

APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD

MEETING MINUTES

July 16, 2015

OPENING SESSION:

- Chairman Greg Witherspoon called the meeting to order at 2:00 P.M.
- Shaniqua Rose, ARB Recording Secretary, conducted the Roll Call.
- Determination of a quorum was confirmed.
- Chairman Greg Witherspoon read the Welcome, General Rules of Order and the Appeals process.

MINUTES

A motion was made by Jeff Bush and seconded by Daisy Staniszkis to approve the June 18, 2015 ARB Meeting Minutes. The motion carried unanimously.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

There were no announcements.

CONSENT AGENDA: None.

REGULAR AGENDA:

1. 151 E. Washington Street - Zumo Zen Juice Bar

Owner/Applicant: Susan Carver/Sabrina Vaccari

Location: 151 E. Washington Street

District: 5

Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2015-00036 Request for a Major

Certificate of Appearance Approval for a new juice bar structure incorporated into

an existing kiosk.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request

with the following conditions:

 ARB approval is not approval to construct. All necessary building permits and their conditions shall be met prior to construction and operation. If building permit requirements substantially change the design of the proposed establishment then an ARB Minor Review and approval shall be required for those modifications.
 All existing signage on the kiosk shall be removed prior to installation of the juice kitchen.

MEETING INFORMATION

Location

Sustainability Conference Room

2nd Floor, City Hall One City Commons

400 South Orange Avenue

<u>Time</u>

2:00p.m.

Board Members Present:

Greg Witherspoon, Chair

Daisy Staniszkis

Justin Ramb

Tim Lemons

Jeff Bush

Board Members Absent:

Mike Beale, Vice Chair

Matt Taylor

- 3. The serving station graphics and signs are approved as submitted in this application, but will still require sign permits. All other signage including one menu board sign shall require an ARB Minor Review and approval prior to issuance of signage permits. Banner signs and flags are not permitted.
- 4. The serving area shall be kept in a clean, orderly condition and shall be pressure washed at least once a month.
- 5. If business operations at this location cease all signs and graphics shall be removed within 30 days of closure.

Mr. Doug Metzger gave a brief overview of the project plans.

The Board wanted clarification on the hours of operation, if the kiosk is connected to the building and made the applicant aware that the current proposed wheelchair access area is not ADA compliant.

The applicant let the Board know that the hours of operation will be 7 am to 6 pm; there are gaps around the kiosk so it is not attached to the current structure and they will look further into the wheelchair access area to ensure it is ADA compliant.

A motion was made by Tim Lemons and seconded by Jeff Bush to approve the item based on the conditions in the staff report. The motion carried unanimously 5-0.

2. 514 E. Church Street - 520

Owner/ Applicant: Thornton Commons LLC/Ray Acosta

Location: 514 E. Church Street

District:

Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2015-00043 Request for a Courtesy Review for new construction of

two 12-story, multifamily buildings with a combined 586 residential units, 10, 950 sf of retail and 875 parking spaces in one integrated and one attached parking

garages.

Recommended Action: Staff has reviewed the submittal and has the following comments:

1. Streetscape

A. Streetscape Design Guidelines

- i. All streetscape design and construction is required to comply with the design and construction requirements of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines and the conditions in this staff report.
- ii. Maintenance Agreement—The applicant shall enter into a maintenance agreement with the City to define maintenance responsibilities for the streetscape and proposed outdoor dining area.
- iii. City Services Easement—A city services easement shall be provided by the applicant for any portion of the 15-foot streetscape zone outside of the right-of-way.

B. General Streetscape Requirements:

- i. Street Trees High rise live oaks trees shall be planted as the primary street tree in the planter islands and parkway strip. Sylvester Palms may be used as accent trees at the building entrances. Sylvester Palms may also be used on both sides of Mariposa Street.
- ii. Structural Soil To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas, structural soil or a Planning Official approved equivalent shall be installed around all canopy street trees consistent with Detail 3.4-O and 3.4-P of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Guidelines.
- iii. Street Lights Double acorn LED streetlights, consistent with the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines shall be used on all streets and spaced based on OUC lighting requirements.
- iv. Corner Treatments—The corner treatment at all corners shall be Lawrenceville Brick, with a 6-inch thick subbase for the first 6-feet from back of curb and all ADA ramps transitioning to a 4-inch thick sub-base to the face

of building. Corner treatments shall provide two accessibility ramps at each corner perpendicular to the centerline.

- v. Valve and Junction Boxes—All at grade junction, valve and control boxes in the streetscape zone shall be traffic bearing grade boxes and lids.
- vi. Pedestrian Crossings—The pedestrian crossings at the garage and service area entries shall be raised to be at same grade as the sidewalk adjacent to the driveway. A pavement treatment a minimum of 7-feet wide that contrasts with the vehicle lanes shall be used in order to clearly define the pedestrian area. Reflective paint alone is not acceptable, however may be used in conjunction with pavers or other surfaces to outline the pedestrian path for night time safety. The mid-block curb cuts into the garage and service areas shall meet the mid-block curb cut standard in the Downtown Streetscape Guidelines.
- vii. Building Entries—Building entries should face the street and be recessed, or the door ways shall open inward so that ingress, egress and entry doors do not conflict or open directly into the pedestrian clear zone. viii. Curb Cuts—All existing curb cuts shall be removed and the streetscape and curbing restored during construction.
- ix. ARB Final Review—Final Landscape and hardscape plans shall be submitted for ARB Final Review and approval prior to submittal for building permits.

C. E. Church Street

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on E. Church Street shall be 15-feet from the back-of-curb of the onstreet parking spaces. The parkway strip shall be a minimum of 7-feet wide along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 8-feet in width [7-feet shown in proposed plans], though 10-feet is recommended by ARB Staff.
- ii. Treatment 5 —The E. Church Street streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the streetscape design guidelines.

D. S. Eola Drive

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on S. Eola Drive shall be 15-feet from the back-of-curb of the onstreet parking spaces. The parkway strip shall be a minimum of 7-feet wide along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 8-feet in width [7.5-feet shown in proposed plans], though 10-feet is recommended by ARB Staff.
- ii. Treatment 5 —The S. Eola Drive streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the streetscape design guidelines. '

E. Mariposa Street [north side]

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on the north side of Mariposa Street shall be 10-feet from the back-of-curb. The parkway strip shall be a minimum of 5-feet wide along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 5-feet in width.
- ii. Treatment 5 —The north side of the Mariposa Street streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the streetscape design guidelines.
- iii. Street Trees—The street trees on the northside of Mariposa Street shall be Sylvester Palms.

F. Mariposa Street [south side]

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on the south side of Mariposa Street shall be 10-feet from the back-of-curb of the on-street parking spaces. The parkway strip shall be a minimum of 5-feet wide along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 5-feet in width.
- ii. Treatment 5 —The north side of the Mariposa Street streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the streetscape design guidelines.
- iii. Street Trees—The street trees on the south side of Mariposa Street shall be high-rise live oak trees.

G. Jackson Street

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on Jackson Street shall be 15-feet from the back-of-curb. The parkway strip shall be a minimum of 10-feet wide along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 5-feet in width.
- ii. Treatment 5 —The north side of the Mariposa Street streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the streetscape design guidelines.

iii. Street Trees—The street trees on Jackson Street shall be high-rise live oak trees.

H. S. Osceola Avenue

- i. Width—The minimum streetscape width on S. Osceola Avenue shall be 15-feet from the back-of-curb. The park-way strip shall be a minimum of 7-feet wide along the entire project frontage. The pedestrian clear zone shall be a minimum of 8-feet in width. This width should provide additional area for landscaping adjacent to the S. Osceola parking garage frontage on the south side of the subject property.
- ii. Treatment 5 —The north side of the Mariposa Street streetscape shall meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the streetscape design guidelines.
- iii. Street Trees—The street trees on S. Osceola Avenue shall be high-rise live oak trees.

2. Architecture

A. Design Intent

- i. ARB and City Staff has concerns about the massing, building treatments and use of a single façade cladding material [stucco] on the exterior of the buildings, especially on the long edges of the block which are over 400–feet long.
- ii. There are also concerns about the lack of height variation and cornice treatment along the parapet of both buildings. ARB Staff recommends an increase in the height variation between parapet panels and potential variations and a more distinctive cornice treatment where the building touches the sky.
- iii. Continued focused on the design and details at the base, through the middle and at the crown of the building including architectural lighting will continue to be critical through the design and development process.
- iv. Final architectural plans, elevations, materials and finishes shall be submitted for ARB Final Review and approval prior to submittal for building permits.
- v. Canopies and awnings at the building entries may project into the city services easements. Canopies or awnings that project into the right-of-way will require Transportation Engineering approval. In no instance shall a canopy be less than 17'6" above finished grade to meet transportation maintenance requirements. Awnings shall be a minimum of 9-feet above finished grade.
- vii. Exterior Doors—A minimum 4"x6" security view panels shall be provided in all pedestrian accessible exterior doors including emergency exit doors to provide visibility and security for pedestrians exiting the building.

B. Building Crowns

i. It is recommended by ARB Staff that distinctive and signature architectural treatments be incorporated into the roof line at the significant corners of the project. For the north building that would be at the corner of E. Church Street and S. Osceola Avenue and also at the corner of E. Church Street and S. Eola Drive. For the south building the significant corners would be the S. Osceola and Mariposa corner and the Mariposa and S. Eola Drive corner.

C. North Building

- i. Retail spaces and the live-work-retail space at the ground level shall provide doorways that face the street along with a sidewalk connection from the doorway to the primary sidewalk.
- ii. Façade Materials—It is recommended by ARB Staff that at least one additional cladding material be incorporated into the façade design in order to break-up the large mass and monotony of the single material façade treatment. Paint is not a adequate cladding treatment when only used in conjunction with stucco. It is also recommended that architectural accents such as canopies, eyebrows, lighting fixtures and/or window trim be incorporated to add additional visual interest and distinctive style to the façade treatments.
- iii. E. Church St. Façade—It is recommended by ARB Staff that the mass of the E. Church Street façade be broken into distinctive yet different design treatments to give the appearance that the building is at least two or more different attached structures.
- iv. Windows—The windows on all facades shall be recessed from the façade to provide additional design texture and shadow lines to the building façade. The addition of window sills or trim treatments is also recommended.

D. South Building

i. Street facing residential units at the ground level shall provide doorways that face the street along with a sidewalk connection from the doorway to the primary sidewalk.

- ii. Façade Materials—It is recommended by ARB Staff that at least one additional cladding material be incorporated into the façade design in order to break-up the large mass and monotony of the single material façade treatment. Paint is not a adequate cladding treatment when only used in conjunction with stucco. It is also recommended that architectural accents such as canopies, eyebrows, lighting fixtures and/or window sills and trim be incorporated into the façade treatments to add additional visual interest and distinctive styling to the façade.
- iii. Mariposa St. Façade—It is recommended by ARB Staff that the mass of the Mariposa Street façade be broken into distinctive yet different design treatments to give the appearance that the building is at least two or more different attached structures.
- ii. Windows—The windows on all facades shall be recessed from the façade to provide additional design texture and shadow lines to the building façade. The addition of window sills or trim treatments is also recommended.
- i. Service Area—Decorative doors or gates that are architecturally integrated with the building design shall be utilized at the loading area. The doors or gates shall be closed when the loading area is not in use.

E. Parking Garage

- i. Elevations—The parking garage elevations shall be designed to be architecturally intergrated with the building they serve. The openings and materials of the parking garage facades should mimic the rhythm and pattern of the rest of the building structure. This especially applies to the south building attached parking garage.
- ii. Vertical Openings—The long vertical openings of both garage facades shall be eliminated and replaced with opening that mimic the window and opening patterns of each building they share.
- iii. South Building Attached Garage—a dense landscape buffer or green screens shall be utilized along the ground level of the street facing facades that do not have an active use.
- iv. Openings—The openings in the parking garage facades shall incorporate an architectural mesh infill. At the ground level the mesh shall be security grade.
- v. Screening—The parking garage shall be designed to minimize direct views of parked vehicles from streets and side-walks. An opaque minimum 36-inch tall wall shall be installed to avoid headlight and spill-over light glare. Noise and exhaust fumes onto public use areas or adjacent properties shall be mitigated. Lighting that may be potentially visible from the garage shall be shielded.
- vi. Pedestrian Connection—A minimum 5 ft. pedestrian walkway shall be provided adjacent to the driveway entries into the parking garage.
- vii. Ramping—Angled exterior ramping shall not be visible from the right-of-way and shall be obscured from view through the use of exterior metal screening, or other alternative methods. Interior ramping and walls that might be visible thru the garage openings shall be painted a dark gray or black.
- viii. Egress Slope—The slope of the grade preceding the exit of a parking garage shall not exceed 2% for a minimum of 25 feet from the garage entry.
- ix. Transformers—Electrical transformers incorporated into the ground level of a parking garage shall provide a minimum of 17'-6" of clearance above grade and demonstrate that there is adequate space and access for maintenance and replacement equipment movement and turning.

F. Transparency

- i. The ground floor building walls facing all streets shall contain a minimum of 30% of transparent materials. A mini-mum of 15% transparency shall be provided on all other floors facing the street above the ground level.
- ii. All glass at the ground level shall be clear. Minimum light transmittance shall be 80%. High performance or low-e glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%.
- iii. No windows at the ground floor level shall be dry-walled, or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance.
- iv. Tinted, reflective, or spandrel glass does not count towards meeting the transparency requirements.
- G. Outdoor Dining Area—At the time of review there is not sufficient streetscape width adjacent to the proposed buildings to allow for outdoor dining areas or sidewalk cafes.

4. Lighting

A. A lighting plan compliant with the City's lighting regulations [Chapter 63 2M.] including photometrics and all proposed exterior lighting fixtures shall be submitted for ARB Final Review and approval prior to issuance of building permits.

- B. It is encourage that the top or architectural crowns of the buildings be significantly lit in order to make the building a beacon in the night time skyline.
- C. Night time building elevations shall be submitted with the ARB Final Review application.

5. Mechanical Equipment

A. Venting & Exhaust—All potential restaurant venting and restaurant exhaust shall be directed to the roof of the building and shall not be visible from the public right-of-way. Restaurant venting is not permitted on any street facing façade of the buildings. All other venting and exhaust for mechanical and other utilities shall be a minimum of 12 ft. above grade and shall be integrated with the building design so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the building.

- B. Transformer Area Screening—Transformer areas outside the building envelope shall be screened with decorative, opaque fencing and gates up to 6-feet in height..
- C. Mechanical Equipment—All ground mounted and rooftop mechanical equipment shall be screened from view and meet the screening conditions of the Land Development Code.
- D. Backflow Preventer—Backflow preventer[s] shall be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view where necessary. They shall be clearly identified on the final utilities plan.
- E. Fencing—Any fencing on the site shall be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum or wrought-iron picket fencing. Chain link fencing is prohibited.
- F. Overhead Powerlines— Existing overhead powerlines on the development site shall be undergrounded during construc-tion.
- G. Final Elevations—The location and configuration of all exterior venting and mechanical equipment shall be depicted on the building elevations in the Final ARB Review application.

6. Signage

A Master Sign Plan [MSP] including both the residential, retail and high-rise signage shall submitted for a separate ARB Major Review approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy for the tower or retail spaces. The MSP shall clearly show how signage will be allocated between the tenants and the site as a whole and provide placeholders for loca-tions of proposed signage. High-rise signs are permitted consistent with Sec. 64.246 of the Land Development Code but will require an ARB Major Review prior to permitting unless incorporated into the MSP.

7. Telecommunications Equipment Screening

Buildings should be designed to accommodate future placement of telecommunications equipment. Screening areas should be built into rooftop areas so that the placement and screening of the equipment does not become an after-thought.

8. Model

Prior to permitting, a physical 1"= 100' scale model of the project should be provided for the DDB/CRA model located in the Downtown Information Center.

Mr. Doug Metzger gave a brief overview of the proposed project.

Ray Acosta, Applicant, presented updated façade renderings to the Board to give an idea of what the building will look like.

The Board was generally pleased with the new façade renderings.

Justin Ramb wanted to know if there is a vision for this particular area of Downtown. Mr. Metzger said it is called the South Eola Neighborhood Plan, which addresses streetscape, height limits, density and land use for the area. Mr. Burton added that the South Eola area is intended to be a high intensity residential area.

Daisy Staniszkis was concerned about the parking, noting that parking in this area is already tight and constructing a new building with retail and bringing more residents should have ample parking. She also expressed concern with the repetitious design from building to building and suggested the applicant consider some variation in design. Mr. Metzger conveyed from the applicant that the project will meet code requirements for the amount of parking they are proposing.

NEW BUSINESS: None.

OTHER BUSINESS:

ARB Minor Reviews completed since the December ARB Meeting:

- 1. ARB2015-00041 250 N. Orange Ave Exterior Painting and improvements
- 2. ARB2015-00042 250 N. Orange Ave Drive Thru Canopy Demo
- 3. ARB2015-00023 54 W. Church Street Graffiti Juncktion Outdoor Dining
- 4. ARB2015-00026 55 W. Church Street Rusty Spoon 2 Planters
- 5. ARB2015-00040 320 N. Magnolia Ave Exterior Renovations (paint color, fence, lighting & awnings)
- 6. ARB2015- 00045- 512 S. Parramore Ave Harvest Baptist Church Outdoor Basketball Court
- 7. ARB2015-00049 155 E. Anderson Street Dr. Phillips Center Signage
- 8. ARB2015-00050 625 Lake Dot Circle Salvation Army Demolition of Abandoned House

OLD BUSINESS: None.

ADJOURNMENT: CHAIRMAN GREG WITHERSPOON ADJOURNED THE MEETING AT 3:15 P.M.

THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, AUGUST 20, 2015 AT 2:00 PM.

STAFF PRESENT

David Bass, Assistant City Attorney
Doug Metzger, City Planning
Shaniqua Rose, Board Secretary
Walter Hawkins, Director of Urban Development

Walter Hawkins, Acting Executive Secretary

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer Jason Burton, City Planning Kim King, Business Development Assistant Manager

Shaniqua Rose, Board Secretary