

APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD

MEETING MINUTES

June 16,2016

OPENING SESSION:

- Chairman Jeffrey Bush called the meeting to order at 2:00 P.M.
- Shaniqua Rose, ARB Recording Secretary, conducted the Roll Call.
- Determination of a quorum was confirmed.
- Chairman Jeffrey Bush read the Welcome, General Rules of Order and the Appeals process.

MINUTES

A motion was made by John Paul Weesner and seconded by Catherine Price to approve the May 11, 2016 ARB Meeting Minutes. The motion carried unanimously 5-0.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

• There were no announcements.

CONSENT AGENDA:

1. 501 W. Church Street - Webster University

Owner/Applicant: Pavilion Orlando LLC/Brad Sokoly

Location: 501 W. Church Street

District: 5

Project Planner: Ken Pelham

ARB2016-00032 Request for a Major Certificate of

Appearance Approval for a 51 sq ft illuminated channel letter sign.

- 1. The sign must not project more than 12" from the wall.
- 2. The raceway must be painted to match the wall.
- 3. Reduce the height of the sign letters and place in the same scheme as the existing Hughes Supply sign on the corner, centered vertically between the windows below and the bottom of the scored panel beneath the windows above. The ends of the sign should begin and end at logical façade points, such as in line with window openings, column corners, or score lines.
- 4. Any holes or blemishes left from the removal of previous signs must be patched and finished to match the surrounding wall finishes prior to installation of the new signs.
- 5. ARB approval does not constitute approval to fabricate and install the sign. All required building, sign, structural, and wind load requirements must be met and all appropriate building and sign permits must be obtained prior to installation of the signs.

MEETING INFORMATION

Location:

Sustainability Conference Room 2nd Floor, City Hall One City Commons 400 South Orange Avenue

Time:

2:00p.m.

Board Members Present:

Jeffrey Bush, Chair

Justin Ramb, Vice Chair

Catherine Price

John Paul Weesner

Matt Taylor

Board Member Absent:

Fulvio Romano

Greg Witherspoon

2. 532 W. Church Street - Styles of Life II

Owner/Applicant: Trevor Myers/Lisa Colon Location: 532 W. Church Street

District:

Project Planner: Ken Pelham

ARB2016-00034 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for a

48 sq ft electrical sign.

- 1. Change the color of the "II" for contrast with the brick, or reduce its height so that it fits entirely within the panel with wall space above and below
- 2. The raceways must be painted to match the wall.
- 3. Any holes or blemishes left from the removal of previous signs must be patched and finished to match the surrounding wall finishes prior to installation of the new signs.
- 3. ARB approval does not constitute approval of the sign. Although the sign has been installed, all required building, sign, structural, and wind load requirements must be met and all appropriate building and sign permits must be obtained after the fact.

Ken explained that the Webster University applicant was reducing the signage to 44 sq ft.

A motion was made by Matt Taylor and seconded by John Paul Weesner to approve the Consent Agenda based on the conditions in the staff report. The motion carried unanimously 5-0.

REGULAR AGENDA:

1. 100 E. Pine Street

Owner/Applicant: Steven Denholtz/April Anderson

Location: 100 E. Pine Street

District: 5

Project Planner: Ken Pelham

ARB2016-00027 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for a

canopy replacement, painting, door replacement and lighting

additions.

- 1. The art appliqués must not be representative of any business, service, or product. Images representative of such becomes signage and must be reviewed and approved separately. The five images as proposed are acceptable.
- 2. The art appliqués are approved only for the vertical windows in the east portion of the north façade as proposed.
- 3. Signs are not included in this review, and must be reviewed separately if proposed.
- 4. Uplighting must be specifically directed to minimize glare and light spill. Fixtures must include shields or hoods. Uplighting of any glass canopies will not be permitted. LED lighting is preferred, and may be programmed for color changes but not animations.
- 5. Any holes or blemishes left from the removal of awnings or other features shall be patched and finished to match the surrounding wall finishes prior to installation of the new features.
- 6. ARB approval does not constitute a building permit. All required building, structural, and wind load

requirements shall be met and all appropriate building permits shall be obtained prior to commencement of work.

Ken Pelham gave a PowerPoint presentation explaining the proposed changes to the site. The Board thanked Mr. Pelham for his presentation.

Discussion ensued regarding the appliqué color, purpose of the awning removal, roof element treatment and the recessed entrances.

A motion was made by Matt Taylor and seconded by Catherine Price to approve the item based on staff conditions as presented. The motion carried unanimously 5-0.

2. 655 W. Church Street - Orlando Sports Holding LLC - Orlando Soccer Stadium

Owner/Applicant: Orlando Sports Holding LLC/Bruce Beahm

Location: 655 W. Church Street

District: 5

Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2016-00028 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval

for a Master Sign Plan for the Orlando Soccer Stadium.

- 1. Font and sign style: All general wayfinding and ancillary signs shall be of the same font and style as presented in the application. All conduit of the signs shall be either hidden or match the color of the adjacent structure. Minor adjustments to allow for larger gate sign identification letters on the monument signs to be visible along the street shall be reviewed as an Minor ARB review.
- 2. Monument Signs: The monument signs shall be installed perpendicular to the curb of the street.
- **3. Design:** Any changes in materials from those presented in the final application shall be reviewed as an ARB Minor Review for consistency with the design intent. If the changes are determined to be significant, they may be required to be reviewed by the ARB as a Major Review.
- **4. Sponsorship Signs:** When the Stadium Name and sponsors have been established, an ARB Minor review shall be conducted prior to permits being issued, to verify that the sign location, size, and details are consistent with the Master Sign Plan.
- **5. Digital Signs:** Digital signs shall be attached to the structure of the scoreboards, by using similar materials and finishes so that they are integrated to the greatest extent possible to the overall design and finishes of the rest of the score board.

Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation explaining the proposed signs for the Orlando Soccer Stadium. The Board thanked Mr. Metzger for his presentation.

Discussion ensued regarding the font style, font size and signage message, the channel letter high-rise signs and the content for the Parramore Heritage display areas.

Mr. Hawkins explained that the Parramore Task Force has been actively meeting to discuss the Parramore Heritage display areas of the Soccer Stadium.

A motion was made by Justin Ramb and seconded by John Paul Weesner Price to approve the item based on staff conditions as presented. The motion carried unanimously 5-0.

3. 514 E. Church Street (520) - Thornton Commons LLC - 520 East Church Street

Owner/Applicant: Thornton Commons LLC/Wayne Dunkelberger

Location: 514 E. Church Street

District:

Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2015-00043 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance

Approval for a new construction of a 364 units,

6,520 sf retail and 630 parking spaces.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following

conditions:

1. Streetscape

A. Streetscape Design Guidelines

- i. All streetscape design and construction is required to comply with the design and construction requirements of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines and the conditions in this staff report.
- ii. Maintenance Agreement—The applicant shall enter into a maintenance agreement with the City to define maintenance responsibilities for the streetscape zone and any proposed outdoor dining areas.
- iii. City Services Easement—A city services easement shall be provided by the applicant for any portion of the 15-foot streetscape zone outside of the right-of-way.

B. General Streetscape Requirements:

- i. Street Trees High rise live oaks trees shall be planted as the primary street tree in the planter islands and parkway strip. Sylvester Palms may be used as accent trees at the building entrances.
- ii. Structural Soil To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas, structural soil or a Planning Official approved equivalent shall be installed around all canopy street trees consistent with Detail 3.4-O and 3.4-P of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Guidelines.
- iii. Street Lights Double acorn LED streetlights, consistent with the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines shall be used on all streets and spaced based on OUC lighting requirements.
- iv. Corner Treatments—The corner treatment at all corners shall be Lawrenceville Brick, with a 6-inch thick concrete sub-base for the first 6-feet from back of curb and all ADA ramps transitioning to a 4-inch thick concrete sub-base to the face of building. Corner treatments shall provide two accessibility ramps at each corner perpendicular to the centerline.
- v. Valve and Junction Boxes—All at grade junction, valve and control boxes in the streetscape zone shall be traffic bearing grade boxes and lids. Box lids must be painted a color that matches the adjacent streetscape material.
- vi. Pedestrian Crossings—The pedestrian crossings at the garage and service area entries shall be raised to be at same grade as the sidewalk adjacent to the driveway. A pavement treatment a minimum of 7-feet wide that contrasts with the vehicle lanes shall be used in order to clearly define the pedestrian area. Reflective paint alone is not acceptable, however may be used in conjunction with pavers or other surfaces to outline the pedestrian path for night time safety. Slope transitions to the street shall occur between the sidewalk and edge of pavement. The mid-block curb cuts into the garage and service areas shall meet the mid-block curb cut standard in the Downtown Streetscape Guidelines
- vii. Building Entries—Building entries must face the street and be recessed. Doors should not open directly into the pedestrian clear zone.
- viii. Curb Cuts—All existing curb cuts shall be removed and the streetscape and curbing restored during construction.

C. Outdoor Dining Areas/Sidewalk Cafes

- i. Outdoor dining areas and sidewalk cafes are permitted on streets with a minimum 10-foot wide pedestrian clear zone.
- ii. Outdoor dining areas and sidewalk cafes shall maintain a minimum 5-foot wide pedestrian clear between the planting strip or furniture zone and the stanchion base of the outdoor dining area.
- iii. Outdoor dining areas and sidewalk cafes shall comply with all the regulations of Sec. 54-28 of the City Code.
- iv. Outdoor dining areas that utilize a portion of the right-of-way must obtain a sidewalk café permit.

D. E. Church Street

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on E. Church Street shall be 15-feet from the back-of-curb of the on-street parking spaces. The parkway strip shall be a minimum of 5-feet wide [7-feet shown in current plans] along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 10-feet in width [8.5-feet shown in current plans]. High-rise live oak trees must be planted in the bump-outs between the on-street parking spaces.
- ii. Treatment 5 —The E. Church Street streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the streetscape design guidelines.

E. S. Eola Drive

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on S. Eola Drive shall be 15-feet from the back-of-curb of the on-street parking spaces. The parkway strip shall be a minimum of 5-feet wide [7-feet wide in current plans] along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 10-feet in width [7.5-feet shown in proposed plans]. High-rise live oak trees must be planted in the bump-outs between the on-street parking spaces.
- ii. Treatment 5 The S. Eola Drive streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the streetscape design guidelines.

F. Mariposa Street [north side]

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on the north side of Mariposa Street shall be <u>13</u>40-feet from the back-of-curb. The parkway strip shall be a minimum of <u>7</u>5-feet wide along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 65-feet in width.
- ii. Treatment 5 The north side of the Mariposa Street streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the streetscape design guidelines.
- iii. Street Trees—The street trees on the northside of Mariposa Street shall be Sylvester Palms.

I. S. Osceola Avenue

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on S. Osceola Avenue shall be 15-feet from the back-of-curb. The parkway strip shall be a minimum of 7-feet wide along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 8-feet in width. This width should provide additional area for landscaping adjacent to the S. Osceola parking garage frontage on the south side of the subject property.
- ii. Treatment 5 The north side of the Mariposa Street streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the streetscape design guidelines.
- iii. Street Trees—The street trees on S. Osceola Avenue shall be high-rise live oak trees.

2. Architecture

- A. Skyline Architecture A distinctive and signature architectural treatment shall be incorporated into the roof line at the significant corners of the project, the corner of E. Church Street and S. Osceola Avenue and also at the corner of E. Church Street and S. Eola Drive. The skyline element shall be submitted to ARB Staff for review and approval prior to issuance of building permits.
- B. Windows—The windows on all facades shall be recessed from the façade to provide additional design, texture and shadow lines to the building façade. The addition of window sills or trim treatments is also recommended.

C. Permit Elevations — Color building elevations and black and white perspective massing illustrations shall be included in the building permit package to ensure consistency with the ARB approval.

D. E. Church St. Façade

- i. The wood ceramic tile at the mid-point of the north façade shall be extended up the building façade to the top of the parapet in order to separate the mass of the east and west side of the Church St. facade.
- ii. A dark gray trim band between the first and second floor shall be extended horizontally across the building façade to provide an architectural transition between the ground floor architectural masonry and the stucco material above.

E. Mariposa Facade

- i. Elevation—The wood ceramic tile shall be added at the mid-point of the south façade above the amenity deck and shall be extended up the building façade to the top of the parapet in order to separate the mass of the east and west facades.
- ii. A dark gray trim band between the first and second floor shall be extended horizontally across the building façade to provide an architectural transition between the ground floor architectural masonry and the stucco material above.
- iii. Garage Openings—The metal mesh and frames proposed for the parking garage openings shall be inset into the opening like windows. The finish of the frames shall match the mullion system of the residential windows.
- iv. Garage Door—The parking garage door shall be decorative in nature. A standard roll-up door is not acceptable. The final door design shall be submitted to ARB Staff for review and approval prior to issuance of building permits.
- v. Screening—The parking garage shall be designed to minimize direct views of parked vehicles from streets and sidewalks. An opaque minimum 36-inch tall wall shall be installed to avoid headlight and spill-over light glare. Noise and exhaust fumes onto public use areas or adjacent properties shall be mitigated. Lighting that may be potentially visible from the garage shall be shielded.
- vi. Pedestrian Connection—A minimum 5 ft. pedestrian walkway shall be provided adjacent to the driveway entries into the parking garage.
- vii. Ramping—Angled exterior ramping shall not be visible from the right-of-way and shall be obscured from view through the use of exterior metal screening, or other alternative methods. Interior ramping and walls that might be visible thru the garage openings shall be painted a dark gray or black.
- F. S. Eola Street Façade A dark gray trim band between the first and second floor shall be extended horizontally across the building façade to provide an architectural transition between the ground floor architectural masonry and the stucco material above.

G. S. Osceola Street Facade —

- i. A dark gray trim band between the first and second floor shall be extended horizontally across the building façade to provide an architectural transition between the ground floor architectural masonry and the stucco material above.
- ii. Garage Door—The parking garage door shall be decorative in nature. A standard roll-up door is not acceptable. The final door design shall be submitted to ARB Staff for review and approval prior to issuance of building permits.

- H. Transparency
- i. The ground floor building walls facing all streets shall contain a minimum of 30% of transparent materials. A minimum of 15% transparency shall be provided on all other floors facing the street above the ground level.
- ii. All glass at the ground level shall be clear. Minimum light transmittance shall be 80%. High performance or low-e glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%.
- iii. No windows at the ground floor level shall be dry-walled, or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance.
- iv. Tinted, reflective, or spandrel glass does not count towards meeting the transparency requirements.

3. Lighting

- A. A lighting plan compliant with the City's lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M.] including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures shall be submitted for ARB Final Review and approval prior to issuance of building permits.
- B. It is encourage that the top or skyline architecture of the buildings be significantly lit in order to distinguish the building in the night time skyline.
- C. Night time building elevations shall be submitted with to ARB Staff prior to issuance of building permits.

4. Mechanical Equipment

- A. Venting & Exhaust—All potential restaurant venting and restaurant exhaust shall be directed to the roof of the building and shall not be visible from the public right-of-way. Restaurant venting is not permitted on any street facing façade of the buildings. All other venting and exhaust for mechanical and other utilities shall be a minimum of 12 ft. above grade and shall be integrated with the building design and painted to match the surrounding building color so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the building.
- B. Transformer Area Screening—Transformer areas outside the building envelope shall be screened with an opaque wall and gated up to 6-feet in height. A hedge, 36-inches tall at the time of planting and maintained at a minimum 48-inches tall shall also be installed to screen the transformer enclosure.
- C. Mechanical Equipment—All ground mounted and rooftop mechanical equipment shall be screened from view at eye level and meet the screening conditions of the Land Development Code.
- D. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventer[s] shall be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view where necessary. They shall be clearly identified on the final utilities plan.
- E. Fencing—Any fencing on the site shall be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum or wrought-iron picket fencing. Chain link fencing is prohibited.
- F. Overhead Powerlines— Existing overhead powerlines on the development site shall be undergrounded during construction.
- G. Final Elevations—The location and configuration of all exterior venting and mechanical equipment shall be depicted on the building elevations in the building permit package.

5. Signage

A Master Sign Plan [MSP] including both the residential, retail and high-rise signage shall submitted for a separate ARB Major Review approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy for the tower or retail spaces. The MSP shall clearly show how signage will be allocated between the tenants and the site as a whole and provide placeholders for locations of proposed signage. High-rise signs are permitted consistent with Sec. 64.246 of the Land Development Code but will require an ARB Major Review prior to permitting unless incorporated into the MSP.

6. Telecommunications Equipment Screening

Buildings should be designed to accommodate future placement of telecommunications equipment. Screening areas should be built into rooftop areas so that the placement and screening of the equipment does not become an afterthought.

7. ARB Construction Observation

A. Prior to the commencement of vertical construction the general contractor, developer and architect will schedule a coordination meeting with ARB Staff to review the ARB conditions of approval and the ARB review process for any proposed changes that may occur during construction.

- B. The general contractor shall schedule periodic meetings with the ARB Staff as needed to update staff on the project progress and potential issues complying with the ARB conditions of approval.
- C. Prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy ARB Staff shall review the project site for compliance with the ARB conditions of approval.

Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation outlining the proposed changes to the site. The Board thanked Mr. Metzger for his presentation.

Wayne Dunkelberger, the applicant, gave a PowerPoint presentation highlighting the key changes to the project as originally presented in July 2015. The Board thanked Mr. Dunkelberger for his presentation.

Discussion ensued regarding the material and color transition, recessed areas and massing needed in certain areas around the building.

A motion was made my Matt Taylor to approve the project based on the conditions in the staff report with the following modifications and additions:

- 1. Modify condition 1.F.i to change the minimum streetscape width for Mariposa Street to 13-feet with a parkway strip width of 7-feet and a pedestrian clear zone width of 6-feet.
- 2. Delete staff conditions of approval 2.D.i, 2.D.ii, 2.E.i, 2.E.ii, 2.F, and 2.G.i
- 3. Approving the flared-out wall in the center of the Church Street facade presented by the applicant in the ARB meeting
- 4. Requiring the applicant to increase the height of the center and corner elements and to provide uplighting on those elements and.
- <u>5. Requiring an ARB Minor Review approval of the final building elevations prior to issuance of a building permit for the project.</u>

The motion was seconded by Catherine Price. The motion carried unanimously 5-0.

4. 55 W. Gore Street - Orlando Health - Lucerne Annex

Owner/Applicant: Orlando Health/Danny Gordon

Location: 55 W. Church Street

District:

Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2016-00030

Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval for exterior renovations, paint, landscaping and signage.

1. Architecture

A. ARB Staff supports the architectural direction and design of the Lucerne Annex project.

B. Transparency — All glass at the ground level shall be clear. Minimum light transmittance shall be 80%. High performance or low-e glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%. No windows at the ground floor level shall be dry-walled or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance.

Tinted, reflective, or spandrel glass does not count towards meeting the transparency requirements.

2. Lighting — A lighting plan compliant with the City's lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M.] including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures shall be submitted for ARB staff review and approval prior to issuance of building permits.

3. Mechanical Equipment

- A. Transformer Area Screening—Transformer areas outside the building envelope shall be screened with decorative, opaque walls and gates up to 6-feet in height. Landscaping shall include a hedge that is 36-inches tall at the time of planting.
- B. Mechanical Equipment—All ground mounted and rooftop mechanical equipment shall be screened from view and meet the screening requirements of the Land Development Code. An screen wall or parapet is required to screen rooftop mechanical equipment. The interior screen wall or parapet shall be the same height as the installed mechanical equipment height.
- C. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventer[s] shall be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way or should be screened from view. They shall be clearly identified on the final utilities plan.
- D. Fencing—Any fencing on the site shall be an open, CPTED-style fence, such as architectural mesh, aluminum or wrought -iron picket fencing. Chain link fencing is prohibited.

4. Signage

- A. Proposed sign designs are approved as submitted.
- B. ARB approval does not grant permission to install any proposed signage. All required permits shall be obtained prior to installation of any signs. ARB shall review all signs during the permitting process to ensure compliance with the ARB conditions of approval.
- **5. ARB Approval** ARB approval does not grant permission to proceed with the proposed improvements. All required permits shall be obtained prior to commencement of construction activities.

Matt Taylor declared a conflict.

Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation outlining the proposed changes to the site. The Board thanked Mr. Metzger for his presentation.

Discussion ensued regarding the tree types being used and the size of the curtain wall around the building.

A motion was made by John Paul Weesner and seconded by Catherine Price to approve the item based on staff conditions as presented. The motion carried unanimously 4-0, with Matt abstaining from the vote.

NEW BUSINESS: None.

OTHER BUSINESS:

ARB Minor Reviews completed since the July ARB Meeting:

A. ARB2016-00023 - 315 W. Robinson Street - Landmark I - Landscape and Hardscape

B. ARB2016-00026 - 150 S. Hughey Avenue - SED Development - Parking Garage Demolition

C. ARB2016-00018 - 605 E. Robinson Street - Pen Coastal LTD Partnership - Upgrade Antennas

D. ARB2015-00066 - 455 N. Garland Avenue - LYNX - Solar Sculptures

OLD BUSINESS: NONE.

ADJOURNMENT: THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:20 PM.

NEXT MEETING: THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, JULY 21, 2016 AT 2:00 PM.

STAFF PRESENT:

Melissa Clarke, Assistant City Attorney Walter Hawkins, Acting Executive Secretary Doug Metzger, City Planning Shaniqua Rose, Board Secretary Kenneth Pelham, City Planning Frank Usina, Orlando Venues Marya Collier, Economic Development Coordinator

Walter Hawkins, Acting Executive Secretary

Shaniqua Rose, Board Secretary