

# APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD

## MEETING MINUTES April 17, 2014

#### MEETING INFORMATION

#### Location

Agenda Conference Room 2nd Floor, City Hall One City Commons 400 South Orange Avenue

## <u>Time</u>

2:00p.m.

#### **Board Members Present:**

Greg Witherspoon, Chair

Tim Lemons

Jeffrey Bush

Matt Taylor

Justin Ramb

Daisy Staniszkis

#### **Board Members Absent:**

Mike Beale, Vice Chair

#### **OPENING SESSION:**

- Chairman Greg Witherspoon called the meeting to order at 2:01 P.M.
- Shaniqua Rose, ARB Recording Secretary, conducted the Roll Call.
- Determination of a quorum was confirmed.
- Chairman Greg Witherspoon read the Welcome, General Rules of Order and the Appeals process. Adjustments were made to the agenda to correct the dates for the City Council meeting that will approve these minutes and the appeal process deadline.

#### **MINUTES**

<u>Board Member Jeff Bush moved APPROVAL of the March 20, 2014 ARB Meeting Minutes.</u> Board Member Daisy Staniskis seconded the motion, which was voted upon and passed by unanimous voice vote.

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

• There were no Announcements.

## CONSENT AGENDA

• There were no items on the Consent Agenda.

#### **REGULAR AGENDA:**

## 1. 445 S. Magnolia Ave – Dr. Phillips for the Performing Arts Center Plaza

Applicant/Owner: City of Orlando

Location: 445 S. Magnolia Avenue

District: 5

Project Planner: Holly Stenger, AIA

ARB2014-00030 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval

for the CNL Arts Plaza and Magnolia Avenue

streetscape.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following conditions:

1. All previous conditions of the Planned Development ordinance shall apply. Any changes to the PD that affect the plaza shall be addressed if required by ARB.

- 2. Streetscape Treatment 4 along Orange Ave. is consistent with the original approval of the streetscape and the PD. Any changes associated with future streetscape projects shall be reviewed by ARB prior to permitting.
- 3. The final design of a Pavilion shall be reviewed and approved by ARB prior to permitting.
- 4. As proposed, the tree wells along Orange Ave. in front of Parcels 3 and 4 shall have canopy trees installed per Downtown Streetscape Guidelines and consistent with the previous approval.
- 5. The CNL Arts Plaza sign shall incorporate the same font style, with all upper case letters, to be consistent with the Sign Master Plan font for all of the signs on site.
- 6. All underground utilities within the plaza shall be installed with access boxes installed at-grade to prevent tripping hazards.
- 7. Utility boxes within the Plaza shall be painted or be marine grade aluminum boxes to match, or be compatible with, the finishes of the light poles, furniture, or the DPAC building itself, in order to blend into the plaza.
- 8. Utilities within the ROW shall not impede the pedestrian path. The cabinet colors shall match the color of the other utility cabinets on site. Final locations shall be reviewed with ARB staff prior to permits being issued.
- 9. All pavers shall be installed to meet the paver specifications of the Downtown Streetscape Guidelines, or better, within the streets and along all pedestrian pathways in the ROW and on site.
- 10. Staff recommends approval of the Phase 2 Plaza fountain design and materials, and location of the underground vault. Future programs of the fountain water movements and lighting as proposed does not need future Major ARB review.
- 11. Staff recommends approval of the Phase 2 fountains on the east side of Magnolia with the condition that there be a minimum 5 foot setback from the bollards along Magnolia and the face of each of the fountains, to allow for an accessible pedestrian path around all four sides of the fountain, without going into the street.
- 12. Car Display locations are approved. Any structures, bollards, or other display elements shall require ARB Minor Review.
- 13. Any permanent displays need to be brought to the Board for approval.

Holly Stenger gave a PowerPoint presentation; she explained the elements of the project changes and explained the staff conditions.

Board Members Jeffrey Bush and Justin Ramb declared a conflict of interest.

Board Member Tim Lemons noted that plaza is considered "the front door" for the Performing Arts Center; he made a few comments and needed clarification on several items:

- 1. He wanted to know the reasoning for the pavilion design and location.
- 2. Did the shape of the plaza change from the original plan?
- 3. He commented that one pavilion seems to make the plaza asymmetrical and the pavilion alienated.
- 4. He commented that the signage wall seems to be insignificant in its design and to the donors.
- 5. What are the textures of the ground plate?

6. He commented that the textures in the materials lack variation.

#### Ms. Stenger responded that:

- 1. The pavilion originally had an option for two locations, one on the north side and one on the south side, but the north side is the location that was chosen, once funding is available to install.
- 2. There are no curved sidewalks in the new plans; the pathway continues straight out to connect directly to Orange Avenue.
- 3. The pavilion is coming back to the Board for review and then Ms. Stenger deferred the question to the applicant.

Timothy Ackert, City of Orlando Community Venues Project Director, Applicant, gave the following responses to Mr. Lemon's questions:

- 1. The pavilion is coming back to the Board for review.
- 2. Dr. Phillips Center for the Performing Arts looked at many park options around the country and the Lincoln Plaza is what was chosen to replicate for the donor wall. He also noted that the fountain has to come back for final review and that donations play a key part in what is ultimately chosen.

Chuck Bell, Baker Barrios Associates. Architect, 189 S. Orange Ave Suite 1700 Orlando, FL 32801, explained that:

- 1. During research of 12 other plazas around the country, the plazas either had no naming or very minimum amounts.
- 2. The plaza was designed with the intent for an outdoor stage and to have a simple industrial modern look with flexibility.
- 3. The fountain is more refined with a roughened edge on the outside and architectural edge on the top side.

Extensive conversation ensued between the Board, the Applicant, Staff and the Architect regarding the fountain; its' purpose, size, materials, location and safety for pedestrians; it was reiterated that the fountain will come back before the Board for a major review before placement.

Board Member Matt Taylor wanted clarification on the car displays. It was explained that from the plans, the display is only a location placeholder, not what will actually be used. There are different sponsors bringing displays, so it is unclear what would be placed in that location. This resulted in condition #13 being added to the conditions.

Board Member Justin Ramb asked for clarification on the change of furniture from the original plan and if the CNL Plaza Wall would be lit. Mr. Bell explained that furniture was cost driven and that the key to the area is simplicity with the ability to easily move the furniture; he also said that the sign would not be lit and he explained the setbacks of the wall. Mr. Ramb noticed string lights in the plans and wanted to know where they would be used. Jacki Hale, Baker Barrios Associates, Architect, 3206 Middlesex Rd Orlando, FL 32803, said it would be strung within the trees for different events.

Board Member Greg Witherspoon expressed frustration of the submittal format for paving patterns and requested clarification on the paving patterns because the illustration and intentions appeared to be different. Mr. Bell explained that the patterns are running east west and the patterns are intended to curve with the curve of North Orange Avenue.

The Board Members agreed that the CNL Arts Plaza sign should remain in capital letters but, that the Arts Plaza should be in a smaller size font than the CNL letters.

<u>Motion: Board Member Greg Witherspoon moved approval of this item with the revision of condition # 10 and the addition of condition #13. Board Member Tim Lemons seconded the motion, which was voted upon and passed by unanimous voice vote.</u>

#### **NEW BUSINESS:**

1. Project DTO Introduction and Update - Thomas C. Chatmon Jr., Executive Secretary

Mr. Chatmon gave a PowerPoint presentation, explaining the elements of Project DTO and that it is planned for the ARB members to be a focus group of the Urban Amenities and Open Space Committee. The Board thanked Mr. Chatmon for his presentation.

#### OTHER BUSINESS:

ARB Minor Reviews completed since the March ARB Meeting:

- 1. ARB2014-00025 420 E. Church Street Building Elevations and Venting Revisions
- 2. ARB2014-00029 225 E. Robinson Street Landmark Center Site work and Landscape Improvements
- 3. ARB2014-00031 500 W. Livingston Street City of Orlando Sculpture
- 4. ARB2014-00032 227 N. Magnolia Avenue Oasis Grill Expand Storefront Windows
- ARB2014-00024 South Street counter flow lane changes and Anderson intersection crosswalks
- 6. ARB2014-00028 400 W. Livingston Street Fence
- 7. ARB2014-00033 54 W. Church Street Red Café Sign
- 8. ARB2014-00027 417 Jernigan Apartments Jernigan Apartments Fence

Mr. Metzger gave the Board an update on the ARB Minor Reviews that had been completed since the March ARB meeting.

Board Member Greg Witherspoon wanted to know if there are plans for the construction fence on item ARB2014-00028. Mr. Metzger said they are only performing interior changes as of right now and nothing has come in for exterior changes.

Board Member Jeff Bush questioned if item ARB2014-00029 has come in with an application for the painting on the outside of the building that they are in the process of doing. Mr. Metzger said they did not come in for a review for painting the outside of the building.

## **OLD BUSINESS:**

ARB Minor Review updates from the March ARB Meeting: Item # 11 - ARB2014-00013 250 N. Orange Ave – Post Demolition Item #12 - ARB2014-00014 41 W. Jefferson Street – Post Demolition

Mr. Metzger gave the Board an update that for ARB2014-00013 the condition was changed and that the adjacent property did not have to be repaired because the buildings are not physically connected.

ADJOURNMENT: CHAIRMAN GREG WITHERSPOON ADJOURNED THE MEETING AT 3:54 P.M.

THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, MAY 15, 2014.

## STAFF PRESENT

Kyle Shephard, Assistant City Attorney II Doug Metzger, City Planning Walter Hawkins, Director of Urban Development Christel Brooks, Administrative Specialist

Walter Hawkins, Acting Executive Secretary

Shaniqua Rose, Board Secretary
Jason Burton, City Planning
Holly Stenger, City Planning
Thomas C. Chatmon Jr., Executive Secretary

Shaniqua Rose, Board Secretary