



# HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES ❖ JUNE 4, 2014

## MEETING INFORMATION

### Location

#### **City Council Chambers**

2nd Floor, City Hall

One City Commons

400 South Orange Avenue

### Time

4:00 p.m.

### Members Present

Dena Wild, Chairperson

Michael Arrington

Alyssa Benitez

Mark Lewis

Sean Lackey

Keith Oropeza

Jeffrey Thompson

### Members Absent

Margaret Brock

Catherine Price

### Staff Members

Richard Forbes

Jason Burton

Heather Hohman

Kyle Shephard

## OPENING SESSION

- Dena Wild, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.
- Determination of a quorum. Pledge of Allegiance. Introduction of Board members and staff.
- Consideration of the May 7, 2014 minutes

## CONSIDERATION OF THE May 7, 2014 MINUTES

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to approve the Minutes of the May 7, 2014 meeting. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

## REGULAR AGENDA

### 1. Case No.: HPB2014-00086, 1619 E. Jefferson St.

Applicant: Aldo Martin, Infiniti Housing, 976 Lake Baldwin Lane S102, Orlando, FL 32814

Owner: Carlos Romay, 1940 Costwold Drive, Orlando, FL 32825

District: Lake Lawsons Historic District (Commission District 4)

Request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new two-story single family residence with detached 2-story garage apartment.

*Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:*

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. If cement board siding is used as the exterior fabric then the finish shall be smooth.
3. Reduce the mass of the garage apartment by eliminating the enclosed stair element and instead use an exterior, open stair.
4. Increase the separation of the house and garage to a minimum of 5 feet clear at the eaves.
5. Remove the first floor projection at the front entry so that the entry porch is 6 feet deep which is the minimum allowed for an encroaching porch.
6. Roof slope of the entry porch and wrap around porch shall match.



7. Windows shall have the same recess from the plane of the exterior wall on both the first and second floors and windows shall have dimensional, muntins and mullions between ganged windows to approximate historic wood windows.
8. Siding shall be consistent on all sides of the house and garage.
9. Provide a two foot separation between the drive or paved area that provides access to the carport and the east property line.
10. Provide an appropriate treatment for the foundation of the porch that would mimic foundation piers and infill areas on contributing structures.
11. Increase depth of gable end eaves to be similar to other eave overhangs.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the subject property through a PowerPoint presentation with historic and current maps, current street views, site plans, elevations, the garage apartment proposal, and roof plan. Mr. Forbes informed the Board that the previous home was damaged by a tree falling on the roof in 2001 and was later demolished. He also described that the trapezoidal shape of the corner lot has caused issues with setbacks. He reviewed Staff Conditions and provided an overview of outstanding issues, stating that the encroachment of the front porch entry, garage balconies, and the distance of separation between the two structures does not meet City Code. Mr. Forbes also reviewed gross square footage, setbacks, and other development patterns of the block and the overall Lake Lawsona Historic District. He stated that the garage apartment is larger than any other garage apartment in the District and explained Staff Condition 3 that suggests eliminating the enclosed stair element to reduce the mass of the garage.

Dena Wild, Chairperson, asked the Board if they had any questions for Mr. Forbes. The Board asked for clarification of fenestration of the windows. Mr. Forbes explained Condition 7 that addresses the windows stating that it is intended to approximate historic wood windows and a larger mullion between ganged windows and exterior muntins. Jeffery Thompson asked about the pattern of Rhythm and Voids and if this house fits the block patterns. Mr. Forbes answered the design of the house does fit the pattern; however, the garage is larger than usual. The largest homes on this block face range between 1,600-2,500 gross sq. feet and that there are a few homes that exceed 4,000 gross sq. feet throughout the district. Mr. Forbes clarified that the high square footage of this proposal included the porches and balconies. Materials, architectural style, colors, and setbacks were also asked about. Color is not reviewed in the Lake Lawsona Historic District. Mr. Forbes explained that the applicant would need a variance for the garage balconies, as they encroach 3 feet, where the allowance is 2 feet. The entry porch also does not meet code, as a 6 foot minimum is required. He also addressed the size of the garage apartment stating that the size of the garage is allowed by Traditional City Code; however, it does not fit with the pattern of the Historic District.

Chairperson Wild opened the floor to the public.

David Pillsbury, 1956 Japonica Rd, Winter Park, FL 32792, is a representative of the Applicant and the designer of this project. He reviewed questions and asked for clarification of Staff Conditions 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, and 11. Mr. Forbes explained Staff Condition 3, stating that he would support the enclosed stairway, if the garage apartment were reduced in another way. Jason Burton, Chief City Planner, explained City Codes relating to the separation issue and the front porch. He explained that there is a determination that states that the eaves must be separated 5 feet "clear to the sky". The front porch can encroach 8 feet into the front setback if it is at least 6 feet deep and under City Code 62.600 up to 30% of the front of the building is allowed to encroach into the front setback when the Appearance Review Official finds that it is needed for the architecture of the structure. Mr. Forbes reminded the Board that this rule is a Traditional City standard and Historic Preservation standards require compatibility with the block face. Mr. Forbes also addressed Mr. Pillsbury's concern of the porch slope, clarifying that the front porch slope should match the rest of the porch roof slopes; Mr. Pillsbury agreed. Sean Lackey spoke on the composition and the separation of the windows and stated that the vernacular style typically has more vertical windows. Mr. Thompson stated that the windows should appear as if there is space for weights in spacers between the windows, as typical of this style, and a wider vertical board between the ganged windows should be considered. Finally, the gable eaves were discussed, Mr. Pillsbury stated that because of the constraints of the setbacks, meeting this Condition is tough without reducing the size of the house.

Carlos Romay, Sr., 1940 Costwold Dr., Orlando, FL 32825, is the owner and spoke on his own behalf. He stated the importance of the enclosed stairway as a safety measure. Jeffery Thompson asked if the carport could be eliminated to reduce the mass instead of eliminating the enclosed stair. Mr. Romay explained that the size of the garage apartment meets code and the structure meets all setbacks and that he wants to maximize the space.



Aldo Martin, 976 Lake Baldwin Ln, Orlando, FL 32814, asked about the process and the next steps. Mr. Forbes explained that the next step is City Council Approval of the Historic Preservation Board minutes followed by the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness prior to applying for a building permit.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to Staff conditions with a modification to Condition 3, to state "Reduce the mass of the garage apartment by eliminating the carport (instead of enclosed stair element) and to allow additional separation between the house and the garage apartment". The Motion FAILED due to a lack of a Second.

The Board continued discussion on massing, garage setbacks, separation between the buildings, and development patterns. Mr. Forbes stated that this project does not fit the historical pattern of the Historic Districts because the proposal covers all the buildable space on the lot; whereas, historically, homes and garages had more separation and that garages were built farther back on the property. Dena Wild agreed that massing of the garage apartment should be reduced but those options should be left to the applicant. Mr. Thompson agreed and added that the Board shouldn't allow something they know is against code and his Motion was to find a way to reduce the mass and allow room for additional separation between the buildings to allow the project to meet the Code addressing the separation.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to Staff conditions with a exception to Condition 3. He restated Condition 3 to "Reduce the mass of the garage apartment by either eliminating the stairwell or another agreeable means, and to add separation between the house and the garage apartment by a minimum of 7 feet". Keith Oropeza SECONDED the Motion. The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED (5-2, Mr. Lackey and Mr. Lewis opposed).

## OTHER BUSINESS

- Mr. Forbes reported on the Minor Reviews for May.
- Mr. Forbes announced the 2014 Historic Preservation Awards Winners and presented a PowerPoint Presentation.
- There were no General Appearances.

## ADJOURNMENT

Dena Wild, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:35 p.m.

## STAFF PRESENT

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer  
Jason Burton, City Planning

Heather Hohman, Recording Secretary  
Kyle Shephard, Assistant City Attorney

  
Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer  
Heather M. Hohman, Recording Secretary