



HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES ❖ JULY 2, 2014

MEETING INFORMATION

Location

City Council Chambers

2nd Floor, City Hall

One City Commons

400 South Orange Avenue

Time

4:00 p.m.

Members Present

Dena Wild, Chairperson

Margaret Brock, Vice Chairperson

Mark Lewis

Sean Lackey

Keith Oropeza

Catherine Price

Jeffrey Thompson

Members Absent

Michael Arrington

Alyssa Benitez

Staff Members

Richard Forbes

Jason Burton

Heather Hohman

Kyle Shepard

OPENING SESSION

- Dena Wild, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.
- Determination of a quorum. Pledge of Allegiance. Introduction of Board members and staff.
- Consideration of the June 4, 2014 minutes

CONSIDERATION OF THE June 4, 2014 MINUTES

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to approve the Minutes of the June 4, 2014 meeting. Keith Oropeza SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

REGULAR AGENDA

1. Case No.: **HPB2014-00105, 123 Hill Avenue**

Applicant: Allen Arthur, 301 N. Fern Creek Ave, Orlando, FL 32803

Owner: Baig Investments Inc., 10507 Sunrise Terrace Dr., Orlando, FL 32825

District: Lake Lawsona Historic District (Commission District 4)

Request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to remove additions on the north, east and west sides of the main house, demolish existing garage and construct a new two story garage with apartment above.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Siding shall be consistent on all parts of the garage apartment and be similar in exposure to the main house.
3. Windows shall have the same recess from the plane of the exterior wall on both the first and second floors and window style shall approximate historic wood double hung windows.
4. Eave conditions shall match the main house.
5. Garage door shall use hardware and trim to approximate two separate carriage doors.
6. Waive the 180 day waiting period for demolition of the garage.
7. Final north and east elevations of the main house shall be reviewed by minor review.
8. New windows and trim required on the existing house shall match the existing historic windows.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the subject property through a PowerPoint presentation with current maps, current street views, site plans, elevations, the garage apartment proposal, and Sanborn maps. The Board was provided a revision submitted by the applicant. Mr. Forbes showed images of the 1925 and 1962 Sanborn maps to indicate that the garage was built after 1962 and noted that there are no permit records for the garage. He also stated that the location of the proposed garage apartment does not meet the required rear yard setback and that the size of the proposed garage apartment is larger than allowed by code. He reviewed the proposal to remove the 1957 porch addition, demolish the additions on the north and east sides of the main house and to demolish the existing garage building. He also informed the Board that the Applicant has submitted another Major Review for next month for an addition to the main house. Mr. Forbes reviewed Staff Conditions.

Jeffery Thompson asked how large a garage apartment is allowed by Code. Mr. Forbes explained that the Code allows 700 sq feet for this proposal. The Board also discussed the proposed location of the garage apartment, which Mr. Forbes explained would need to be moved slightly due to the jog of the rear lot line. Sean Lackey asked about the Conditions 3 and 8, which address windows on the garage apartment and the main house. Mr. Forbes clarified that Condition 3 addresses the windows on the garage apartment and Condition 8 addresses the main house. He also explained that the hand-out provided by the applicant during the meeting meets Conditions 2 and 8.

Chairperson Wild opened the floor to the public.

Allen Arthur, 19 Interlaken Rd, Orlando, FL 32804, is the Applicant and architect. He explained that the original house is in good shape, but the add-ons are not. Sean Lackey asked if the vertical portions of the windows on the main structure can be matched to the second floor garage windows. Mr. Allen confirmed that he could.

Ryan Taylor, 122 N Hyer Ave, Orlando, FL 32801, lives on the lot behind/to the east of the subject property. He is mostly supportive of the project and looks forward to the current structure, which abuts his lot, to be moved forward and further away from his property. He expressed concern about the two-story structure looking over his yard. Staff confirmed that the two-story structure meets Code. Cathy Price, suggested planting bamboo, as she was in a similar situation.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to Staff conditions. Sean Lackey SECONDED the motion. Mr. Lackey added Condition 9. "That the portion of the vertical sashes on the garage apartment be the same as on the house". Mr. Thompson ACCEPTED Mr. Lackey's amendment. The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

2. Case No.: HPB2014-00110, 314 E. Amelia St.

Applicant/Owner: Maria Margenot, 314 E. Amelia St., Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

Request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the garage and build a new garage with apartment above in the rear yard.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Cement board siding that match the exposure of the main house and be smooth finish.
3. Windows shall be installed so as to be similarly inset to the main house and muntins shall be dimensional and mounted on the exterior of the window.
4. Mullions between the ganged windows on the north elevation shall be similar in width to the mullions of the main house.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the subject property through a PowerPoint presentation with historic field pictures, site plans, elevations, and the garage apartment proposal. Mr. Forbes explained that the proposed placement of the garage apartment will require a variance and that the impervious surface ratio is over what is allowed by Code. He gave a brief history of the historic house, including that the home was converted back to a single family use from seven units. The main structure is a Florida Vernacular style residence with craftsman details, built prior to 1925, and is a contributing structure in the Lake Eola Heights Historic District.

Dena Wild, Chairperson, asked the Board if they had any questions for Mr. Forbes. Mr. Thompson asked how much this project over the allowable impervious surface ratio. Mr. Forbes stated that they are over by 44 sq. feet; however that can be adjusted by removing some of pavers and to double check if the Applicant counted the walkway from the public sidewalk to the house, as up to 75 sq ft may be excluded. Margaret Brock applauded the design but questioned the scale. The Board discussed the size, scale, Development Standards, and location of the garage apartment. This project meets Code and would not be highly visible from the street.

There was no public comment.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to Staff conditions. Sean Lackey SECONDED the motion. The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

3. Case No.: HPB2014-00120, 433 N. Hyer Ave.

Applicant: Richard Barrette, 924 Brentwood Drive, Apopka, FL 32712
Owner: Josh Wald, 905 Lake Lily Dr. C 337, Maitland, FL 32751
District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

Request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a 1925 contributing structure to the Lake Eola Heights Historic District and construct a new 2 story, 2800 sq ft, single family residence with detached 1 story, two car garage.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Waive the 180 day waiting period for demolition.
3. Demolition shall not occur until the HPB approves a replacement project and construction permits have been issued per Section 65.732.
4. The details for window surrounds, sills and lintels shall be similar to other contributing structures of this style and will require additional minor review.
5. Windows shall be inset appropriately for this style of architecture and have exterior, dimensional muntins to simulate a true divided light window.
6. Finish floor shall be between 18 inches and 21 inches so as to be similar to the existing house and appropriate to the style.
7. Additional window on south elevation at breakfast room.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the subject property through a PowerPoint presentation with images from a Sanborn Map, photographs from the field, and existing and proposed elevations, and floor plans. He reviewed previous HPB Cases that came before the Board about this property. He informed the Board that in 2007 the Board approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for renovation of the house. At the November 6, 2013 meeting HPB approved demolition of the existing contributing structure and denied the proposed infill project with the condition that the applicant return with a proposal that is more compatible with the Lake Eola Heights Historic District. At the March 5, 2014 meeting, the Board denied a second proposal. The Applicant and Owner met with the Design Review Board after the March 5, 2014 meeting. He reviewed this proposal using images of the revised elevations, and Sanborn Map images that exhibit locations of local garage apartments and two story main houses in the district. He noted that this proposal excludes the garage apartment. He reviewed the Conditions of Approval.

Chairperson Wild opened the floor to the public.

Richard Barrette, 924 Brentwood Dr, Apopka, FL 32717, spoke on issues about the windows, clay tile roofing, and the parapets. He explained that these plans are hand-drawn and the curvatures of the parapets are even and that the windows do not need banding and are proposed to be inset.

Joshua Wald, 905 Lake Lily Dr., Apt C332, Maitland, FL 32751, is the owner of the property and spoke on his behalf. He stated that this proposal incorporates the suggestions of the Design Review Committee and he is hopeful for an approval.

Gary Magarian, 808 E Harwood St., Orlando, FL 32803, expressed concern about the tall parapet wall and the appearance of a full two-story house, as opposed to a one and a half story residence.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to Staff conditions. Mark Lewis SECONDED the motion.

The Board agreed that the Applicant incorporated the suggestions of the Design Review Committee, reduced the scale and mass, and acknowledged the original house through the proposed architecture.

The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

OTHER BUSINESS

- Mr. Forbes reported on the Minor Reviews for June.
- Mr. Forbes announced that the Photography Competition for the 2015 Historic Preservation Calendar ends July 11.
- There were no General Appearances.

ADJOURNMENT

Dena Wild, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:20 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
Jason Burton, City Planning

Heather Hohman, Recording Secretary
Kyle Shephard, Assistant City Attorney



Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer


Heather M. Hohman, Recording Secretary