

# APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD

MEETING MINUTES

November 19,2015

## **OPENING SESSION:**

- Chairman Greg Witherspoon called the meeting to order at 2:00 P.M.
- Shaniqua Rose, ARB Recording Secretary, conducted the Roll Call.
- Determination of a quorum was confirmed.
- Chairman Greg Witherspoon read the Welcome, General Rules of Order and the Appeals process.

#### **MINUTES**

A motion was made by Matt Taylor and seconded by Daisy Staniszkis to approve the October 15, 2015 ARB Meeting Minutes. The motion carried unanimously.

#### **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

• There were no announcements.

#### **CONSENT AGENDA:**

1. 1 E. Colonial Drive - Colonial Orange LLC

Owner/Applicant: Colonial Orange LLC./Barbara Rylands

Location: 1 E. Colonial Drive

District: 3

Project Planner: Kenneth Pelham

ARB2015-00072 Request for a Major

Certificate of Appearance Approval for a Master Sign Plan and updated awnings.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request

with the following conditions:

1. The Legal Support Group and Healthquest signs must be removed; the window wraps violate transparency requirements.

- 2. Any new signs submitted to replace the removed signs shall require a Minor Review, and must not occupy more than 25% of any window. Window tinting will not be allowed with any new window signs.
- 3. ARB approval does not constitute approval to fabricate and install the sign. All required building, sign, and structural requirements shall be met and all appropriate building and sign permits shall be obtained prior to installation of the signs.

## MEETING INFORMATION

#### Location:

Sustainability Conference Room 2nd Floor, City Hall One City Commons 400 South Orange Avenue

## Time:

2:00p.m.

## **Board Members Present:**

Greg Witherspoon, Chair

Mike Beale, Vice Chair

Matt Taylor

Daisy Staniszkis

Tim Lemons

Jeffrey Bush

Justin Ramb

4. The Healthquest tenant space exterior walls shall be repainted to match the rest of the building.

## 2.800 N. Orange Ave

Owner/Applicant: Craig Ustler/Luke Minton Location: 800 N. Orange Ave

District: 3

Project Planner: Kenneth Pelham

ARB2015-00077 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance

Approval for a new 30 s.f. high rise sign.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following

conditions:

1. The sign shall be installed generally in the location and in the manner proposed, and as directed as follows:

- a) Place the sign slightly higher, and center the sign vertically between the horizontal scoring lines.
- 2. ARB approval does not constitute approval to fabricate and install the sign. All required building, sign, structural, and wind load requirements shall be met and all appropriate building and sign permits shall be obtained prior to installation of the signs.

## 3. 355 N. Orange Ave - Sullivan Properties

Owner/Applicant: Sullivan Properties/Jeffrey Peterson

Location: 355 N. Orange Avenue

District: 5

Project Planner: Kenneth Pelham

ARB2015-00079 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval

for three (3) signs.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following

conditions:

- 1. The signs shall be installed generally in the locations and in the manner proposed, and directed as follows:
- a) The text sign shall not include the backing panel. The sign shall be positioned vertically so that it doesn't rest on or touch the cable suspenders supporting the canopy and the projecting horizontal band just above the sign. The sign may need to be reduced slightly in size to accommodate this.
- 2. Any holes or blemishes left from the removal of previous signs shall be patched and finished to match the surrounding wall finishes prior to installation of the new signs.
- 3. ARB approval does not constitute approval to fabricate and install the sign. All required building, sign, structural, and wind load requirements shall be met and all appropriate building and sign permits shall be obtained prior to installation of the signs.

At the request of the applicant, ARB Case# ARB2015-00079, was pulled from the Consent Agenda and moved to Regular Agenda. A motion was made my Mike Beale and seconded by Jeffrey Bush to approve the Consent Agenda based on the conditions in the staff report. The motion carried unanimously.

## **REGULAR AGENDA:**

## 1. 355 N. Orange Ave - Sullivan Properties

Owner/Applicant: Sullivan Properties/Jeffrey Peterson

Location: 355 N. Orange Avenue

District:

Project Planner: Kenneth Pelham

ARB2015-00079 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval

for three (3) signs.

Recommended Action: Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following

conditions:

- 1. The signs shall be installed generally in the locations and in the manner proposed, and directed as follows:
- a) The text sign shall not include the backing panel. The sign shall be positioned vertically so that it doesn't rest on or touch the cable suspenders supporting the canopy and the projecting horizontal band just above the sign. The sign may need to be reduced slightly in size to accommodate this.
- 2. Any holes or blemishes left from the removal of previous signs shall be patched and finished to match the surrounding wall finishes prior to installation of the new signs.
- 3. ARB approval does not constitute approval to fabricate and install the sign. All required building, sign, structural, and wind load requirements shall be met and all appropriate building and sign permits shall be obtained prior to installation of the signs.

Ken Pelham gave a PowerPoint presentation explaining the application and the staff conditions.

Emily Lopez, the applicant, explained to the Board that the owner was not in support of condition #1a because there are other banking institutions in the City of Orlando that use backing on their sign. Staff explained that the there are different sign regulations throughout the City of Orlando and the other institutions Ms. Lopez is referring to is not within Downtown Orlando.

The Board was concerned about the color of the backing of the sign and felt that staff recommendations were the best option to keep the uniqueness of the building.

A motion was made by Mike Beale and seconded by Justin Ramb to approve the item based on the conditions in the staff report. The motion carried unanimously.

## 2. 62 W. Jefferson Street - Gertrude's Walk

Owner/Applicant: LYNX/Laura Minns Location: 62 W. Jefferson St

District: 3, 4, 5

Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2015-00070 Request for a Major Certificate of Appearance

Approval for the extension of Gertrude's Walk.

Recommended Action:

Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following

conditions:

#### 1. Mural Walls

- a. The mural walls shall be located so as to not obstruct trail user or intersecting vehicle and pedestrian sight lines in areas where the trail intersects with travel lanes and crossing pedestrian traffic.
- b. Future mural artwork shall be required to receive an ARB Minor Review approval and a Planning Official Mural Determination prior to installation of the artwork.

#### 2. Lighting

- a. In order to be consistent with previously approved City and FDOT aesthetic decisions for the Colonial Drive and I-4 interface the Saturn Cut-off lights proposed in the Amelia St. to Concord St. segment shall be replaced with single acorn street lights.
- b. The mural wall uplighting is approved as submitted.

#### 3. Furniture and Materials

- a. The air stations and water fountains shall have a black finish in order to be consistent with the other similar existing fountains and fixtures along the Gertrude's Walk and Orlando Urban Trails.
- b. All other materials, fixtures, features and landscaping is approved as submitted.

#### 4. ARB Approval

- a. ARB Approval does not grant permission to construct. All necessary permits and permissions shall be obtained prior to commencement of construction activities.
- b. The project shall be constructed consistent with the plans and details presented in this application. Any modifications or substantial change to the design or materials may require additional ARB review and approval.

#### 5. Landscaping

a. The final landscaping details shall be brought back for an ARB Minor review and approval.

Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation explaining the application and the staff conditions.

The Board had concerned about the landscaping details of the project and added condition #5.

A motion was made by Mike Beale adding condition #5 and seconded by Jeff Bush to approve the item based on the conditions in the staff report. The motion carried unanimously.

#### 3. 655 West Church Street - Soccer Stadium

Owner/Applicant: City of Orlando/ Scott Neal Location: 655 W. Church Street

District: 5

Project Planner: Doug Metzger

ARB2015-00071 Request to amend a Major Certificate of

Appearance Approval for the updated soccer

stadium design.

Recommended Action: conditions:

Staff recommends APPROVAL of the request with the following

ARB Staff has reviewed the Orlando City Soccer Stadium Major Certificate of Appearance Approval amendment application and is recommending approval of the application with the following conditions of approval:

New or amended conditions are shown in red. Some conditions from the 2014 approval have been removed either because they no longer apply or have been satisfied in this amendment package.

#### 1. Streetscape

- a. W. Central Boulevard -
- i. The street trees on W. Central shall be high-rise live oaks installed with structural soil or approved equivalent.
- ii. Sylvestri palms may be utilized in the two tree wells to the east and west of the mid-black Central Avenue egress location. The palms shall have a minimum 16-foot of clear trunk.
- iii. The accessible ramps on either side of the mid-block egress location shall be located perpendicular to the accessible ramps on the north side of W. Central Avenue.
- iv. There is conflict between the pedestrian clear zone crossing and the Service Yard Card Access and Intercom location that need to be rectified so the card reader is outside of the prescribed pedestrian clear zone.

#### b. W. Church Street-

- i. The street trees along W. Church Street shall be high-rise live oaks installed with structural soil or approved equivalent.
- ii. The first tree well west of the east parcel line on W. Church Street shall be moved to the east to align with the palm allee leading to the Church Street entrance gate.
- iii. The second and third tree wells west of the east parcel line shall be removed to further enhance the impact of the palm allee.
- iv. Sylvestri palms may be utilized in the two tree wells to the east and west of the mid-black W. Church Street supports deck. The palms shall have a minimum 16-foot of clear trunk.
- v. The accessible ramps on either side of the Church Street Supporters Deck shall be located perpendicular
- to the accessible ramps on the south side of W. Church Street.
- c. The Design Guidelines All streetscape adjacent to the soccer stadium shall be designed and constructed in accordance with the standards and specifications of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Guidelines or as otherwise approved by the City.
- d. Maintenance Unless approved through a separate agreement the Downtown Community Redevelopment Agency [CRA] shall only maintain those portions of the soccer stadium improvements within the public right-of-way. The CRA shall not be responsible for nor maintain any section of streetscape not constructed in accordance with the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines or as otherwise approved by the City.
- e. Minimum Width At a minimum the streetscape zone on W. Church Street shall be 14-feet from back-of curb and shall include Streetscape Furniture and Street Tree Zone [Furniture Zone] combined with an unencumbered Pedestrian Clear Zone. The minimum streetscape width on W. Central Avenue shall be 13-feet and shall provide a Furniture and Streetscape Zone and an unencumbered Pedestrian Clear Zone. At a minimum Glenn Lane shall provide a 5-foot pedestrian clear zone or 6-feet if located on the back of curb.

- e. Streetscape Finishes and Furniture Streetscape treatments adjacent to the soccer stadium site should be consistent with the existing W. Church Street and W. Central Avenue streetscape treatments. This includes concrete sidewalks with saw cut joints; double-acorn LED street lights, the lights shall be perpendicular to the adjacent centerline; 4'x6' street tree grates with a 1-foot concrete ribbon band for high-rise oak street trees. Construction standards and specifications shall be consistent with the requirements of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines. Other streetscape treatments and alternatives may be approved through an ARB Minor Review.
- f. Curbing Unless otherwise approved all streets shall have Type "F" curb with gutter.
- g. Structural Soil To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas structural soil or a Planning Official approved equivalent shall be installed around all oak street trees consistent with Detail 3.4-O and 3.4-P of the Downtown Streetscape Guidelines.
- h. Root Barriers Where a canopy tree is installed within 10 ft. of any existing or proposed underground utility line a root barrier should be installed.
- i. Utility Boxes—Utility boxes and covers in the streetscape zone shall be traffic bearing grade.
- j. Crosswalks Decorative crosswalks shall be installed at the Glenn Lane and Service Yard driveway crossings as well as pedestrian crossings in the Premium Parking and Drop-Off Area. Crosswalks at driveways shall be raised to be at the same grade as the sidewalk adjacent to the driveway in order to clearly define the pedestrian area. The driveway slope transition from street grade to the sidewalk grade shall occur in the Streetscape Furniture Zone. The crosswalk surface shall be treated with a material, color or texture that contrasts with the driveway surface. Reflective paint alone is not an acceptable treatment, however may be used in conjunction with pavers or other surfaces to define the pedestrian path for night time safety. Refer to Detail 3.2K of the streetscape guidelines for more information.
- k. Outdoor Speaker Permit— Audio and/or speaker systems on the exterior of the stadium that project towards the right-of-way shall require and outdoor speaker permit that complies with the conditions of the LDC and City's Noise Ordinance.
- k. Vehicle Hardening—Any streetscape sidewalks that may be used to support motorized vehicles, maintenance vehicles or loading and unloading, including the east side pedestrian path between Church Street and Central Avenue shall be 6-inches thick in order to support the weight of motorized vehicles.

#### 2. Service Areas, Mechanical Equipment, Utilities, Venting

- a. Service Area/Utilities All utilities, trash disposal pick-up, and other maintenance facilities should be located on the interior of buildings, and not adjacent to the pedestrian sidewalks or streetscape zones to the fullest extent possible.
- b. Mechanical Equipment All ground and roof mounted mechanical equipment shall be screened from view and meet the conditions of the City Land Development Code [LDC] including transformers and other above ground utility structures and cabinets.
- c. Telecommunications Equipment Screening Buildings should be designed to accommodate future placement of telecommunications equipment (including any communications equipment required by the police or fire department). It is recommend that screening areas be built into rooftop areas so that the placement and screening of the equipment does not become an afterthought.

- d. Streetscape In no instance shall any above grade transformer, utility box, traffic signal control box, backflow preventer or vertical impediment be located in the pedestrian clear zone.
- e. Venting & Exhaust All restaurant venting and restaurant exhaust shall be directed to the roof of the stadium structures, shall not be visible from the public right-of-way, and is not permitted on any façade of the stadium structures. All other venting and exhaust for mechanical equipment and utilities shall be a minimum of 12 ft. above grade, and shall be designed and integrated into the stadium structures so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the structures. Venting shall not occur over or be directed towards primary pedestrian areas.
- f. Fencing All fencing on the site shall be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum or wrought iron picket fencing. Chain link fences are prohibited except for construction fencing.
- g. ARB Approval The final location of exterior or rooftop mechanical equipment, utilities and vents shall be reviewed by ARB Staff during the building permit process.

#### 3. Lighting

- a. Pedestrian Lighting "Pedestrian Lighting Fixtures" are proposed at several locations on site, but the proposed fixture has not been provided. The proposed fixture shall be submitted to ARB Staff for review prior to submittal of vertical building permits.
- b. Lighting Standards Lighting shall comply with the Chapter 63 2M.—Outdoor Lighting in the city's Land Development code [LDC]. A signed and sealed lighting plan with photometrics consistent with the lighting ordinance or a photometric plan is subject to approval by the Planning Official and ARB Major Review. The submittal shall also include details of all proposed lighting fixtures on the exterior of the soccer stadium site. The final lighting and photometric plan shall be submitted for an ARB Minor [Staff] Review prior to submittal of final building permits.
- c. East Side Pedestrian Path—The pedestrian path on the east side of the stadium between Church Street and Central Avenue will be an important neighborhood pedestrian connection. Significant pedestrian level lighting of the walkway area that provides a secure pedestrian environment after dark shall be provided and shall be in continuous night time operation.

## 4. Master Sign Program

- a. Intensified Entertainment District The sign program for the Orlando Soccer Stadium should establish the district as a regional entertainment destination. With its strategic location near the Amway Center, and the proposed Sports and Entertainment District the soccer stadium should utilize many of the sign concepts from the City's Major Attraction Overlay District and Downtown Special Signage District; these special districts include digital signs and limited off-site signage rights that are oriented to the inside of the stadium.
- b. Master Sign Plan Prior to issuance of a Certificate of Occupancy for the soccer stadium a Master Sign Plan shall be approved by the Planning Official thru an administrative determination, the City Council via ordnance [2 Readings] and shall also receive a Major Certificate of Appearance Approval from the Appearance Review Board.
- c. Maximum Copy Area Maximum allowable copy area shall be established in the Master Sign Plan.
- d. Blended Maximums Maximum allowable sign area shall be allocated and documented as part of the Master Sign Plan.

- e. Sign Program Guidelines The Master Sign Plan shall establish a uniform sign format or program for the soccer stadium site and include individual sign areas, design criteria, sign type, sign size and location of all exterior signs and sign spaces. The Master Sign Plan shall also include a wayfinding sign package and wayfinding system for the exterior of the stadium.
- f. Exemptions Inward facing Digital Screens and Roof Signs visible only to the sky shall not be deducted from the total sign allocation for the site, yet should be separately calculated and submitted as part of the Sign Master Plan.
- g. Amendments The Sign Master Plan may be amended as needed from time-to-time thru an Appearance Review Board Minor Review.
- h. Sign Permit A sign permit is required for all permanent and individual signs.
- i. ARB Review All permanent signage shall be subject to aesthetic and design review by the Appearance Review Board to ensure the overall theme and design criteria of the complex is maintained.

## 5. Landscape and Hardscape Plans

- a. Church Buffer— Provide a minimum 4 foot-wide landscape buffer along the western boundary of the church property that includes a 4-foot tall CTED fence beginning at the W. Church St. right-of-way line for 25-feet. After the first 25-feet the fence height shall transition from a 4-foot tall fence to a 6-foot tall fence for the rest of the length of the bufferyard.
- b. Service Yard Screening—A minimum 4-foot tall landscape buffer shall be provided along the Glenn Lane perimeter of the Service Yard.
- c. Premium Parking Area Screening—a minimum 3-foot tall landscape buffer shall be provided along the perimeter of the Premium Parking Area.
- d. East Façade Tree Plantings— Four 4-foot by 6-foot tree grates with high rise oak canopy trees shall be added along the eastern edge of the pedestrian walkway north of the Pine Street stadium entry. The tree wells shall be centered between the pedestrian lighting fixture locations. Structural soil as specified in the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines shall be used in the tree grate and surrounding areas.
- e. Landscape and Hardscape Plans—Final Landscape and hardscape plans shall be reviewed during the building permit process.

#### 6. Architecture

- a. South Parramore Avenue Terminus Because the scoreboard structure has been moved further east the visual terminus of Parramore Avenue has been greatly minimized and lacks visual impact. The applicant shall continue to work with ARB Staff to develop a terminus design that anchors the stadium to the Parramore neighborhood and provides a significant architectural feature that enhances the quality and importance of this significant intersection and surrounding area.
- b. Church Street Entry Feature The lack of an architectural feature at the Church Street entry gate, the stadium's front door, diminishes the impact and importance of the entry area. The applicant shall continue to work with ARB Staff through the final design and permit process to develop an architectural feature at the Church Street entry gate that enhances the quality and importance of this significant location.
- c. Durable Materials A durable material such as stone, brick, pre-cast concrete, polished concrete terrazzo block or Thermochromax that extends from finished grade to 8-ft. above finished grade shall

be provided along the exterior facades of the stadium. The use of stucco as an exterior building finish is permitted above 8-feet.

- d. Principal Entrances The principal pedestrian stadium entrances shall be architecturally treated and emphasized with canopies, awnings, enhanced hardscape, landscape or other material changes or architectural features.
- e. Articulation Not more than 30 ft. of any exterior façade shall be unbroken by architectural changes such as materials, colors, patterns, windows, columns, canopies, recesses, projections, pilasters, etc. Long single plane exterior walls should be avoided.
- f. Transparency It is understood that the functions and facilities of a stadium complex are unique and oriented inward. However, providing 15% of transparency along the exterior ground floor of the stadium structures is encouraged. Reflective glass, spandrel glass and glass block are not considered transparent materials.
- g. Glazing All glass at the ground level should be clear. Minimum light transmittance shall be 80%. High performance or low-e glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%. No windows shall be dry-walled, or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance. Tinted or reflective glass shall not be permitted.
- h. Exterior Doors At a minimum a 4-inch by 6-inch view panel shall be provided in all exterior solid doors that provide ingress or egress to the stadium in order to provide visibility for entering and exiting pedestrians. Mechanical and equipment room doors are exempt from this requirement.
- i. Stormwater Run-Off Water shall not spill out onto the sidewalk or plaza areas from any downspout, nor shall any downspout project into the public ROW. Canopies shall incorporate downspouts or other rain water management systems that prevent water spillage or drainage onto the pedestrian path or ROW.
- j. West Central Avenue [North] Façade
  - i. Art Panels:
  - Artwork for the fabric scrim art panels shall be reviewed and included in the Master Sign Plan.
  - The artwork in the future may be changed as part of an ARB [Minor] Staff Review.
  - The scrim panels shall be periodically replaced as needed in order to maintain and preserve the visual integrity and vibrancy of the artwork and the fabric scrim.
- k. W. Pine Street [East] Facade
  - i. Art Panels
  - Artwork for the fabric scrim art panels shall be reviewed and included in the Master Sign Plan.
  - The artwork in the future may be changed as part of an ARB [Minor] Staff Review.
  - The scrim panels shall be periodically replaced as needed in order to maintain and preserve the visual integrity and vibrancy of the artwork and the fabric scrim.
- I. Appearance Approval Final architectural elevations and design shall be reviewed by ARB Staff during the building permit review process.
- m. Model Prior to permitting, a physical 1"= 100' model of the stadium should be provided for the DDB/CRA model in the Downtown Information Center on S. Orange Avenue.

Doug Metzger gave a PowerPoint presentation explaining the application and the staff conditions.

Lawanna Gelzer gave public comments regarding the location of the stadium within the Parramore Community.

Discussion ensued on the lack of community engagement and commemoration of the Parramore Heritage around the perimeter of the stadium in the proposed design.

A motion was made by Mike Beale to deny the architectural changes proposed in the application, there was no second so the motion died.

A motion was made by Tim Lemons and seconded by Matt Taylor to defer the item so the applicant can work on additional detailing and architectural fenestration along the amended Church Street façade. The motion carried unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS: None.

## OTHER BUSINESS:

ARB Minor Reviews completed since the October ARB Meeting:

- A. ARB2015-00069 250 N. Orange Ave Mural for Creative City Project
- B. ARB2015-00073 16 N. Parramore Ave Advance Auto Parts Signage
- C. ARB2015-00078 605 E. Robinson St Antennas for AT&T
- D. ARB2015 00075 525 S. Division Ave Nitrous Oxide Monitoring Station I-4
- E. ARB2015 00063 400 E. Central Blvd Publix Signage
- F. ARB2015 00067 250 N. Orange Ave Parking Lot Improvements
- G. ARB2015 00076 500 Brookhaven Drive Lake Highland Prep Athletic Field Shade Shelters
- H. ARB2015 00074 1610 W. Church Street City of Orlando Citrus Bowl Solar Sculptures

**ADJOURNMENT:** THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:04 PM.

**NEXT MEETING:** THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, DECEMBER 17, 2015 AT 2:00 PM.

#### STAFF PRESENT:

David Bass, Assistant City Attorney
Walter Hawkins, Acting Executive Secretary
Thomas C. Chatmon Jr., Executive Secretary
Frank Usina, Venues Project Manager
Doug Metzger, City Planning
Jason Burton, Chief Planner

Shaniqua Rose, Board Secretary Kenneth Pelham, City Planning Frank Usina, Venues Project Manager Terrance Miller, City Planning Richard Forbes, City Planning

Walter Hawkins, Acting Executive Secretary

Shaniqua Rose, Board Secretary