



HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES ❖ February 3, 2016

MEETING INFORMATION

Location

City Council Chambers

2nd Floor, City Hall

One City Commons

400 South Orange Avenue

Time

4:00 p.m.

Members Present

Jeffery Thompson, Chairperson

Alyssa Benitez, Vice-Chairperson

Michael Arrington

Mackenzie Carolan

Lucie Ghioto

Sean Lackey

Mark Lewis

Dena Wild

Staff Members

Richard Forbes

David Bass

Heather Bonds

Jason Burton

OPENING SESSION

- Jeffery Thompson, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.
- Determination of a quorum. Pledge of Allegiance. Introduction of Board Members and staff.

CONSIDERATION OF THE JANUARY 6, 2016 MINUTES

Mark Lewis MOVED to approve the Minutes of the January 6, 2016 meeting. Mackenzie Carolan SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (8-0).

REGULAR AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2016-00001, 722 E. Amelia Street

Applicant: Sean Lackey, 1110 E. Marks St., Orlando, FL 32803

Owner: Gabriel and Stephanie Rodriguez, 722 E. Amelia St. Orlando, FL 32803

District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the one-story detached accessory structure and to construct a new three car garage with an 817 sq. ft apartment above; and to construct a 496 sq. ft. addition to the rear of the main structure.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. All roofing and building materials and foundation details for the additions shall match the existing house and share similar proportions and details.
3. Waive the 180 day waiting period for demolition of the garage. (However, per Section 65.732, the applicant must receive a building permit for the new development prior to receiving a demolition permit.)
4. New windows in the addition to the main house shall match the existing in style, trim, material, installation depth and pattern.

5. The proposed rear doors shall approximate historic wood multi-light French doors with dimensional muntins.
6. Windows in the proposed garage shall be similar to the main house in trim and installation.
7. Reduce the size of the proposed garage apartment so that it is more similar to historic 2 car garage-apartments in the district by limiting the size to approximately 670 square feet and two garage bays.
8. The location of the proposed garage apartment will require a variance from the Board of Zoning Adjustment.

Sean Lackey, recused himself from this case because he is the applicant and architect of the proposed project. He filled out Form 8B, "Memorandum of Voting Conflict" and gave it to the Recording Secretary. Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, presented the case with a PowerPoint presentation that included photos from the field, a comparison map showing the living square footage of neighboring properties, Sanborn map to show the historic configuration, existing site survey, site plan, and elevations, and the proposed site plan, elevations of the garage apartment, and the proposed house elevations. The one-story wood frame cottage and garage were constructed in 1924 and are contributing structures in the Lake Eola Heights Historic District. The garage and house were both added on to sometime after 1961, evident from the Sanborn map. The proposed garage apartment is designed as a frame vernacular structure which shares features of the main house. Mr. Forbes also used Sanborn maps (1956) to illustrate where 2-story garage apartments are less than 15 feet and 5 feet from property line. The historic building pattern sometimes included accessory structures built 5 feet from the property line, whereas today's Land Development Code requires a 15 foot setback in the R-2B zoning districts. Mr. Forbes reviewed Staff Conditions and explained Condition 7, reducing the size of the proposed garage apartment to a limit of approximately 670 square feet. He cited examples in the district that had previously been approved for a Certificate of Appropriateness which were smaller than the proposed project. He also explained that the arrangement of the proposed three car garage would make it difficult for a car to maneuver, meaning this garage is too large for this project.

Dena Wild asked if Staff heard from any neighbors. Mr. Forbes answered that Staff did receive letters from neighbors. Chairman Jeffery Thompson read two letters into the record:

- o Cindy White, 806 E. Amelia Street, the neighbor to the east, is in favor of the request
- o Bryan Douglas, 719 E. Harwood St., is a rear neighbor and opposed to the project as presented; however supports a 2-car garage setback 10 feet from the rear property line.

Mr. Forbes compared this project to other recent projects in this general location. Ms. Wild asked what the setback of the existing garage is; Mr. Forbes answered that the current garage is 10 feet from the property line. The Board also discussed the rear neighbors, the location of the proposed A/C units, and the Board of Zoning Adjustment (BZA). The BZA does take the HPB's recommendation into consideration; however are not obligated to approve variances based on the HPB's approval. Assistant City Attorney David Bass stated that possible code adjustments could change the way such variances are granted. The HPB reviews variances based on the historic building pattern, whereas the BZA reviews based on hardships. He also informed the Board that a recent case that both HPB and the BZA approved has been appealed and overturned.

Sean Lackey, 1624 Illinois Street, Orlando, FL 32803, spoke as the Applicant and architect. Mr. Lackey discussed a recent project on Concord Street and the difference between the two projects. He provided a list of 2-story garage apartments, their square footage, and the setbacks. The proposed project is a larger lot with an existing structure, whereas the Concord Street project was an empty lot. This property has a hardship because the main house is setback further than other houses with garage apartments and they are asking for the 5-foot setback to be able to maneuver cars into the garage. Mr. Lackey also stated that the R-2B zoning allows for 3 units, where the Owners are only proposing 2 units. The owner's will be moving their parents to the proposed garage apartment and the space is needed for them. Mr. Lackey stated that this proposal is not maxing out the property, FAR, or the ISR. He addressed the rear property owner's concerns and is open to some reductions. Dena Wild asked Mr. Lackey if he is in agreeance with Staff Condition's to reduction. Mr. Lackey stated that some reduction could be considered but does not agree to the 670 sq foot limitation recommended by Staff. Mackenzie Carolan asked if there were any other properties approved for garage apartments that have the same R-2B zoning; Mr. Lackey believes so.

Stephanie Rodriguez, 722 E. Amelia Street, Orlando, FL 32803, is the owner. She appreciates the time of the Board. She and her husband moved to Orlando from the North and fell in love with the area and walkability. Her parents would also like to move down here.

Chairman Thompson read into the record a petition from 5 neighbors in support.

The Board began their discussion about the proposal and discussed the setback, size of the proposal, and the rear neighbors. The board agreed this is a wide lot. Dena Wild is sensitive to the neighbors and stated that the predominate pattern is not 2-story garage apartments with a 5-foot setback. The Board discussed the 5-foot setback, development pattern, and the proposed

outdoor elevator. Dena Wild asked Mr. Forbes to explain the Staff Recommendation to reduce the structure; He explained his recommendation still allows a generous 2-car garage at 670 sq. ft. Mackenzie Carolan left the meeting at 5:00 pm.

Alyssa Benitez moved to APPROVE the Request subject to Staff Conditions with an alteration to Condition 7. Reduce the size of the proposed garage apartment so that it is more similar to historic 2 car garage-apartments in the district by limiting the size to approximately 768 square feet and two garage bays. And add Condition 9. The garage apartment shall be setback 10 feet from the rear property line. Dena Wild SECONDED the Motion.

Staff asked to clarify the revised Condition and asked if the Motion is intended to remove one of the proposed garage bays. Ms. Benitez stated that she agrees with Staff's Condition to limit the bays to two. A third bay at this size would not be functional and is obsolete.

The Motion was voted upon and PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote (6-0).

OTHER BUSINESS

- General Appearances: There were no general appearances.
- Reviewed January Minor Reviews (17).
- ProjectDox discussion.

ADJOURNMENT

Jeffery Thompson, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:15 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

David Bass, Assistant City Attorney
Heather Bonds, Recording Secretary
Jason Burton, City Planning
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer

A blue ink signature of Richard Forbes, consisting of a stylized 'R' followed by a horizontal line.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer

A blue ink signature of Heather M. Bonds, written in a cursive style.

Heather M. Bonds, Recording Secretary