



HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES ❖ December 3, 2014

MEETING INFORMATION

Location

City Council Chambers

2nd Floor, City Hall

One City Commons

400 South Orange Avenue

Time

4:00 p.m.

Members Present

Dena Wild, Chairperson

Jeffery Thompson, Vice-Chairperson

Alyssa Benitez

Margaret Brock

Sean Lackey

Mark Lewis

Keith Oropeza

Members Absent

Michael Arrington

Catherine Price

Staff Members

Richard Forbes

Heather Hohman

Kyle Shephard

Jason Burton

OPENING SESSION

- Dena Wild, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.
- Determination of a quorum. Pledge of Allegiance. Introduction of Board Members and staff.
- Consideration of the November 5, 2014 minutes

CONSIDERATION OF THE NOVEMBER 5, 2014 MINUTES

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to approve the Minutes of the November 5, 2014 meeting. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

CONSENT AGENDA

Jeffery Thompson requested HPB2014-00251 be moved to the Regular Agenda.

REGULAR AGENDA

1. CASE No.: HPB2014-00251, 117 ROSEARDEN DRIVE

Applicant/Owner: Michael Shawn Moloney, 117 Rosearden Dr., Orlando, FL 32803
District: Lake Lawsons Historic District (Commission District 4)

The Applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to add a front porch to the house using materials to match the existing structure.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. New windows and door to be similar to existing historic wood double hung windows and have dimensional, exterior muntins.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the subject property through a PowerPoint Presentation that included pictures from the field, maps, site survey, drawings of existing conditions, and the proposed drawings. Jeffery Thompson inquired about the front setback of the proposed front porch compared to the neighboring setbacks. Because the street follows the curves of Fern Creek, the lots facing Rosearden Dr. have various projections. This porch will not need a variance. Mr. Thompson asked if the sidelights will be dived or be a single pane of glass; Staff Condition 2 states that new windows should be similar to the existing historic windows.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to Staff Conditions. Margaret Brock SECONDED the Motion. The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED by a unanimous voice vote (7-0).

2. CASE No.: HPB2014-00216, 1501 E. WASHINGTON STREET

Applicant/Owner: Tracy King, 1501 E. Washington St., Orlando, FL 32801
 District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

The Applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to retroactively approve an addition to the rear of the house.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Provide 5 feet of clearance from the garage eave to the addition eave.
3. Replace the east facing windows with windows that match the existing windows in the house.
4. Provide additional support to the overhang so that it does not sag.
5. Recommendation to reroof entire house so that the shingles match.

Richard Forbes reviewed the case with a PowerPoint Presentation that included pictures from the field, the Master Site File photo showing four posts on the front porch (taken 1990), a current site survey, elevations, and site plans to illustrate the distance between the eaves of the house and the garage, which is under one foot where the code requires five feet. This is a retro-active request for an addition that is visible from the street. Mr. Forbes reviewed the Conditions. Mr. Thompson asked why there are no conditions pertaining to the rear façade. Mr. Forbes explained that the Lake Lawsona Historic District ordinance precludes from review anything not visible from a street, lake or park. Mr. Thompson asked if there are any other codes that address fenestration of the rear facades; there is not. Chairperson Wild asked for clarification of the retroactive request. Mr. Forbes stated that the applicant has already installed the addition without any City permit and as a result was cited by Code Enforcement. The Board discussed if the windows on the west elevation are subject to review. Mr. Forbes stated that these windows are barely visible over the fence line, but could be reviewable if the Board felt there should be appropriate action. The Board agreed that the windows on the west elevation should match those on the east elevation and should be under their purview. Sean Lackey discussed the informal nature of the rear of the house and considered the irregular roof line as a whimsical vernacular element. The Board also discussed the non-matching shingle colors, siding, supports for the overhang, feasibility of the garage doors, and the likeliness of a variance being granted. They also discussed the Bungalow style of architecture and the appropriate roof line. The roof line should articulate the footprint of the house to fit the typical characteristics of the Bungalow styling.

The applicant declined to speak. There were no other public comments.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to Staff Conditions with a change to Condition 5 to state "Require to reroof the entire house so that the shingles match; and with the additional conditions, Condition 6.) Replace the west facing windows with windows that match the existing windows in the house. 7.) Adjust the roofline to articulate the footprint of the house. Margaret Brock SECONDED the Motion.

He also suggested landscaping to shield the windows from view. The Board discussed restricting the design flexibility by requiring the applicant to change the roofline. Mr. Thompson clarified that his Motion states to "adjust the roofline" which reflects an intent to allow flexibility in the design and doesn't not define how the applicant should step back or redesign the roofline.

The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED by a Unanimous Voice Vote.

3. CASE No.: HPB2014-00221, 311 E. COPELAND DRIVE

Applicant/Owner: Steve and Michelle Radcliffe, 311 E. Copeland Dr., Orlando, FL 32806
 District: Lake Copeland Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new single family residence in the Mediterranean Revival Style containing 3928 square feet of living space on an vacant lot.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Provide additional relief on the east elevation to break up the expanse.
3. Wrap the porch element around the side of the house to help break up mass and create a triple arch loggia.
4. Provide additional treatment to south facing façade of garage.
5. Provide additional trim treatment to the small circular window over front door.
6. Move the house back 3 feet on the lot so that it is set back 30 feet.
7. Windows shall simulate true divided light windows and have exterior, dimensional grids and be inset from the face of the building similar to historic windows in the district.
8. Second floor windows shall have flat tops.
9. Increase transparency by adding additional window on second floor of front façade.
10. Garage openings shall have flat openings.
11. Details for the alterations to the existing iron fence and brick piers shall be reviewed by the Minor Review Committee.
12. Final roof tile material and stucco finish shall be reviewed by the Minor Review Committee.
13. Provide additional information on the site grading and minimize tall retaining walls visible from lake.

Keith Oropeza recused himself from this case for personal reasons. Sean Lackey recused himself from this case for a business conflict. They each filled out Form 8B and submitted it to the Recording Secretary.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the subject property through a PowerPoint presentation with photos from the field including the empty lot, the surrounding gate and brick wall, and the neighboring historic Sligh house. He also included the proposed elevations, floor plans, living square footage map of the Lake Copeland Historic District, and the gross square footage map of the district. He reviewed Staff Conditions and demonstrated the architectural conditions with the proposed elevations. Mr. Forbes also discussed characteristics of the Mediterranean Revival style and explained his conditions concerning the additional relief, flat top windows, trim, and triple arch loggia were to encourage appropriate styling in the proposal.

Margaret Brock said she is surprised that there are not more conditions pertaining to the rear façade, as visible elements are reviewable in the Lake Copeland Historic District. Mr. Forbes stated that the windows on the first floor of the rear façade would be difficult to see, as they will be in the shadow of the porch. He also stated that the windows in the master bedroom do have some detail and that the second floor windows will be subject to the Staff Condition requiring flat tops to be in keeping with the Mediterranean Revival style. The Board discussed the sliding glass doors on the rear façade, the rear setback, and the retaining wall, which has not been proposed in this plan.

Steven Radcliffe, 310 E. Copeland Dr., Orlando, FL 32806, is the applicant and owner of the lot. He agrees with Staff Conditions and feels that these will only enhance his proposal. He clarified the pool deck and retaining wall is still being designed but it will not be very tall, as they would like to keep their view of the lake. Jeffery Thompson asked if there are any rear modifications that he would object to; he stated not one in particular but would like to keep large views of the lake intact with the picture window in the breakfast nook. Mr. Thompson also asked if he would be opposed to adding arched openings to the rear porch for additional detail; he would not be opposed to adding these elements.

Bob Snow, 239 E. Copeland Dr., Orlando, FL 32806, spoke on his own behalf as the neighbor to the west of the subject property. Mr. Snow provided a history of the Lake Copeland area. He bought his home, the historic Sligh Home, in 1976. He described the positive renovations to his neighboring properties and expressed concern that this proposal doesn't meet the quality of work previously done in the District. He would like to see more details and articulation in the proposal. As his property and the proposed project share a brick wall surrounding the properties, he asked that Board consider requiring the applicant to build with a complimentary exterior material to the brick wall. Mr. Snow provided examples from Flager College that illustrates Mediterranean Revival structures with brick, tile, and red terra-cotta features that match the brick wall. He asked to attend any other public meetings regarding the design.

Dena Wild clarified that this is the public meeting to approve the design. There will be subsequent Minor Review Committee meetings to flesh out some details. Mr. Snow will be allowed to attend MRC meetings as an observer.

Mr. Radcliffe responded to Mr. Snow's comments. He said that his design should not be dictated by the non-contributing brick wall that was built in 1979. He has designed to minimize impact to the wall included centering the house so that gates will not have to be moved and aligning the driveway so that no piers will be removed.

The Board continued discussion about the brick and iron fence. The Board agrees with Staff Conditions and agreed that the level of drawings need further details.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to Staff Conditions. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED the Motion. The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED by a unanimous voice vote (4-1; Mark Lewis opposed. Sean Lackey and Keith Oropeza abstained).

4. CASE No.: HPB2014-00234, 220 THORNTON LANE

Applicant: Allen Arthur, 301 N. Fern Creek Ave, Orlando, FL 32803
 Owner: Oak Branch Partners, LLC, 6536 Pinecastle Blvd, #A, Orlando, FL 32809
 District: Lake Lawsons Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing non-contributing structure and construct a new single family, two story residence containing 2844 square feet of living space.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Waive the 180 day waiting period.
3. Demolition may occur only after a new design has been approved and the permit has been issued for the new construction.
4. Windows shall have an appropriate muntin pattern of 6/1 or 6/6 (large windows may be 8/8 or 8/1), and be similar to historic wood, double hung windows with dimensional, exterior muntins. Window pane size shall be a consistent proportion. Paired windows shall have an appropriate mullion of at least 8 inches.
5. Windows shall have the same inset on both the first and second floor similar to historic windows in the district.
6. Shutters shall be 1/2 the width of the single windows.
7. First and second floor wall finish materials shall be the same.
8. Recommend hip roof instead of gables.
9. Recommend round columns for front porch.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, reviewed this case, which was continued from the November HPB meeting. This proposal maintains the same floor plan but includes more Colonial Revival details to the project. He described the new Staff Recommendations illustrating these using the proposed elevations. Mr. Forbes stated that there are very rare instances that a Colonial Revival has two different exterior materials. He found only one example in a survey of contributing structures in the Historic District.

The Board discussed architectural styles in Orlando and discussed whether this style is considered Minimal Traditional, Coastal style or Colonial Revival. Mr. Forbes stated that the City Code states new construction in Historic Districts must have the same materials, scale, modulations, and style as historically present in Orlando.

Allen Arthur, 301 N. Fern Creek, Orlando, FL 32803, spoke as the applicant and architect. Mr. Arthur described different rooflines used in Colonial Revival architecture. He agrees with Staff Recommendations.

David Burkett, 1533 Nottingham Street, Orlando, FL 32803, spoke as the owner. He said that he has worked with the Board and the City regarding the easement. He asked the Board that if they do not like this submission to please give clear direction as opposed to a denial.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to staff conditions; and to AMEND conditions 8 and 9 to "Require" these conditions. Margaret Brock SECONDED the motion.

The Board discussed whether requiring a hip roof restricts flexibility of the design verses giving a clear direction. Mr. Forbes stated that additional modifications will be needed if the gable roof is utilized. The owner and applicant agree with this condition.

The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED by unanimous voice vote (7-0).

OTHER BUSINESS

- There were no General Appearances.
- Richard Forbes briefed the HPB on the Minor Reviews issued in November.
- Mr. Forbes announced that the Historic Preservation Awards will be given out in May. He asked the Board Members to help spread the word that the nomination period has begun. The deadline is March 20, 2015.
- Chairperson Wild encouraged the Board Members to more dialogue prior to voting on Motions, especially if voting "nay". The HPB also discussed the quality of recent submissions with Staff. The discussion also included the appropriate use of the Minor Review Committee and the Design Review Committee verse requiring cases returning to the full Board.


ADJOURNMENT

Dena Wild, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 6:20 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Kyle Shephard, Assistant City Attorney

Heather Hohman, Recording Secretary
Jason Burton, City Planning



Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer



Heather M. Hohman, Recording Secretary