Condition 2.

Joseph Neal, 1216 E. Ridgewood St., Orlando, Florida, 32803 spoke as the applicant/owner and requests a gable style roof as proposed in the elevations not a hip roof to provide a cathedral style interior ceiling. The gable will be consistent to the front porch on the existing structure.

The Board discussed the site plan, location of the proposed garage apartment, rear neighbors, roof pitch, and the roof style options. The lot currently has several mature trees and backs up to commercial property. The consensus of the Board was that the roof of the garage apartment will be minimally visible from the street.

Scott Sidler moved to APPROVE the request subject to Staff Conditions with the modification of Staff Condition 3. The roof shall have a gable roof to match the pitch of the front porch of the existing structure. Dena Wild SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (7-0).

2. Case No.: HPB2016-00146, 3206 Greens Avenue*

Applicant/Owner: Carl "Sandy" Dann, III, 3206 Greens Avenue, Orlando, FL 32804

District: Commission District 3

A request to consider Orlando Historic Landmark Status for the structure located at 3206 Greens Avenue, historically known as the Carl Dann House.

Recommended Action: Approval of the Orlando Historic Landmark status request as Staff finds that the structure meets criteria A, B and C of section 65.720

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the property with a PowerPoint presentation that included images of the exterior and interior of the house, as well as, historic images. Mr. Forbes explained the Criteria of Orlando Historic Landmarks is similar to the criteria for nominations to the National Register of Historic Places. The Carl Dann House meets criteria A,B, and C and Mr. Forbes went in depth about how the property meets each of the those criteria. The Dann House is named for Carl Dann, one of Orlando's most prominent real estate developers and promoters of Orlando's elite neighborhoods during the first quarter of the 20th century. Additionally, Carl Dann, Jr. managed Dubsdread and was a five-time winner of the Florida Amateur Golf Championship. The Frame Vernacular residence was designed by artist, builder, and decorator Sam Stoltz. His architectural work and artwork can be seen throughout Orlando. Sam Stoltz designed the house in 1935, as well as, an addition in 1941. This addition was built to comply with a request by the government asking private citizens to supply living quarters for servicemen station in Orlando during World War II. The house has had other sensitive additions added throughout the years, but has been maintained and is currently owned by Carl Dann, III, grandson of Carl Dann, Sr.

There were no comments from the public. The Board concurred that the private residence is historically significant and commended Mr. Dann for his dedication to preserve his family's home.

Alyssa Benitez moved to APPROVE the request of Orlando Historic Landmark Status. Vijay Marolia SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (7-0).

Chairperson Thompson stated that a request had made by the applicant of Case 5 prior to the meeting to move the Agenda Item up due to a scheduling conflict. Chairperson Thompson asked the Board if they would allow the change in the Agenda. Dena Wild MOVED to move Agenda Item 5 to the third item. Scott Sidler Seconded the Move. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (7-0).

5. Case No.: HPB2016-00199, 24 N. Rosalind Avenue

Applicant: Fr. John Hamatie, 24 N. Rosalind Ave., Orlando, FL 32803

Owner: St. George Orthodox Church, Inc., 24 N. Rosalind Ave, Orlando, FL 32803

District: Orlando Historic Landmark (Commission District 5)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to paint a black metal fence in front of the property white with gold tips.

Recommended Action: Denial of request; however, Staff recommends approval of a dark black or similar color for the fence, however, as a compromise, a color that is a stone color that will be more similar to the façade of the building might be approved.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included images of the historic landmark and the Sanborn map. The site had been code enforced for a fence that was taller than code allowed and for installing the fence on City owned sidewalks. Minor Review reviewed and approved a black metal fence with gold tips that met code. The applicant then requested to paint the fence white with gold tips. Minor Review denied the color change and the applicant has appealed to the full HPB as a Major Review.

Mr. Thompson asked how the fence will be different from the fence that was code enforced; Mr. Forbes stated that the color will be changed and the height will be lowered to meet City Code requirements. Bright white is not a historically accurate color, however a stone-color could be approved that would match the building. Historically accurate colors would be black or a darker shade such as dark green.

Father John Hamate, 2001 Dyan Way, Maitland, FL, 32781, spoke as the applicant. He stated that the fence does not need to be a bright white however, the aim of the church is to replicate the colors of the Temple of Solomon, which has a gold and white scheme.

The Board discussed the proposed color, current color schemes of the building, and historically appropriate colors. The religious connection may be lost and the Board discussed that their duty is to approve the most historically appropriate option.

Dena Wild moved to DENY the Applicant's Request. Vijay Marolia SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (7-0).

3. Case No.: HPB2016-00183, 601 E. Ridgewood Street

Applicant: 331 Cathcart, LLC, 728 Hardman Drive, Orlando, FL 32806
Owner: Mark Kinchla, 728 Hardman Drive, Orlando, FL 32806
District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to install a driveway for an accessible parking space on Cathcart Avenue.

Recommended Action: Denial of request; however, if the Board approves the Request, Staff recommends the following conditions:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Driveway is an accommodation and should only be permitted as long as necessary to provide accessibility for the unit.
3. Letter of Determination may apply to allow driveway to be a temporary use.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included the proposed site plans, site images, and the new platted units. He provided a brief case history and reminded the Board that this site won a Historic Preservation Rehabilitation Award earlier this year. This case is for the western-end unit of the building. Two schemes are proposed for a new driveway accommodation; one showing the driveway coming in on a curve and the other a straight-in driveway. Mr. Forbes explained his recommendation of denial is recommended because the request is not consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Dena Wild asked how the proposal is not in keeping with the Code and Standards. Mr. Forbes explained that the church would not historically have a driveway or parking spaces in front of the primary façade. Ms. Wild also asked what materials are proposed to build a temporary driveway; Mr. Forbes stated that a material has not been proposed. The Board asked about transportation issues, which are not in the HPB's purview. The Board also discussed how this unit is a corner unit and if parking on the Ridgewood Street access would be available. They discussed the temporary nature of the proposal and how to enforce the temporary use if granted.

Mark Kinchla, 728 Hardman Drive, Orlando, FL, 32806, spoke as the owner and applicant. Mr. Kinchla explained that he represents a potential buyer who is disabled. She is currently enrolled in the Project Walk program. It is their hope that she will gain the ability to walk again and that the driveway will not be needed in the future. He explained that due to the length of her van, they are unable to utilize the driveway on Ridgewood Street.

Gary Magarian, 808 E. Harwood Street, Orlando, FL 32803, is a neighbor and spoke in opposition of the request. He stated that it may cause visual dangers backing in and out so close to the St. James School. The driveway will also lessen the pervious surfaces. Granting this request may also set a bad precedence for parking commercial vans in the historic district.

Raymond Cox, 600 E. Amelia Street, Orlando, Florida, 32803, is a neighbor and spoke in opposition of the request. He stated that transportation has always been an issue for this busy intersection and that the property already has five driveways with garages.

Kelly Whelan, 601 E. Ridgewood Street, Orlando, FL 32803, spoke as the potential buyer and in support of the proposal. She explained that her van is customized for her disability and includes a restroom in the van, as she cannot independently use public restrooms. She stated that she is 6'2 when standing, which is required when she gets in and out of the van, which is why a smaller van can't accommodate her.

Anne Pellegrino, 3076 Bay Tree Drive, Orlando, Florida 32806, spoke in favor of the request and as an administrator at the St. James Cathedral School. She stated that Mark Kinchla has worked with the school and has kept them informed throughout the project. He also ensured that no loud pressure-washing or sand-blasting work was done during the school's outdoor playtime or naptimes. She stated that she did not foresee an issue with the additional parking space.

Jeremy Mazza, 172 Grace Blvd, Altamonte Springs, 32714, spoke in favor of the request and discussed ADA requirements.

Chairman Thompson read a letter from the St. James Cathedral School into the record. The letter confirmed that the school will abide by ADA parking requirements and acknowledged the possible parking space in consideration for their arrival and dismissal procedures.

The Board discussed their purview to consider historical accuracy and not focus on the transportation and ADA requirements. They discussed designation of handicap street parking, sensitive needs of the applicant, and weighed the two schemes. The Board further discussed the adaptive reuse nature of the project and that structure is no longer a church, though it is still in the form of the historic church. The property already has five driveways that were not there historically. Mr. Thompson stated that this is the primary façade and that the Board allowed concessions to allow the driveways on the secondary façade to save the building from demolition. There are no churches within the Lake Eola Heights Historic District that have parking in the front of the building. Finding a pervious temporary material, if the driveway is allowed, would be preferred and the Board discussed stamped concrete, pervious concrete, or Chicago brick. Mark Lewis stated that he is not opposed to the parking space as it is being presented as a temporary parking space and does not want to put Ms. Whelan in danger by requiring her to park on a street.

Sean Lackey left the meeting at 5:45.

The Board discussed ways to construct a driveway with less visual impact, such as an appearance of a courtyard. The two schemes as presented are not ideal and a different material or design may be considered. The Board also discussed deferring the case until Transportation has given a definitive decision on the parking space meeting other City Codes.

Mark Lewis moved to APPROVE the Request using Scheme 2. subject to Staff Conditions. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED the Motion. Jeffery Thompson requested the Additional Conditions 4.) The existing concrete shall be removed and all new paving shall resemble a courtyard and not a parking spot. 5.) All new materials must reviewed by Minor Review Committee and that a temporary or pervious material be considered. Vijay Marolia SECONDED the Amendment. The Amendment was Voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (6-0). The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Voice Vote (5-1; Thompson voted nay).

4. Case No.: HPB2016-00184, 1517 E. Washington Street

Applicant/Owner: David Calcanis, 2014 Delaney Ave, Orlando, FL 32806
District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to replace seven historic windows on the south and east façade of the house with vinyl windows.

Recommended Action: Denial of the request.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included images of the replacement windows, the house, and a diagram to show which windows were originally requested to be replaced. Mr. Forbes explained that this case went before the Minor Review Committee to replace non-highly visible windows, which were approved. The applicant came back to replace the visible historic windows and that request was denied. Replacing the windows does meet the code standards.

Jeffery Thompson asked if the replacement windows requested will have the muntins between the glass. Mr. Forbes clarified that the replacement windows, as shown, were not the windows that were approved by Minor Review, which had approved exterior muntins on the replacement windows.

David Calcanis, 1517 E. Washington Street, Orlando, FL 32806, is the applicant and owner. He purchased the home in 2013 and was not aware that it was in a Historic District. He stated that the problem lays in the short 3-inch overhang. He had worked with CCS Restoration to restore seven windows. He stated that the restoration was not effective and that the windows swelled up, which is a safety concern.

Vijay Marolia left the meeting at 6:20 p.m.

Scott Sidler asked the applicant if the windows and sashes are currently out and if the replacements were inserted to different openings. Mr. Calcanis stated that each window and sash is numbered to ensure that they were to be inserted to their original openings.

Chairman Thompson read two letters into the record:

- Ross and Theodora Gordon, 1519 E. Washington Street, Orlando, FL 32801, in support of the request
- Steve Boe, 1513 E. Central Blvd., Orlando, FL 32801, in opposition to the request

Mr. Sidler said that he has personally inspected the windows and confirmed that they were in rough shape, however, he said they are in average shape for their age and could be restored with proper treatments. Dena Wild asked the applicant if the restored windows were operable; Mr. Calcanis stated that they are not fully operable and can not be opened without prying. Mr. Sidler asked the applicant if CCS Restoration only restored the windows or the entire window system; Mr. Calcanis stated that they only restored the windows and not the sash system, which Mr. Calcanis completed himself. Mark Lewis stated that when windows are damaged due to rain that there are usually other circumstances that need to be addressed. Mr. Thompson stated that by the Standards the HPB are charged with, the code is very clear that the windows should either be repaired or new wood windows should be installed.

Scott Sidler moved to Deny the Request. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED the Motion.

Dena Wild asked if there were any contemporary affordable options. Mr. Forbes referred to the Staff Report which stated that new wood windows with divided lights may be proposed when the existing windows can not be repaired..

The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Voice Vote (4-1; Wild voted nay).

OTHER BUSINESS

- General Appearances
- Announcements
- Report on Minor Reviews (August)

ADJOURNMENT

Jeffery Thompson, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 6:30 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Alison Brackins, Assistant City Attorney
Brian Ford, City Planning

Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Office

A blue ink handwritten signature, appearing to be 'R. Forbes', written over a horizontal line.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer

A blue ink handwritten signature, appearing to be 'Heather M. Bonds', written over a horizontal line.

Heather M. Bonds, Recording Secretary