



HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES ❖ March 5, 2014

MEETING INFORMATION

Location

City Council Chambers

2nd Floor, City Hall

One City Commons

400 South Orange Avenue

Time

4:00 p.m.

Members Present

Dena Wild, Chairperson

Margaret Brock, Vice
Chairperson

Michael Arrington

Sean Lackey

Catherine Price

Jeffrey Thompson

Members Absent

Alyssa Benitez

Mark Lewis

Keith Oropeza

Staff Members

Richard Forbes

Jason Burton

Heather Hohman

Kyle Shepherd

OPENING SESSION

- Dena Wild, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.
- Determination of a quorum. Pledge of Allegiance. Introduction of Board members and staff.
- Consideration of the February 5, 2014 minutes

CONSIDERATION OF FEBRUARY 5, 2014 MINUTES

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to approve the Minutes of the February 5, 2014 meeting with the corrected language for his Motion in Other Business to state, "Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to recommend that Staff begin the process to determine eligibility to designate Tinker Field a local landmark." Michael Arrington SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

REGULAR AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2014-00008, 433 N. Hyer Avenue

Applicant: Richard Barrette, 1710 Lake Francis Dr., Apopka, FL 32712
Owner: J and K Wald, Inc., 905 Lake Lily Dr., APT C337, Maitland, FL 32751
District: Lake Eola Heights Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new 3290 sq. ft. 2 story, single family residence with detached 2 story, two car garage apartment.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Waive the 180 day waiting period for demolition.
3. Demolition shall not occur until the HPB approves a replacement project and construction permits have been issued per Section 65.732.
4. The details for window surrounds, sills and lintels shall be similar to other contributing structures of this style and will require additional minor review.
5. Windows shall be inset appropriately for this style of architecture and have exterior, dimensional muntins to simulate a true divided light window.
6. The garage shall be one story without a second floor apartment.
7. Finish floor shall be between 18 inches and 21 inches so as to be similar to the existing house and appropriate to the style.
8. Reduce the mass and scale by eliminating additional 2nd story space at the north front of the house.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the subject property through a PowerPoint presentation with images from a Sanborn Map, photographs from the field, and existing and proposed elevations and floor plans. He reviewed two previous HPB Cases that came before the Board about this property. He informed the Board that in 2007 the Board approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for renovation of the house and at the November 6, 2013 meeting HPB approved demolition of the existing contributing structure and denied the proposed infill project with the condition that the applicant return with a proposal that is more compatible with the Lake Eola Heights Historic District. He reviewed the Conditions of Approval for this proposal and explained them using images of the elevations, existing gross square footage of surrounding houses, and Sanborn Map images that exhibit locations of local garage apartments and two story main houses in the district.

Mr. Forbes showed images of the new proposal that indicated with a ghosting of the roof line of the previous proposed house to show that the new proposal has been scaled down in height; however Mr. Forbes indicated that this proposal is 3190 square feet, whereas the previous plans were 3193 square feet.

Jeffery Thompson asked Mr. Forbes to clarify that the square footage of the previous proposal was 3193 and that the current proposal had only been scaled back 3 square feet to 3190 square feet. Mr. Forbes confirmed and clarified that the Board removed a Condition of Approval that stated the proposal should be reduced to 2500 square feet or less. Mr. Thompson expressed that removing that Condition was to not hamper the design but that the size and massing still matter. Mr. Thompson added that this design does not represent the Mediterranean Revival style house that is being demolished. Mr. Arrington concurred stating that this house does not share similar elements as the current house. Sean Lackey asked if any of the historic house was to be used; Mr. Forbes stated no historic elements will be saved.

Dena Wild, Chairperson, read into the record three letters received by Staff:

- Cindy White, 806 E. Amelia St, Orlando, FL 32803: encouraged the Board to consider a reduced-size design for this property
- Martha Morris, 647 E. Amelia St., Orlando, FL 32803: expressed concern about the scale in comparison to other homes in the neighborhood.
- Janet Walker, 645 E. Ridgewood St., Orlando, FL 32803: stated that this project is too large for the surrounding scale and pattern of development of this area.

Chairperson Wild asked the Applicant to speak:

Applicant, Richard Barrette, 1710 Lake Francis Dr., Apopka, FL 32712, discussed the R-2 zoning, setbacks, the garage apartment, and compared the proposal to the massing and scale of the surrounding houses. He stated that he started from scratch and that the 3 square foot difference in size is merely a coincidence. He also suggested a duplex to his client, Josh Wald, who declined that idea. He stated that the Condition to eliminate the additional 2nd story space at the north front of the house would be a hardship to sell the house as a three bedroom as opposed to a 4 bedroom.

Sean Lackey asked the applicant about ceiling heights and for clarifications of the roof-line, window heights and placement, and the floor plan. Mr. Barrette stated that the ceilings on the first floor will be 9 feet and 8 feet on the second floor and explained the elevation images to the Board.

Chairperson Wild asked if any members of the public would like to speak:

- Josh Wald, 505 Lake Lily Dr., Apartment C327, Maitland, FL 32751, spoke as the owner of the property. He stated that every garage apartment that has come before the Board has been approved and that the R-2 zoning allows the garage apartment.

Chairperson Wild asked about the size of the garage apartment and the setback requirements. The garage apartment would be 525 square feet and the setback of the garage would require a variance.

- Gary Magarian, 808 E. Harwood St., Orlando, FL 32803, has lived in the Lake Eola Heights neighborhood for over 30 years and was one of the residents that initiated the Historic District. He provided the Board with a history of the neighborhood and stated that this block has an unique pattern as the homes constructed on this block were built later than other streets in the neighborhood and exhibit the shift to smaller bungalows. He stated that many of these houses are 2-3 bedrooms and that these homes do not have trouble selling in the Lake Eola Heights Historic District. He also stated that the location and size of the garage looks like it's very hard to get in to and if the garage apartment was

eliminated there may be room to reduce the depth of the garage and gain space to maneuver.

- Raymond Cox, 600 E. Amelia St., Orlando, FL, 32803, is a former HPB Chair and lives in the Lake Eola Heights Historic District. Mr. Cox recognizes that the current structure must be demolished due to neglect, however, stated that this structure defined the pattern of development on Hyer Street and by approving this proposal the historic street pattern would be redefined. He encouraged the board to help preserve the character of this street and the overall Historic District.

The Board discussed City Codes relating to demolition in Historic Districts, standards for new construction, setbacks, design elements, and comparisons to other houses on the block face. Dena Wild addressed garage apartments and stated support for them in historic districts however the overall massing of the proposed main structure may present the issue for this case. Ms. Wild also does not support the variance. Board Members agreed they do not feel that a 3 bedroom house is a hardship to allow upwards of 3100 square feet. There was also an agreement that this proposal does not accurately display the Mediterranean Revival design elements that resemble the current structure as they had asked for at the November 2013 meeting. Catherine Price asked if the Board could give the applicant direction for a future design.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to DENY the request. Catherine Price SECONDED the motion.

Chairperson, Dena Wild asked Staff what the next step would be if denial was passed. Mr. Forbes stated that the Applicant would need to propose a substantially different project and that the Board could ask the Applicant to meet with the Design Review Committee.

Dena Wild amended the MOTION to add the Condition that the Applicant meet with the Design Review Committee prior to the next submission. Mr. Thompson and Ms. Price ACCEPTED the Amendment. The Board voted on the Motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

OTHER BUSINESS

- Agenda Item: PRJ2014-00479, Tinker Field, 317 S. Tampa Avenue (Commission District 5)

At the February 5, 2014 Historic Preservation Board Meeting, the HPB directed staff to research the eligibility of Tinker Field and the associated buildings as a local landmark. Mr. Forbes presented his initial findings to the Board and provided the Board with an informational packet. He stated that the original field was dedicated in 1923. He referred to Appendix A of the information packet which is a copy the National Register of Historic Places Registration Form to illustrate images of Tinker Field from the 1930s, 1950s, 1960s, and 2000s. The National Register listing includes the field as contributing and the surrounding buildings are listed as non-contributing structures that support the function and context of the historic field. Appendixes C and D show that the National Register of Historic Places Landmark criteria are identical to the City of Orlando's Local Landmarks criteria. He will need to conduct additional research on the press box to determine eligibility.

The Board discussed the individual buildings and structures on the site and their relation to the historic field.

Chairperson, Dena Wild opened the floor to the public:

- Cathy Hettinger, 715 Woodward, Orlando, FL 32803, spoke about attending spring training at Tinker Field with her father and preserving historic resources for the benefit of the community. She stated that there will be a commemoration tomorrow, March 6, for the 50th anniversary of Martin Luther King Jr. speaking at Tinker Field. Sean Lackey asked if the structures have lost their nostalgia feel from being amended multiple times. Ms. Hettinger expressed that it still retains the feel of a baseball park.
- Joshua Paladino, 1415 W. Robinson St, Orlando, FL 32805, lives near Tinker Field and the Citrus Bowl and would like to see the historic stadium saved. He stated that there is a Minnesota Twins baseball hat in the Orlando Remembered artifact case in City Hall. The Twins had Spring Training at Tinker Field. He asked why a hat is worth preserving but not the actual stadium. He described that this field is the "eruption point" of the Civil Rights movement in Orlando, because both blacks and whites attended the Martin Luther King, Jr. speech and both races marched to the busses that he arrived on.
- Doug Head, 800 Mayfair Circle, Orlando, FL 32803, thanked the Board for their support of Tinker Field and stated that this is a worthwhile project and well within the HPB's scope. He also stated that a map at the

Orlando Public Library labels Tinker Field as "Baseball Park" because baseball was important to the City. Historically, this area was a green space and it would be a disappointment to see it turned to a parking lot. Tinker is a significant name in American baseball and to Orlando.

- Emmett O'Dell, 717 31st St., Orlando, FL 32805, spoke in favor of nominating Tinker Field as a Landmark. He referred to the National Register of Historic Places Registration Form to discuss the age of Tinker Field and other baseball parks.

The Board discussed the process to Landmark Tinker Field, implications of excluding the 1990s' buildings, and the historic significance of the field. Mr. Forbes stated that more research will be needed to complete the Landmark Application and three weeks may not yield enough time for the April meeting but will conduct his research in a timely manner.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Request Staff to begin the Landmark Process to include the field, stadium and press box. Michael Arrington SECONDED the motion.

Mr. Arrington expressed excitement to be involved in the preservation of Tinker Field, as he has personal memories of the site and the importance of Martin Luther King, Jr.'s tie to the local site. Mr. Thompson clarified his motion to exclude the 1990s buildings for protection but as supportive structures in context to the site.

The Board voted on the Motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

OTHER BUSINESS CONTINUED

- Mr. Forbes reported on the Minor Reviews for February.
- Mr. Forbes informed the Board that the Publication Committee met and selected a topic for the 2015 Historic Preservation Board Calendar, which will be announced soon.

ADJOURNMENT

Dena Wild, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:45 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
 Jason Burton, City Planning
 David Bass, Assistant City Attorney
 Cassandra Lafser, Public Information Officer

Heather Hohman, Recording Secretary
 Kyle Shepherd, Assistant City Attorney
 Paul Lewis, City Planning



Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer



Heather M. Hohman, Recording Secretary