

August 28, 2014

MEMORANDUM

TO:

David Billingsley, Chief Procurement Officer

FROM:

Karen Elzy, Senior Purchasing Agent

SUBJECT:

RFP14-0012, Real Estate Appraisal and Consulting Services

Please review / approve the attached Meeting Minutes for the subject Advisory Committee Meeting of August 25, 2014.

Approved:

ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES RFP14- 0012

for

Real Estate Appraisal & Consulting Services
Monday, August 25, 2014
4th Floor, Tarpon Conference Room
10:30 AM

1st Meeting of the Advisory Committee to review and evaluate responsive proposals submitted in response to RFP14-0012

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

Laurie Botts, Chair, Real Estate Division Clayton Green, Real Estate Division Roy Payne, City Attorney's Office Oren Henry, Housing & Community Development Lisa Henry, Streets & Stormwater Division

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT:

None

OTHERS PRESENT (CITY STAFF):

Karen Elzy, Senior Purchasing Agent, Procurement and Contracts Division Cynthia Jordan, Procurement and Contracts Division Dawn Chin Shue, Minority/Women Business Enterprise (arrived 1:00p.m.)

The Chair called the meeting to order at 10:35 a.m.

The Purchasing Agent introduced herself and took the following actions:

- A) Had all Committee Members, and other Staff to introduce themselves.
- B) Asked all attendees to sign the sign-in sheet.
- C) Indicated that all Ethics Forms had been completed and received, that there was a Quorum with 5 out of 5 Committee Members present, and that this meeting had been duly posted at least 48 hours in advance.

The Purchasing Agent reviewed some of the rules and requirements.

The Purchasing Agent indicated that there were 14 proposals submitted in response to this solicitation. Those firms submitting proposals are as follows:

- 1. First Capital Property Group, Inc.
- 2. Consortium Appraisal, Inc.
- 3. Callaway & Price, Inc.
- 4. Black Sun Valuation/Concordia Advisors

- 5. DeRango, Best & Associates
- 6. The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
- 7. Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.
- 8. Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.
- 9. CBRE, Inc.
- 10. Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.
- 11. Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
- 12. The Spivey Group, Inc.
- 13. All Real Estate Appraisal Company
- 14. Eminent Valuations, PLLC

The Purchasing Agent asked the Committee if Procurement should run D&B reports (indicating that there is a cost of approximately \$100 each to the using agency.) All Committee Members agreed that D&B Reports are not needed.

The Purchasing Agent advised the Committee that Client References Recap, the M/WBE summary, and Fee Summary were emailed to the Committee members previously for review.

DISCUSSION AND MOTIONS:

The Committee discussed scoring for the fee schedule evaluation factor. The Committee decided that each Committee member would make their own determination of evaluating the fee schedule as opposed to utilizing the Price Evaluation Formula found in Procurement Directive PUR-D-304, RFP Evaluation Process.

Discussions for each proposal ensued for the Brokerage and Management Services group followed by the Appraisal and Consulting Services group of the Request for Proposal. The Committee determined that the Proposers submitted for each group are as follows:

Appraisal and Consulting Services

- 1. First Capital Property Group, Inc.
- 2. Consortium Appraisal, Inc.
- 3. Callaway & Price, Inc.
- 4. Black Sun Valuation/Concordia Advisors
- 5. DeRango, Best & Associates
- 6. The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
- 7. Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.
- 8. Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.
- 9. CBRE, Inc.
- 10. Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.
- 11. Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
- 12. The Spivey Group, Inc.
- 13. All Real Estate Appraisal Company
- 14. Eminent Valuations, PLLC

Brokerage and Management Services

- 1. First Capital Property Group, Inc.
- 2. Consortium Appraisal, Inc.
- 3. Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.
- 4. Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.
- 5. CBRE, Inc.

The Purchasing Agent indicated that it appeared that all Proposers met the Minimum Mandatory Requirements.

The Committee discussed oral presentations. Clayton Green motioned to waive interviews, seconded by Lisa Henry. The motion carried unanimously.

The meeting recessed at 11:49 p.m. for lunch and re-adjourned at 1:13 p.m. with all committee members present.

Dawn Chin Shue, M/WBE representative, gave the committee a recap of M/WBE participation and explained the form and responses to the Committee. Attached is the MWBE Participation Summary. Discussion ensued. The Committee indicated that although two firms submitted a partial M/WBE plan, the Scope of Work indicated for the subcontractors are services that would not be utilized as a part of the contract but performed by other City departments contracts.

General discussion ensued.

After review and discussion, Karen Elzy distributed the scoring sheets to each Committee member for the Appraisal and Consulting Services group and the Brokerage and Management Services group separately. Each member individually completed his/her scoring sheets, scoring the price proposals last after all other factors were scored, and the results were tabulated on ranking forms and presented to the Committee. The ranking is as follows (with scoring and ranking sheets attached):

Appraisal and Consulting Services

- 1. The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
- 2. DeRango, Best & Associates
- 3. Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.
- 4. Consortium Appraisal, Inc.
- 5. Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.
- 6. The Spivey Group, Inc.
- 7. Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.
- 7. Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
- 9. CBRE, Inc.
- 10. First Capital Property Group, Inc.
- 10. All Real Estate Appraisal Company
- 12. Eminent Valuations, PLLC
- 13. Callaway & Price, Inc.
- 14. Black Sun Valuation/Concordia Advisors

Brokerage and Management Services

- 1. CBRE, Inc.
- 2. First Capital Property Group, Inc.
- 3. Consortium Appraisal, Inc.
- 4. Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.
- 5. Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.

The Committee reviewed the rankings. Discussion ensued.

A motion was made by Lisa Henry and seconded by Clayton Green to accept the ranking of and evaluations of the proposals, and recommend to City Council that the Chief Procurement Officer negotiate a contract with proposers ranked 1 through 9 in the

Appraisal and Consulting Services group and 1 through 5 in the Brokerage and Management Services group as indicated until successful. Discussion ensued. The motion passed unanimously.

A motion was made by Lisa Henry, seconded by Roy Payne to adjourn the meeting. The Meeting ended at 3:46 p.m.

These minutes are considered to be the official minutes of the RFP14-0012 Committee Meeting held on August 25, 2014, and no other notes, tapes, or other recordings taken by anyone takes precedence.

Submitted by:

Reviewed and Accepted by:

Karen Elzy

Procurement & Contracts Division

Assigned Procurement Representative

Laurie Botts

Real Estate Division

Chair

Attachment(s):

M/WBE Participation Summary

Reference Re-cap Fee Summary

Ranking and Scoring Sheets

MINORITY BUSINESS ENTERPRISE

PROJECT: REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL CONSULTING SERVICES RFP 14-0012

MBE GOAL: 18% WBE GOAL: 6%

PURCHASING AGENT: Karen Elzy DATE: 8/25/2014

The following are 14 the firms that submitted RFP.

1) All Real Estate Appraisal Company

Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work
		(Base)	
		Z*%	
			2000
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%	
	, 400	Y .	
	A STATE OF THE STA		
	A 1550 Y		
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		0%	
, da	3		

Remarks: M/WBE PARTICIPATION PLAN NOT SUBMITTED

2) Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.

Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work	
				·
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%		
***************************************				7
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		0%		

3) Callaway & Price, Inc.

Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%	
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		0%	30

Remarks: M/WBE PARTICIPATION PLAN NOT SUBMITTED

4) CBRE Group, Inc.

i) CDRE Group, me.		"West"	
Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work
Rhodes & Brito Architects, Inc.	MBE	18%	Architecture, CADD, Interior Space
	1000		Planning
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		18%	
A A			
problem to the second s			
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		0%	

Remarks: M/WBE PARTICIPATION PLAN SUBMITTED

WBE goal not met

5) Concordis Advisors

Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work
		<u> </u>	
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%	
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		0%	
			No. W

Remarks: M/WBE PARTICIPATION PLAN NOT SUBMITTED

6) Consortium Appraisal Incorporated

Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	% Scope o	f Work	
	Á			
	/ Page 2000	la.		
	Land A			
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%		
			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	No.			
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		0%		

7) CRM (Clayton, Roper, Marshall)

Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%	
77 1/4 1/4			
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		00/	
TOTAL WE FARTICIFATION		0%	

Remarks: M/WBE PARTICIPATION PLAN NOT SUBMITTED

8) DeRango, Best & Associates

o) Denango, Dest & Associates		4 <u> </u>		
Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work	
	, All and a second			
				~
	1000			
	C. VI			
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%		
				
				
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		0%		·
*	 			
***			L	

9) Eminent Valuations

Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%	
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		0%	Entering Control of the Control of t
			The state of the s

Remarks: M/WBE PARTICIPATION PLAN NOT SUBMITTED

10) First Capital Property Group, Inc.

Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work	-
				·
The same of the sa				
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%		-
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		0%		
·				

13) The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.

Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work	
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%		
Yvonne I. Froscher	WBE		Enviromental Consultant	
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		%		
TOTAL WE FARTICIPATION		70		

Remarks: M/WBE PARTICIPATION PLAN SUBMITTED

% of participation unknown

14) The Spivey Group, Inc

Subconsultants	MBE/WBE	%	Scope of Work	
				-
	**			
Constitution of the Consti	*		·	
TOTAL MBE PARTICIPATION		0%		
C. Y				
<i>y</i>				
TOTAL WBE PARTICIPATION		0%		

Remarks: M/WBE PARTICIPATION PLAN NOT SUBMITTED

* This is a summary of all the MWBE Participation Plans as was submitted in the proposal. This is not the confirmed MWBE Participation Plan.

REFERENCE FOR: ALL REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL COMPANY

	FDOT – District 5	Orange County	FDOT – District 2
 Briefly describe the nature of the services provided. 	or parcel specific basis as needed.	No Response.	Eminent Domain appraisal work, firm is on a 5-year district wide contract.
?. Contract Value?	Varies based on specific scope of project or parcels		Large
Did the vendor provide the service according to the project schedule and within Budget? (Yes/No)	Yes		Yes
. Is the project complete? (Yes/No)	Yes		Yes, One project is on-going in St. Johns County.
How would you rate the overall Service Level provided by the firm? (1-5) How would you rate	4		5
the quality and timeliness of service? (1-5))	4		5
 Were there any problems during the performance of the work? (Yes/No) 	No		No
Did the firm resolve issues in a satisfactory manner? (Yes/No)	N/A		Yes
How well did firm's staff perform? (1-5)	4		5
Did the firm meet your expectations? (Yes/No)	Yes		Yes
According to Contract requirementerms and conditions, please rate performance of the firm. (1-5)	4		5
Overall, would you enter into Contract with this firm again? (Yes/No)	Yes		Yes
2. Is there anything else you would like to share about the firm's capabilities?			Excellent Analysis of assigned projects prompt and professional.

RFP14-0012 – REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL CONSULTING SERVICES + REFERENCE FOR: BLACK SUN VALUATION/CONCORDIS ADVISORS

	DOTOR AND							
		County of Loudoun, VA	Atlanta Beitline	DCDGS	VA Dept General Srvs	PNC Bank		
Briefly describe the services provided.	nature of the	No Response.	No Response.	No Response.	The Commonwealth of Virginia has awarded a contract to Black Sun Valuation/Concordis Advisors, however we have NOT used their services as of yet. So therefore we will not be able to provide any feedback for your reference questionnaire at this time.	No Response.		
2. Contract Value?								
3. Did the vendor provid	le the service							
according to the proj	ect schedule							
and within Budget? ()				<u> </u>				
4. Is the project complete	e? (Yes/No)							
5. How would you rate	the overall							
Service Level provi	ded by the	İ						
firm? (1-5) How wo	uld you rate							
the quality and tirservice?	meiniess of							
(1-5))	1							
6. Were there any prob	olems during					•		
the performance of	the work?							
(Yes/No)								
7. Did the firm resolve								
satisfactory manner?								
8. How well did f	firm's staff							
perform? (1-5)			·	<u> </u>				
	meet your							
expectations? (Yes/	No)							
10. According to Contra	act requireme							
terms and conditions								
11. Overall, would you								
Contract with this						•		
(Yes/No)	mm agam:	ļ						
12. Is there anything else	e you would							
like to share about	the firm's							
capabilities?		1		F .	l i			

REFERENCE FOR: BLEDSOE & EBAUGH, INC.

	Orlando Health	GOAA	Orange Cty Expressway Authority	City of Winter Park	Dr. Phillips, Inc.	Orange Cty Public Schools	FL Comm, Bank	United Legacy Bank
Briefly describe the nature of services provided.	the Real Propperty Appraisal/Consulting.	The appraisal of commercial non-aviation and aviation properties at Orlando International Airport and Orlando Executive Airport.	No Response.	Appraisal services on various City owned properties.	Real estate appraisal and valuation services.	OCPS policy does not permit me to comment or rate vendors for this purpose.	Appraisal services included Real Estate Valuation for new or existing loans as well as RO properties	No Response.
2. Contract Value?	\$500-\$15,000	Varied from \$2,500 to \$6,000		\$2,000 - \$4,000 per job	\$5,000.00		N/A Services are provide on a Fee and Time basis.	
3. Did the vendor provide the serv according to the project sched	ice Lie Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes		Yes	
and within Budget? (Yes/No)	o) Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes		Yes	
4. Is the project complete? (Yes/N 5. How would you rate the ove		1						
Service Level provided by firm? (1-5) How would you i	the 5	1		5	5		5	:
the quality and timeliness service?		.1		5	5			
6. Were there any problems dur the performance of the wo (Yes/No)	ng k? No	No		No	No		No	
7. Did the firm resolve issues in satisfactory manner? (Yes/No)	Yes Yes			Yes	Yes		Yes	
8. How well did firm's st perform? (1-5)	aff 5	1		5	5		4	
9. Did the firm meet ye expectations? (Yes/No)	Yes	Yes, Requested all necessary information at the beginning of the assignment and prepared a very thorough and complete report with credible value estimates on schedule.	-	Yes	Yes		Yes	
10. According to Contract requirements and conditions, please performance of the firm. (1-5)	eme rate 5	1		5	5		4	
11. Overall, would you enter i Contract with this firm aga (Yes/No)	n? Yes			Yes	Yes		Yes	
12. Is there anything else you wo like to share about the first capabilities?		DeRango, Best & Associates is on the Authority's approved appraiser list.						

REFERENCE FOR: CALLAWAY & PRICE, INC.

	FDOT District 1	Brevard County	Viera Company	Craig McKinnin	FDOT District 4
Briefly describe the nature of the services provided.	Appraisal	General Appraisal Services as requested.	No Response.	No Response.	No Response.
2. Contract Value?	\$155,490.00	No cap.			
3. Did the vendor provide the service according to the project schedule and within Budget? (Yes/No)	Yes	Yes			
4. Is the project complete? (Yes/No)	No	Yes			
5. How would you rate the overall Service Level provided by the firm? (1-5) How would you rate the quality and timeliness of service?	3	4			
(1-5)) 6. Were there any problems during the performance of the work? (Yes/No)	Yes	No			
7. Did the firm resolve issues in a satisfactory manner? (Yes/No)	Yes	Yes			
B. How well did firm's staff perform? (1-5)	3	4			
D. Did the firm meet your expectations? (Yes/No)	Yes	Yes			
According to Contract requireme terms and conditions, please rate performance of the firm. (1-5)	5	5			
1. Overall, would you enter into Contract with this firm again? (Yes/No)	Yes	Yes			
12. Is there anything else you would like to share about the firm's capabilities?	·	Callaway & Price is a very competent and professional firm.			

REFERENCE FOR: CBRE, INC.

		Keybank	Sun Trust Bank	City of Pensacola	State of FL-Dept Mangmt Srvs	HD Supply, Inc.
Briefly describe the n services provided.	ature of the	Appraisal services for commercial real estate.	Company doesn't do recommendations in writing.		Real estate consultant and tenant broker services.	No Response.
2. Contract Value?				Commission based on lease value.	\$10 million	
3. Did the vendor provide according to the proje	ct schedule	Yes		Yes	Yes	
and within Budget? (Ye 4. Is the project complete:	es/No)	Yes		No	No	
5. How would you rate Service Level provid	the overall			5	5	
firm? (1-5) How wou the quality and tim service?	ild you rate	5		5	4	
(1-5)) 6. Were there any proble the performance of (Yes/No)	lems during the work?			No	No	
7. Did the firm resolve satisfactory manner? (Yes			Yes	
	rm's staff	5		5	5	
	neet your lo)	Yes		Yes	Yes	
10. According to Contra- terms and conditions, performance of the fir	ct requireme , please rate	5		5	5	
11. Overall, would you Contract with this f (Yes/No)	enter into	Yes		Yes	Yes	
12. Is there anything else like to share about capabilities?		Very good results, accurate, delivers on time, fees good.		Very professional and depth of experience is a great asset.		

REFERENCE FOR: CLAYTON, ROPER & MARSHALL, INC.

£14.

	U.S. Navy	Seminole County	Brevard County	Orange County (William K. Hurt, Jr.) FDOT (C. Jack Adkins)-Same place/reference
Briefly describe the nature of the services provided.	Appraisal services in support of potential condemnation action in Leesburg, Florida.	No Response.	Appraisal preparation and expert witness testimony.	This is firm is under a 5 year continuing services district wide contract for appraisal services. This is not a project specific contract but is used to contract for specific projects or parcels as needed.
2. Contract Value?	\$42,660.00	·	Clayton, Ropert & Marshall have a continuing contract with the County and we have used their services on numerous occasions. The amount for each appraisal assignment is negotiated.	No specific value. Funds are encumbered based on a specific fee proposal for a specific job.
B. Did the vendor provide the service according to the project schedule	Yes		Yes	Yes
and within Budget? (Yes/No)	Yes		Yes	Yes
4. Is the project complete? (Yes/No)				
5. How would you rate the overal Service Level provided by the firm? (1-5) How would you rate	5		5	4
the quality and timeliness of service? (1-5))	5		5	. 4
 Were there any problems during the performance of the work' (Yes/No) 	No		No	No
7. Did the firm resolve issues in a satisfactory manner? (Yes/No)	Yes		Yes	N/A
B. How well did firm's staff perform? (1-5)	5		5	4
9. Did the firm meet you expectations? (Yes/No)	Yes		Yes, The County Attorney's Office uses Clayton, Roper & Marshall for our most challenging appraisal assignments. Examples include eminent domain trials in which juries have 100% of the time returned verdicts in favor of the County based on this firm's appraisal testimony; Stadium appraisals; railroad right of way appraisals.	Yes
 According to Contract requires terms and conditions, please rat performance of the firm. (1-5) 			5	4
1. Overall, would you enter into Contract with this firm again? (Yes/No)	Yes		Yes	Yes
2. Is there anything else you would like to share about the firm's capabilities?			We doubt you will find a better quality, more knowledgeable appraisal firm with the breadth of experience enjoyed by this firm.	

REFERENCE FOR: CONSORTIUM APPRAISAL, INC.

	Shutts & Bowen	Lowndes Drosdick	John Conner	Gordon Harris
Briefly describe the nature of the services provided.	his firm acts as the review appraiser for all appraisals prepared for the Wekiva Parkway project. Furthermore, I have retained Mr. Collison and his firm on behalf of my client the Sanford Airport Authority for appraisal work and expert witness work.	No Response.	Appraisal services regarding numerous commercial buildings, kiosks, as well as the value of easements on private commercial property.	Valuation Services in eminent domain cases.
2. Contract Value?	I believe the contract value for Consortium is \$200,000, plus renewals are routinely provided as needed for the Central Florida Expressway Authority.		Work was performed at an hourly rate of \$250.	
Did the vendor provide the service according to the project schedule			Yes	Yes
and within Budget? (Yes/No) 4. Is the project complete? (Yes/No)	No		Yes	Yes & No
How would you rate the overall Service Level provided by the	5		5	5
firm? (1-5) How would you rate the quality and timeliness of service? (1-5))	5		5	5
 Were there any problems during the performance of the work? (Yes/No) 	No		No	No
7. Did the firm resolve issues in a satisfactory manner? (Yes/No)	Yes		Yes	Yes
8. How well did firm's staff perform? (1-5)			5	5
9. Did the firm meet your expectations? (Yes/No)	Yes, Mr. Collison and his staff provide a level of expertise and service that is rare today. No matter what the requirements, timeline, etc., Mr. Collison and his staff will provide a timely, accurate work products.		Yes, Professional work done timely and to the highest standards.	Yes
 According to Contract requirem terms and conditions, please rate performance of the firm. (1-5) 	ne e		5	5
11. Overall, would you enter into Contract with this firm again? (Yes/No)			Yes	Yes
12. Is there anything else you would like to share about the firm's capabilities?			I have engaged this company on multiple occasions and have received excellent services every time. I would absolutely engage them the next time the opportunity arises	The Best!

REFERENCE FOR: DERANGO, BEST & ASSOCIATES

		Orange Cty Real Estate	City of Ocoee	OUC	Greater Orlando Aviation Auth	City of Altamonte Springs
Briefly describe the services provided.	nature of the	No Response.	Real Estate Appraisal Services	Real Estate appraisal and valuation advise.	The appraisal of commercial non- aviation and aviation properties at Orlando International Airport and Orlando Executive Airport.	Appraisal of Real Property.
2. Contract Value?			Over \$100k over the course of several years.	\$10,000	Varied from \$2,500.00 to \$6,000.00	\$5,000
3. Did the vendor providaccording to the pro	ect schedule		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
and within Budget? (Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4. Is the project complet 5. How would you rate Service Level prov	the overall ded by the		5	5	5	5
firm? (1-5) How we the quality and ti service? (1-5))	meliness of		5	5	5	5
 Were there any pro- the performance of (Yes/No) 	f the work?		No	No	No	No
7. Did the firm resolve satisfactory manner?			Yes	N/A		Yes
8. How well did perform? (1-5)	firm's staff		5	5	1	5
	meet your No)		Yes	Yes, Performed tasks as requested in high functioning manner.	Yes, Requested all necessary information at the beginning of the assignment and prepared a very thorough and complete report with credible value estimates on schedule.	Yes
10. According to Contracterms and condition performance of the f	s, please rate		5	5	1	5
11. Overall, would you Contract with this (Yes/No)	enter into		Yes	Yes		Yes
12. Is there anything els like to share about capabilities?			Fantastic work & service.		DeRango, Best & Associates is on the Authority's approved appraiser list.	We are very pleased with DeRango, Best. We continue to us them.

ě.

REFERENCE FOR: EMINENT VALUATIONS, PLLC

	ADI PARA CEPTOR: EMINENT TADORITORE, I DEC							
		ida Dept of Transportation Lee Lobban	Florida Dept of Transportation George Burgess	Orange County REM	Lake County Neighborhood Stabilization Program			
. Briefly describe the nature services provided.	Real H	Estate Appraisal Services – Estate Consulting and Expert SS Services	No Response.	No Response.	No Response.			
Contract Value?		\$100,000 - \$300,000						
Did the vendor provide the saccording to the project sch and within Budget? (Yes/No	nedule	Yes						
Is the project complete? (Yes		Yes						
How would you rate the of Service Level provided by firm? (1-5) How would you the quality and timelines	overall by the ou rate	5						
service? (1-5))		3						
Were there any problems of the performance of the (Yes/No)	work?	No						
Did the firm resolve issues satisfactory manner? (Yes/N	(o)	Yes						
How well did firm's perform? (1-5)		5						
Did the firm meet expectations? (Yes/No)	many	The company has performed projects for me and has completed the work on						
 According to Contract recterms and conditions, plear performance of the firm. (1- 	se rate	. 5						
Overall, would you enter Contract with this firm a (Yes/No)	again?	Yes						
2. Is there anything else you like to share about the capabilities?	firm's knowle and go	are competent and adgeable of appraisal process and at solving problems and inicating with client.						

REFERENCE FOR: FIRST CAPITAL PROPERTY GROUP, INC.

		City of Orlando	Excelsior Capital	First Southern Bank	Metropolitan Bureau
Briefly describe the services provided.	nature of the	Withdraw-conflict of interest.	Appraisal/Broker opinion of value, receiver, property management, leasing agent and selling agent.	Management, leasing & brokerage of commercial properties.	No Response.
2. Contract Value?			Ongoing but budgeted to be in excess of \$150,000.00	Commission basis on sale of property.	
 Did the vendor provid according to the proj and within Budget? () 	ect schedule		Yes	Yes	
4. Is the project complete			Yes & No, Some projects have been completed and some remain in progress.	Both. Several complete, several active.	
5. How would you rate Service Level provi firm? (1-5) How wo the quality and ti service? (1-5))	ded by the uld you rate		5	5	
6. Were there any prob the performance of (Yes/No)			No	No	
7. Did the firm resolve satisfactory manner?			N/A	N/A	
8. How well did perform? (1-5)			5	5	
	meet your No)	·	Yes, Very responsive and have hit all project objectives to date.	Yes	
10. According to Contr terms and conditions performance of the fi	s, please rate		5	5	
11. Overall, would you Contract with this (Yes/No)	enter into		Yes	Yes, absolutely	
12. Is there anything else like to share about capabilities?			The firm seems very cost aware and has impressed my firm with its efficiency.	Strong Team. I highly & enthusiastically recommend.	

REFERENCE FOR: PINEL & CARPENTER, INC.

		Orange Cty Expressway Authority	Orlando International Airport	Orange Cty Public Schools	Orange Cty BCC	Orlando Magic
Briefly describe the reservices provided.	nature of the	No Response.	Multiple appraisal services for commercial properties and easements.	W. Carpenter has worked with my firm in representing condoning authorities and property owners in complex condoning cases	This is a 5 year district wide contract to provide appraisal services on projects as needed. This is not a project specific contract.	No Response.
2. Contract Value?			Varies by job but ranges between \$3,000 and \$20,000.	Approximately \$150,000.00 - \$175,000.00 Additional Question from before: What do you mean by contract value? The value of the services or the amount of the contracts. Mr. Carpenter has worked for my firm for several years, and since 2005 he has worked as my expert witness in my representation of Orange County Public Schools. OCPS directs its outside counsel to retain experts, and over the period of time since 2005 I am sure that Mr. Carpenter has been paid in excess of \$150,000.00, but there is no continuing contract. He is retained by me as the District's counsel on a case by case basis. I don't know that I can get you an exact figure if you need to know the amount of his contracts. Thanks.—Jay	Varies depending on the project.	
3. Did the vendor provide according to the proje and within Budget? (Y	ect schedule		Yes	Yes-	Yes	
4. Is the project complete			Yes	Yes	Yes	
5. How would you rate Service Level provide firm? (1-5) How won the quality and tire service?	the overall ded by the all you rate		5	5 5	4	
(1-5)) 6. Were there any prob the performance of	lems during the work?		No	No	No	
(Yes/No) 7. Did the firm resolve satisfactory manner? (Yes	Yes	N/A	
	irm's staff		5	5	4	
	meet your		Yes	Yes, Walter Carpenter has also related as an expert witness and has been very skillful in assisting me in properties was to guider.	Yes	
10. According to Contra terms and conditions performance of the fi	, please rate		5	5	4	
11. Overall, would you Contract with this (Yes/No)	enter into		Yes	Yes	Yes	
12. Is there anything else like to share about capabilities?				Walter Carpenter has a good understand of what lawyers do, and as a result is one of the best expert witnesses with whom I have		

REFERENCE FOR: REAL ESTATE RESEARCH CONSULTANTS, INC.

	City of Orlando	City of Bradenton	RIDA Corporation	City of Cocoa	City of Kissimmee
I. Briefly describe the nature of the services provided.	Withdraw-conflict of interest.	No Response.	No Response.	No Response.	Financial analysis for the CRA.
. Contract Value?					\$25,000/Year
Did the vendor provide the service according to the project schedule					Yes
and within Budget? (Yes/No) Is the project complete? (Yes/No)					No
How would you rate the overall					5
Service Level provided by the firm? (1-5) How would you rate the quality and timeliness of					4
service? (1-5))					
Were there any problems during the performance of the work? (Yes/No)					No
7. Did the firm resolve issues in a satisfactory manner? (Yes/No)			·		
How well did firm's staff perform? (1-5)					5
Did the firm meet your expectations? (Yes/No)			·		Yes
O. According to Contract requireme terms and conditions, please rate					4
performance of the firm. (1-5) 1. Overall, would you enter into Contract with this firm again?					Yes
(Yes/No) 2. Is there anything else you would					
like to share about the firm's capabilities?					<u> </u>

REFERENCE FOR: THE SPIVEY GROUP, INC.

	FDOT - District 4-Victor Ramos	FDOT - District 5-Sumter Cty	FDOT – District 2-Satsuma, Putnam Cty	Orange County
Briefly describe the nature of services provided.	the No Response.	Appraisal services for the purposes of eminent domain acquisitions.	Eminent domain appraisal work firm is on a 5-year district wide contract.	No Response.
2. Contract Value?		\$200,000 +	Large	
3. Did the vendor provide the serv according to the project sched and within Budget? (Yes/No)	ice ule	Yes	Yes	
4. Is the project complete? (Yes/N	0)	Yes	No, Still have updates for O.T. and D.O.D.	
5. How would you rate the over Service Level provided by firm? (1-5) How would you r	the	. 5	5	
the quality and timeliness service?	of	5	5	
6. Were there any problems dur the performance of the wor (Yes/No)	ing rk?	No	No	
7. Did the firm resolve issues in satisfactory manner? (Yes/No)	1 a	Yes	Yes	
8. How well did firm's st perform? (1-5)	aff	5	5	
	our	Yes	Yes	
10. According to Contract requirements and conditions, please performance of the firm. (1-5)	rate	5	5	
11. Overall, would you enter in Contract with this firm again (Yes/No)	nto	Yes	Yes	
12. Is there anything else you would like to share about the firm capabilities?	n's	Excellent capabilities and experience.	Firm has also been assigned appraisal review on 1 project.	

REFERENCE FOR: THE APPRAISAL GROUP OF CENTRAL FLORIDA, INC.

	 	City of Orlando	Florida Dept Transp D5	OOCEA	Florida Dept Transp D II	Lake Cty Government
Briefly describe the services provided.	nature of the	Withdraw-conflict of interest.	This is a 5 year district wide contract to provide appraisal services on projects as needed. This is not a project specific contract.	Expert witness valuation services.	Eminent domain appraisal work. Firm is on a 5-year district wide contract.	Appraisal review an consulting been using for about 7-8 years. Alway available for us.
2. Contract Value?			Varies depending on the project.	>\$150,000.00	Large	Approximately \$40,000 annually
3. Did the vendor provid according to the pro	ect schedule		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
and within Budget? () 4. Is the project complet	Yes/No) e? (Yes/No)		Yes	No	Yes, Two projects are still on-going.	Yes
						5
5. How would you rate Service Level provi firm? (1-5) How wo	ded by the		4	4	5	5
the quality and ti	meliness of		4	4	5	
(1-5)) 6. Were there any prolethe performance of (Yes/No)		·	No	No	No	No
7. Did the firm resolve			N/A	Yes	Yes	Yes
	firm's staff		4	4	5	5
	meet your		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
expectations? (Yes/ 10. According to Contr terms and condition	act requireme s, please rate		4	4	5	5
performance of the f 11. Overall, would you Contract with this	n enter into		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
(Yes/No) 12. Is there anything els like to share abou capabilities?					Very prompt and professional service.	Outstanding performance work always accurate and or time. Highly recommend.

REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL CONSULTING SERVICES FEE SCHEDULE

Respondent:	espondent:			First Capita	Property Group, Inc.	Consortium	n Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway	& Price, Inc.		ack Sun oncordis Advisors	DeRango, Be	est & Associates
Respondent's City & State:				Orlando, FL		Winter Park, FL		Indialantic, FL		Atlanta, GA		Orlando, FL	
Description	Unit	Estimated Quant.	Item	Rate Total		Rate Total		Rate Total		Rate	Total	Rate	Total
Appraisal a	and Consultii	ng Services		4 (100 pc) - 100	(1) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1) (1)			Single Single Shipping the Single Single				1848 - 1848 1848 - 1848	
Appraisal Services	Per Hour	100	1	N/A		\$ 250.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 120.00	\$ 12,000.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 10,000.00
Consulting Services	Per Hour	100	2	\$ 150.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 140.00	\$ 14,000.00	\$ 180.00	\$ 18,000.00
Expert Witness	Per Hour	100	3	\$ 225.00	\$ 22,500.00	\$ 275.00	\$ 27,500.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 200.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 250.00	\$ 25,000.00
Associate Fee	Per Hour	100	4	\$ 50.00	\$ 5,000.00	\$ 225.00	\$ 22,500.00	\$ 175.00	\$ 17,500.00	\$ 65.00	\$ 6,500.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 10,000.00
· Su	btotal for App	oraisal and Con	suiting Services:		\$ 42,500.00		\$ 100,000.00		\$ 77,500.00)	\$ 52,500.00		\$ 63,000.00
Brokerage a	and Managem	ent Services					A A COMPANIENCE CONTRACTOR CONTRA			ni (Maria) Kangaran Kanasan		Leginos 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 10	
Description		Scenario	Item	Rate %	Annual Fee	Rate %	Annual Fee	Rate %	Annual Fee	Rate %	Annual Fee	Rate %	Annual Fee
Property Management Fee	\$	12,000.00	5	3.5%	\$ 420.00	8.5%	\$1,020.00				·		N/A
Commission Rate Residential	\$2	200,000.00	6	3.5%	\$ 7,000.00	6%	\$12,000.00						N/A
Commission Rate Commercial	\$1	,000,000.00	7 .	3.0%	\$ 30,000.00	5%	\$50,000.00						N/A
Subtotal for B	rokerage and	Property Mana	gement Services:		\$ 37,420.00		\$63,020.00						
	то	TAL ESTIMATE	ANNUAL COST:		\$ 79,920.00		\$ 163,020.00		\$ 77,500.0	0	\$ 52,500.00	S Paul H	\$ 63,000.00

REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL CONSULTING SERVICES FEE SCHEDULE

Respondent:				The		Group of Central ida, Inc.	Bledsoe &	Ebai	ugh, Inc.	Claytor	n, Roper	& Marshall, Inc.	СВ	RE, In	ic.	Pinel & Ca	ırpen	ter, Inc.
Respondent's City & State:				Altamonte Springs, FL		Winter Park, FL		Altamonte Springs, FL		Orlando, FL		Orlando, FL		FL				
Description	Unit	Estimated Quant.	Item	F	Rate	Total	Rate		Total	Rat	te	Total	Rate		Total	Rate		Total
Appraisal and	l Consultin	g Services						2011 1					19 14 24 2 17 12 24 2		rom Aller of the		12 11 (1)	
Appraisal Services	Per Hour	100	1	\$	150.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 175.00	\$	17,500.00	\$	200.00	\$ 20,000.00	.\$ 150.00	\$	15,000.00	\$ 275.00	\$	27,500.00
Consulting Services	Per Hour	100	2	\$	150.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 175.00	\$	17,500.00	\$	200.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 250.00	\$	25,000.00	\$ 275.00	\$	27,500.00
Expert Witness	Per Hour	100	3	\$	150.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 200.00	\$	20,000.00	\$	200.00	\$ 20,000.00	\$ 450.00	\$	45,000.00	\$ 300.00	\$	30,000.00
Associate Fee	Per Hour	100	4	\$	100.00	\$ 10,000.00	\$ 100.00	\$	10,000.00	\$	175.00	\$ 17,500.00	\$ 150.00	\$	15,000.00	\$ 150.00	\$	15,000.00
Subto	tal for App	raisal and Con	sulting Services:			\$ 55,000.00		\$	65,000.00			\$ 77,500.00		\$	100,000.00		\$	100,000.00
Brokerage and	l Managem	ent Services			ji k					1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	un in de la	$\left\{ \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \right)^{2} + \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \right\} = \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2} \right)$	10 m 15 2 3 m 2 m 2 m 2 m 2 m 2 m 2 m 2 m 2 m 2	en North	deri Gran			
Description	s	cenario	Item	R	late %	Annual Fee	Rate %		Annual Fee	Rat	e %	Annual Fee	Rate %	1	Annual Fee	Rate %	A	Annual Fee
Property Management Fee	\$1	12,000.00	5				4%	\$	480.00			N/A	3%	\$	360.00			N/A
Commission Rate Residential	\$2	00,000.00	6				4%	\$	8,000.00	10)%	\$ 20,000.00	N/A					N/A
Commission Rate Commercial	\$1,	000,000.00	7				6%	\$	60,000.00	10)%	\$ 100,000.00	3.5%	\$	35,000.00			N/A
Subtotal for Brok	erage and	Property Mana	gement Services:					\$	68,480.00			\$ 120,000.00		\$	35,360.00			
	TÔT	AL ESTIMATEI	O ANNUAL COST:	30		\$ 55,000.00		\$	133,480.00		i sia	\$ 197,500.00		\$	135,360.00		\$	100,000.00

CITY OF ORLANDO PROCUREMENT CONTRACTS RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL CONSULTING SERVICES FEE SCHEDULE

Respondent:				Real Esta Consul				The Spive	y Gro	oup, Inc.	AII R	teal Estate /	Appra	aisal Company	/ Eminent Valuations, PLLC									
Respondent's City & State:	•			Orla	ndo,	FL		Orla	ndo,	FL	Orlando, FL			FL	Longwood, FL			, FL						
Description	Unit	Estimated Quant.	ltem	Rate		Total		Rate		Total		Rate		Total		Total		Total		Total		Rate		Total
Appraisal and	d Consultin	g Services	Approximate the second				ri dia	out 6	i Kanka	CONSTRUCTION		1 m					÷	ni ne da						
Appraisal Services	Per Hour	100	1	\$ 165.00	\$	16,500.00	\$	80.00	\$	8,000.00	\$	150.00	\$	15,000.00	\$	100.00	\$	10,000.00						
Consulting Services	Per Hour	100	2	\$ 225.00	\$	22,500.00	\$	75.00	\$	7,500.00	\$	150.00	\$	15,000.00	\$	75.00	\$	7,500.00						
Expert Witness	Per Hour	100	3	\$ 295.00	\$	29,500.00	\$	160.00	\$	16,000.00	\$	150.00	\$	15,000.00	\$	150.00	\$	15,000.0						
Associate Fee	Per Hour	100	4	\$ 195.00	\$	19,500.00	\$	120.00	\$	12,000.00	\$	110.00	\$	11,000.00	\$	50.00	\$	5,000.0						
Subto	otal for App	raisal and Cons	sulting Services:		\$	88,000.00			\$	43,500.00			\$	56,000.00			\$	37,500.0						
Brokerage and	i Managem	ent Services		The first his second and the second	V.		164) I	an energy and	14	da Parise	K. 14-2				010.7			(Eugh						
Description		Scenario	Item	Rate %		Annual Fee		Rate %	,	Annual Fee		Rate %		Annual Fee		Rate %	A	Annual Fee						
Property Management Fee	\$	12,000.00	5			N/A								N/A				N/A						
Commission Rate Residential	\$2	200,000.00	6			N/A								N/A				N/A						
Commission Rate Commercial	\$1,	000,000.00	7			N/A								N/A				N/A						
Subtotal for Brok	erage and	Property Manag	gement Services														Ī							
	TO 1	TAL ESTIMATED	ANNUAL COST		\$	88,000.00			5	43,500.00			\$	56,000.00			\$	37,500.0						

RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL & CONSULTING SERVICES Appraisal & Consulting Services Group - Ranking Tally

Committee Member	Laurie Botts	Clayton Green	Roy Payne	Oren Henry	Lisa Henry	Total	Ranking
Proposer First Capital Property Group, Inc.	9	2	14	11	12	48	10
Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	5	10	3	2	4	24	4
Callaway & Price, Inc.	12	14	12	6	13	57	13
Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	13	13	11	13	14	64	14
DeRango, Best & Associates	2	3	1	3	9	18	2
The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.	1)	4	6	1	13	1
Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.	4	8	7	4	7	30	5
Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	10	6	6	13	2	37	7
CBRE, Inc.	6	7	13	6	6	38	9
Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	3	4	2_	9	4	22	3
Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.	7]]	5	11	3	37	7
The Spivey Group, Inc.	8	5	8)	11	33	6
All Real Estate Appraisal Company	11	9	10	10	8	48	10
Eminent Valuations, PLLC	14	12	. 9	4	10	49	12

RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL AND CONSULTING SERVICES EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR RFP14-0012

Appraisal Consulting Services Group - Ranking Tally

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	First Capital Property Group, Inc.	Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway & Price, Inc.	Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	35	40	20	780	40	MO
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	Z,S	35	16	15	35	35
3	Fee Schedule	18	15	15	14	44	(8	18
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	Ø	D	©	0	0	1
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	Ð	0	©	•	Ø
,	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	0	0	0	0	0	0
ANKIN (#1 re	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	75	90	50	49	93	94
ATE:	8/25/14		9	٩	(12)	(3)	(2)	0

DATE:	125/14	<u> </u>	 .
EVALUATOR:	Laurie Botts	OF	
(print name)	Laurin Ball		
SIGNATURE			

EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR RFP14-0012

Appraisal Consulting Services Group - Ranking Tally

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	CBRE, Inc.	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	39	30	3.5	40	35
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	34	3 0	32	35	30
3	Fee Schedule	18	18	3	16	(7	16
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	Ó	0	4.	©	©
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	Ø	Ø	0	0	0
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	0	0	0	0	0
ANKII (#1 re	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS effects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	91	13	BH	92	81
ΔΤΕ.			9	(D)	9	(3	69
	DR: ne)		OF	·			

RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL AND CONSULTING SERVICES **EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR RFP14-0012** Appraisal Consulting Services Group - Ranking Tally

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	The Spivey Group, Inc.	All Real Estate Appraisal Company	Eminent Valuations, PLLC
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	32	27	18
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	30	29	15
3 .	Fee Schedule	18	14	(%	4 4
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	10	Ø	Ø
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	O	©	0
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	. 0	0	0
	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is the highest point value; etc.)	he next	76	725	47
ATE:			@		(3)
/ALUATO	R:		OF		

DATE:		_	S
EVALUATOR:	OF		1772
(print name)			
SIGNATURE:			

RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL AND CONSULTING SERVICES **EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR RFP14-0012** Appraisal Consulting Services Group - Ranking Tally

		Possible	First Capital Property Group, Inc.	Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway & Price, Inc.	Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
NO.	FACTOR	Points						
	Experience, qualifications,				:			

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	Priest Capital Property Group, Inc.	Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway & Price, Inc.	Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	25	40	30	30	40	37
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	30	35	30	30	35	33
3	Fee Schedule	18	18	15	17	18	17	18
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts		0	0	D	D	D	1
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	D	D	D	D	D	0
-	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	¥ 73	790	× 77	y 7 <i>8</i>	# 92	» 89
RANKIN (#1 rel	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS lects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	14	3	12	11	1	4

DATE: 8/25/14	l
EVALUATOR: PAYNE OF OF	W. T. C.
SIGNATURE:	

RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL AND CONSULTING SERVICES EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR RFP14-0012

Appraisal Consulting Services Group - Ranking Tally

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	CBRE, Inc.	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	38	38	25	40	40
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	32	33	33	35	30
3	Fee Schedule	18	16	16	16	16	18
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	0	l	D	0
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0	D	0	\mathcal{D}
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	× 86	×87	K 75	× 91	# 88°
RANKIN (#1 re	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	7	6	13	2	5

DATE: 8/25/	114		
EVALUATOR:(print name)	Roy Vay11	OF	
SIGNATURE:	3	<u> </u>	

RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL AND CONSULTING SERVICES EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR RFP14-0012 Appraisal Consulting Services Group - Ranking Tally

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	The Spivey Group, Inc.	All Real Estate Appraisal Company	Eminent Valuations, PLLC
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	37	34	35
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	32	30	30
3	Fee Schedule	18	16	17	17
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	D	D
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	D	D	D
	TOTAL POINT VALUE 100		× 85	481	482
RANKI (#1 r	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS effects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	8	\$ 10	9	

DATE: 8	45/14			
EVALUATOR:	Roy	PAIRE	OF	
(print name)			_	
SIGNATURE:	1	4CC	<u>></u>	

RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL AND CONSULTING SERVICES EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR RFP14-0012

Appraisal Consulting Services Group - Ranking Tally

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	First Capital Property Group, Inc.	Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway & Price, Inc.	Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	20	38	18	10	30	3 8
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	20	33	20	15	30	33
3	Fee Schedule	18	16	+	9	113	Vl	12
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	6	©	0	O	(
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0	0	Ô	0	700
,	FOTAL POINT VALUE	100	56.80	781	47/	38 N	7118	84 0
RANKIN (#1 rei	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	12	重4~	B	14	9	1

DATE: 825/14

EVALUATOR: LISO HEDRY OF STREETS & STORMWORTER

SIGNATURE: SIGNATURE: STORMWORTER

OF STREETS & STORMWORTER

RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL AND CONSULTING SERVICES EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR RFP14-0012 Appraisal Consulting Services Group - Ranking Tally

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	CBRE, Inc.	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	34	38	35	38	37
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	30	33	3 <u>0</u>	33	33
3	Fee Schedule	18	10	9	8	7	9
i .	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	0	ゴ	0	0
	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	۵	Q	0	Q
7	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	74/2	808	米米	78 /	79 8
RANKIN (#1 ref	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS lects the highest point value; #2 is the highest point value; etc.)	he next	等 环	2	74	4.	3

DATE: 8 25 14	
EVALUATOR: LISO HENTY	of Streets a Storm water
(print name) SIGNATURE:	
	

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	The Spivey Group, Inc.	All Real Estate Appraisal Company	Eminent Valuations, PLLC
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	25	30	25
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	25	30	25
3	Fee Schedule	18	16	V2_	US.
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	0	0
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	Ō	0	つ
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	669	72 /	68 9
	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	ll	8	10

DATE: 8 25 14	
EVALUATOR: LISO HENTY	OF Streets & Stormwater
(print name) SIGNATURE:	

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	First Capital Property Group, Inc.	Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway & Price, Inc.	Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	40	33	30	30	40	40
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	35	35	30	30	35	35
3	Fee Schedule	18	18	15	16	17	16	18
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts		0	0	0	D	0	1
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0	0	0	0	0
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	193	13	670	64	19	M
RANKIN (#1 re	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	2	10	14	13	3	

EVALUATOR: CLASSIC OF REN ESTITE	MANGEMENT
(print name) SIGNATURE:	

RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL AND CONSULTING SERVICES

EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS FOR RFP14-0012

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	CBRE, Inc.	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	34	36	35	40	32
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	35	35	35	35	35
3	Fee Schedule	18	16	Île	15	15	15
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts		0	0		0	
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0	0	0	0
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	85	87	86	890	88
RANKIN (#1 re	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	8	6	7	4	

DATE:EVALUATOR:	8/25/14 CLAYODN	ORTED OF	Ral	ESTA	Mangener
(print name) SIGNATURE:	Wang	halo			
	000				

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	The Spivey Group, Inc.	All Real Estate Appraisal Company	Eminent Valuations, PLLC
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	35	31	30
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	35	35	30
3	Fee Schedule	18	18	18	18
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	0	0
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0	0
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	286	84	1
ANKI (#1 re	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS eflects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	5	9	12)

8/25/14	
DATE: OF STAN OF	REAL ESPORTE MANAGE MAY
(print name)	
SIGNATURE:	

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	First Capital Property Group, Inc.	Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway & Price, Inc.	Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	35	40	35	30	35	35
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	25	35	35	30	35	300
3	Fee Schedule	18	17	B	10	15	12	14
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts		O	0	O	0	0	1
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0	0	0	0	6
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	+77	* 83	* 80	275	# 8Z	→ 8 ₫
RANKIN (#1 re	IG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is thighest point value; etc.)	he next	//	2	6	/3	3	6

DATE: 8/25/2014		
EVALUATOR: OREN HENEY	of Housing	
(print name) SIGNATURE:		

	71.070	Possible	Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	CBRE, Inc.	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
NO.	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	Points 40	40	35	40	35	33
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	30	30	<i>3</i> 0	35	35
3	Fee Schedule	18	11	10	9	9	9
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts		O	O	1	0	0
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	Ø.	0	ð	0
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	* 8)	575	» 8ô	# 79	0 77
RANKIN (#1 re	IG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is thighest point value; etc.)	he next	4	13	6	9	17

DATE: 8/25/2014		
EVALUATOR: DREN HENRY	of Housing	
(print name) SIGNATURE:		

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	The Spivey Group, Inc.	All Real Estate Appraisal Company	Eminent Valuations, PLLC
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	35	35	<i>33</i>
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	35	30	30
3	Fee Schedule	18	16	13	18
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	0	O
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0	0
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	# 8 6	# 78	+ 81
	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next		10	4

DATE: 8/25/29	5/4 ·		
EVALUATOR: OR	HENRY	OF HOUSING	,0,**/
(print name) SIGNATURE:	J. Hay		

RFP14-0012 REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL & CONSULTING SERVICES Brokerage and Property Management Services Group - Ranking Tally

	Committee Member	Lauric Datt-	Clouter Cross	Roy Payne	Oren Henry	Lisa Henry	Total	Ranking
Proposer		Laurie Botts	Clayton Green	NOY Fayile	Cleir rieilly	Lisa Helliy		
First Capital Property Group, Inc.		1	1	1	4	3	ID	2
Consortium Appraisal, Inc.		3	4	5	Î	2	15	3
Callaway & Price, Inc.		NIA						
Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Ac	lvisors	NIA						
DeRango, Best & Associates		NIA						
The Appraisal Group of Central Flo	orida, Inc.	NIA						
Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.		4	3	4	3	5	19	4
Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.		5	5	Μ	5	4	22	5
CBRE, Inc.		2	2	2_	ĵ	1	8	1
Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.		NIA						
Real Estate Research Consultants, I	nc.	NIA						
The Spivey Group, Inc.		NIA						
All Real Estate Appraisal Company		NIA						
Eminent Valuations, PLLC		NIA						

			J					
	1		First Capital	Consortium	Callaway & Price,	Black Sun Valuation /	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central
	}	Possible	Property Group, Inc.	Appraisal, Inc.	Inc.	Valuation / Concordis Advisors	Associates	Florida, Inc.
NO.	FACTOR	Points	mc.				-	
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	40	37				
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	35	30				
3	Fee Schedule	18	18	15				
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts		•	0				
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	16	0				
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	0	0	0	0	0	0
	IG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is thighest point value; etc.)	he next	93	82	WIPS	MA	HIA	HIA

DATE: \$ (25/14	\odot	3
EVALUATOR: Laure Botte (print name)	_OF	
SIGNATURE: Laurie Babbe	<u></u>	

			Bledsoe & Ebaugh,	Clayton, Roper &	CBRE, Inc.	Pinel & Carpenter,	Real Estate
NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	Inc.	Marshall, Inc.	<i>52.</i> 123, 213	Inc.	Research Consultants, Inc
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	35	25	40		
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	2.5	20	35		
3	Fee Schedule	18	16	5	16		
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	⊘	Ø	Ú		
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	Ø	Ø	Ó		
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	0	0	0	0	0
ANKII (#1 re	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS effects the highest point value; #2 is the highest point value; etc.)	he next	76	50	92	MIA	NA
ATE:			(4)	9	3		
ALUATO			OF				
	E:						

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	The Spivey Group, Inc.	All Real Estate Appraisal Company	Eminent Valuations, PLLC
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40			
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35			
3	Fee Schedule	18			
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts				
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2		**************************************	
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	0	0	0
	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS eflects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	N/A	MA	MIA

DATE:		
EVALUATOR:	OF	
(print name)		
SIGNATURE:		

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	First Capital Property Group, Inc.	Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway & Price, Inc.	Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	40	33				
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	35	32				
3	Fee Schedule	18	18	13				
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	D	0				
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	٥	D				
י	FOTAL POINT VALUE	100	¥ 93	× 78	0	0	0	0
	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS lects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	1	5	1/A	NA	NA	NA

DATE: 8	25/14		
EVALUATOR:(print name)	Roy PAYME	OF	
SIGNATURE:	(3)		

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	CBRE, Inc.	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	34	35	40		
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	30	30	35		
3	Fee Schedule	18	15	15	15		
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts		0	O	/		
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	D	0	<i>D</i>		
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	279	W 80	¥ 91	0	0
	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS effects the highest point value; #2 is the highest point value; etc.)	he next	4	3	2	nA	NA

DATE:	25 M	
EVALUATOR:	Roy Payne OF	
(print name)		
SIGNATURE:	(AL)	

			The Spivey Group,	All Real Estate	Eminent
		Possible	Inc.	Appraisal Company	Valuations, PLLC
NO.	FACTOR	Points		Company	1
.1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40			
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35			
3	Fee Schedule	18			
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5			,
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2			
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	0	0	0
	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	NA	NA	NA

DATE:	125/14		
EVALUATOR:	Ron PALM	OF	
(print name)			
SIGNATURE:	(A		
		/ .	

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	<u>First Capital</u> Property Group, Inc.	Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway & Price, Inc.	Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	35	40				
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	3⊚	35				
3	Fee Schedule	18	18	11				
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	10	0				
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	Ô	/			/
	FOTAL POINT VALUE	100	83 2	868	0	0	0	0
RANKIN (#1 re	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is the highest point value; etc.)	he next	3	2	NA	N/A	N/A	N/A

DATE: 82514	
EVALUATOR: LISA HORY	OF Streets & STORMWOSER
(print name)	
SIGNATURE:	

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	CBRE, Inc.	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	30	35	<i>3</i> %		
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	25	30	33		
3	Fee Schedule	18	12	8 🗸	18		
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	©	0		
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	O	0	0		/
,	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	64.90	73 /	89.8	0	0
	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	5	4	· ·	N/A	N/A

DATE: 8 25 14	
EVALUATOR: 159 HEDRY	of Streets & Stormwater
(print name)	
SIGNATURE	

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	The Spivey Group, Inc.	All Real Estate Appraisal Company	Eminent Valuations, PLLC
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40			
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35			
3	Fee Schedule	18			
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5			
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	1	/	
,	FOTAL POINT VALUE	100	0	0	0
RANKIN (#1 rei	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	NA	N/A	14/4

DATE: 8 25 14	
EVALUATOR: LISQ Henry	OF Streets & Stormwoder
(print name)	·
SIGNATURE	

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	First Capital Property Group, Inc.	Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway & Price, Inc.	Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	23	30				
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	30	35				
3	Fee Schedule	18	114	01				
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	0				
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0	0	0	0	0
,	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	#72	* 76	0	0	0	0
RANKIN (#1 re:	IG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	-4	70]	NA	NA	NA	NA

DATE: 8/25/201	14		
EVALUATOR: OREN	HENRY	OF HOUSING	
(print name) SIGNATURE:	J. 16-		

		Possible	Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	CBRE, Inc.	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
NO.	FACTOR	Points					
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	30	28	3 0		
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	30	30	30		
3	Fee Schedule	18	13	10	15		
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	_	ð	0	1		
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	Ø	0	0	0
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	973	+62	* 76	0	0
RANKIN (#1 re	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	3	5	/ 🕿	NA	NA

DATE: 8/25/2014	,	
EVALUATOR: OREN HENRY	of Housing	_
(print name) SIGNATURE:		
SIGNATURE:		

,			The Spivey Group, Inc.	All Real Estate Appraisal	Eminent Valuations, PLLC
NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points		Company	
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40			
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35			
3	Fee Schedule	18			
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5			
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0	0
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	0	0	0
	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	NA	2	NA

DATE: 8/25/2014	<u>/</u>		
EVALUATOR: OREN (print name)	HENRY	OF HOUSING	
SIGNATURE:	2, 16		

Brokerage and Property Managment Services Group - Ranking Tally

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	First Capital Property Group, Inc.	Consortium Appraisal, Inc.	Callaway & Price, Inc.	Black Sun Valuation / Concordis Advisors	DeRango, Best & Associates	The Appraisal Group of Central Florida, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	40	40	WA	Ms	AllA	ILA
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	35	35_			·	
3	Fee Schedule	18	18	14				
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	0				
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0				
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	895	889	0	0	0	0
RANKIN (#1 re	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is to be a highest point value; etc.)	he next	XI	74				
DATE:	8/25/14 OV	tal	006 05 R	OD6 EXC [3]		ing emo	M	

Page 1 of 3

NO.	FACTOR	Possible Points	Bledsoe & Ebaugh, Inc.	Clayton, Roper & Marshall, Inc.	CBRE, Inc.	Pinel & Carpenter, Inc.	Real Estate Research Consultants, Inc.
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	40	40	40		
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	35	35	3		
3	Fee Schedule	18	15	(0)	16		
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5	0	0			
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2	0	0	O		
,	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	890	185	892	0	0
	G BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	3	X5	#2		
ATE:	8/2/14		0	<i>C</i> (\$6	036		

8/2/14	~ ,	UPO	OPG
DATE: OLOSIU TO AND CONFIEND	OF ROAL	ESLATE	Marge nego
EVALUATOR: (print name)	OF	074/16	0-1000
SIGNATURE:			

			The Spivey Group, Inc.	All Real Estate	Eminent
İ		Possible	inc.	Appraisal Company	Valuations, PLLC
NO.	FACTOR	Points		N	<u> </u>
1	Experience, qualifications, capacity, abilities, and references of the business and individual members of the business in accomplishing professional services in a timely basis to the particular need requested	40	NA	NA	NA
2	Responsiveness of the proposal related to the requirements	35	1		
3	Fee Schedule	18			
4	Minority and Women Owned Business Enterprise - The degree of participation by City certified or recognized M/WBE in subcontracts	5			
5	Veteran Business Enterprise participation in subcontracts	2			
	TOTAL POINT VALUE	100	0 .	d	0
	NG BASED ON ABOVE POINTS flects the highest point value; #2 is t highest point value; etc.)	he next	4	1	V

DATE: $S[2]$	514	(MFFE)		Ren	FRONF	Marge May	
EVALUATOR:	25/4/10	Com	OF	1910	2011/le	12000 MC 110019	
(print name)	MAAAT				•	\mathcal{J}	
SIGNATURE:	WAYA						