

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MEETING INFORMATION

MINUTES ■ MAY 4, 2016

Location

City Hall
City Council Chambers
400 South Orange Avenue
2nd floor
Orlando, FL 32801

Time

4:00 p.m.

<u>Board Members Present</u>

Jeffrey Thompson, Chair Alyssa Benitez, Vice-Chair Michael Arrington Lucie Ghioto Sean Lackey Mark Lewis

Members Absent

Vijay Marolia Dena Wild

Staff Members

Richard Forbes
David Bass
Heather Bonds
Jason Burton

OPENING SESSION

- Jeffery Thompson, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.
- Determination of Quorum. Pledge of Allegiance. Introduction of Board Members & Staff.

CONSIDERATION OF THE APRIL 6, 2016 MINUTES

Alyssa Benitez MOVED to approve the Minutes of the April 6, 2016 meeting. Mark Lewis SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (6-0).

REGULAR AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2016-00063, 1901 E Central Blvd.

Applicant: Owner: District: David Runnels, 233 West Park Avenue, Winter Park, FL 32789 Maggie Sojourner, 1901 E. Central Blvd, Orlando, FL 32801 Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a 392 square foot one-story addition to the rear of the existing house using shingles, siding, and window profiles to match the existing house.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

- All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
- 2. Windows in the proposed addition shall match the existing and simulate true divided light windows.
- 3. Foundations in proposed addition shall be similar to the existing.
- 4. Siding on the proposed addition shall match the existing siding as closely as possible.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the case with a PowerPoint Preservation that included site photos, existing floor plan of the first floor, proposed elevations, Sanborn map, and a historic Sears Catalogue page showing the Sunbeam house model. Mr. Forbes stated that this house is the only documented home in Orlando that is an original mail-order home. The proposal to construct an addition to the rear will be barely visible from the street. The addition will replace a rear porch that is not original to the house.

Jeffery Thompson inquired what the proposed gable end material will be; Mr. Forbes did not review that material as it is out of view; therefore not reviewable in the Lake Lawsona Historic District. Sean Lackey suggested that the applicant consider adding 4 feet to the proposed rear porch to increase the depth to 10 feet, which is more functional.

Sean Lackey moved to APPROVE the request subject to Staff Conditions. Michael Arrington SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (6-0).

Case No.: HPB2016-00064, 800 E. Pine Street

Applicant:

David Runnels, 233 West Park Avenue, Winter Park, FL 32789

Owner: District:

Dennis Jenkins, 800 E. Pine Street, Orlando, FL, 32801 Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing front porch; and to add a new, wider front porch; and to add new front and rear attic dormers.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

- 1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
- 2. Dormer Windows shall be 6/1 pattern with simulated divided lights to match existing windows.
- 3. The original 6 light entrance door shall be retained.
- 4. Dormer siding shall match the existing house siding.
- 5. Any proposed porch floor material other than concrete shall require additional Minor review,

Richard Forbes introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included photos of the existing porch, site photos, the Florida Master Site File photo, Sanborn map to show the current porch roof is not original, and the proposed plans. Mr. Forbes stated that the current aluminum porch roof was constructed prior to districting but that it is not original. Mr. Forbes clarified discrepancies with the drawn plans and stated that the house currently has 6/1 windows and a 6-lite door, which should remain and the proposed dormer windows shall match the existing 6/1 window pattern.

Lucie Ghioto stated that the proposed porch has several Craftsman elements including the arched openings, which may not be appropriate to the Minimal Traditional style of the house. Mr. Thompson agreed with her observation however, noted that the detailing around the windows, being elevated on piers, and the corner trim are common Bungalow elements. Mr. Thompson thinks going towards a more Bungalow front porch would be appropriate for this house. Sean Lackey stated the Secretary of the Interior's Standards does have a provision for modern additions that have their own place in their own time. He noted that the more modern fascia and other porch elements are a dead giveaway that this a modern addition and fits along with the those Standards. As the main house is currently clad in Asbestos shingle, the Dormers will match in appearance but be made of a similar replacement product made by GAF.

Sean Lackey moved to APPROVE the request subject to Staff Conditions. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (6-0).

3. Case No.: HPB2016-00057, 512 E. Washington Street

Applicant:

Joy Dickinson, Orange Preservation Trust, 643 E. Washington Street, Orlando, FL 32803

Owner:

City of Orlando, 400 S. Orange Avenue, Orlando, FL 32803

District:

Commission District 4

A request to consider Orlando Historic Landmark Status for the structure located at 512 E. Washington Street.

Recommended Action: Approval of the Orlando Historic Landmark status request as Staff finds that the structure meets criteria A, B and C of section 65.720

Richard Forbes introduced the case with a PowerPoint presentation. He cited sections of the City's Code relating to Landmarking properties and the four criteria options that nominations must meet. This site is being nominated under Criteria A, B, and C. Mr. Forbes reviewed the property's history and past ownership. It is mostly associated with George Marsh, who was prominent in the Citrus Industry and may have invented the Marsh Seedless Grapefruit. The homes association with Marsh and the Citrus Industry satisfies Criteria A and B. The residence is in the Mediterranean Revival Style, which was popular during the boom years in Florida. The structure is of tile block with rough stucco as the finish material. The roof is a green tile. Other notable features include the porch with its twisted columns and stylized Corinthian capitals and a quatrefoil window over the entry. The Florida Master Site File, surveyed in 1991, notes that the architecture of the house is significant at the local level. The structure satisfies Criteria C as it exhibits the distinctive characteristics of the Mediterranean Revival Style. In the nomination narrative, the Applicant notes that the architect of the house may have been Ida Ana Ryan and Isabel Roberts, who were utilizing this style in Orlando at that time. More research is needed to confirm this.

Jeffery Thompson stated because more research may reveal additional significance, that this property would also meet Criteria D. Mr. Forbes stated that the nomination only needs to meet one of the four criteria and it presently meets three. The Board discussed the previous surrounding houses that were demolished for additional green space for Lake Eola Park. If approved by HPB, the Municipal Planning Board and City Council will also need to review and approve the landmark status.

Joy Wallace Dickinson, 614 E. Washington St., Orlando, FL 32801, spoke on behalf of the non-profit group Orange Preservation Trust. The local preservation group is in favor of the Landmark status of this property. Ms. Dickinson also shared insights of growing up and visiting her grandparents who lived down the street from the house. She feels that the house is significant to the citrus industry, as an example of the Mediterranean Revival architecture style, and because it sits on Lake Eola, which in her opinion, is the heart of the City.

Chairperson, Jeffery Thompson, stated that Staff received 22 letters of support to Landmark 1512 E. Washington Street. Those letters were from:

- Mrs. Tommy Hosier, 4985 Lake Sparling Rd, Orlando, FL 32810
- Rick Kilby, 1818 Curry Ford Rd, Orlando, FL 32806
- Mark Line, Vice President of Orange Preservation Trust
- · Victoria Hinson Griffin
- · Shelia G. Ratliff, Classic Renovations, Inc.
- Tracey Jacobs, 309 E Amelia Street, Orlando, FL 32801
- Julia and Gil Rowe
- Ann Berendzen, 400 Park Avenue, Winter Park, 32789
- James Crescitelli
- Diane and David Martens, Lake Eola Heights Historic Neighborhood Association
- · Rebecca and David McClure
- Tana Porter
- Raymond Cox, 600 E Amelia Street, Orlando, FL 32803
- Carolyn Burleson-Webb, 611 E, Concord St, Orlando, FL 32803
- Kevin Burleson-Webb, 611 E. Concord St., Orlando, FL 32803
- · Christine Persaud, Lake Eola Heights Historic District
- · Robert Serros, Chairman, Orlando Remembered
- Janet Walker, 645 E. Ridgewood Street, Orlando, FL 32803
- Cindy White, 806 E. Amelia Street, Orlando, FL 32803
- Gary Magarian, 808 E. Harwood Street, Orlando, FL 32803
- Christine Madrid French, Adjunct Professor, University of Florida
- H. Lee Pharr, 815 Ridgewood St, Orlando, FL 32803

Michael Arrington moved to APPROVE Orlando Historic Landmark Status of 1512 E. Washington Street. Mark Lewis SECONDED the Motion. The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (6-0).

OTHER BUSINESS

- There were no General Appearances.
- Historic Preservation Officer, Richard Forbes made several announcements:
 - May is Historic Preservation Month
 - The Historic Preservation Awards will be presented to City Council on Monday, May 9th
- Report on the April Minor Reviews (24 reviews)

ADJOURNMENT

Jeffery Thompson, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 4:45p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

David Bass, Assistant City Attorney Jason Burton, City Planning

Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer

Heather M. Bonds, Recording Secretary