



HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

MINUTES ❖ September 3, 2014

MEETING INFORMATION

Location

City Council Chambers

2nd Floor, City Hall

One City Commons

400 South Orange Avenue

Time

4:00 p.m.

Members Present

Dena Wild, Chairperson

Margaret Brock, Vice Chairperson

Michael Arrington

Alyssa Benitez

Sean Lackey

Mark Lewis

Keith Oropeza

Catherine Price

Jeffrey Thompson

Staff Members

Richard Forbes

Heather Hohman

Kyle Shephard

OPENING SESSION

- Dena Wild, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.
- Determination of a quorum. Pledge of Allegiance. Introduction of Board members and staff.
- Consideration of the August 6, 2014 minutes

CONSIDERATION OF THE August 6, 2014 MINUTES

Jeffery Thompson MOVED to approve the Minutes of the August 6, 2014 meeting. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED the motion, which was voted upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

CONSENT AGENDA

1. Case No.: HPB2014-00170, 339 Cherokee Drive

Applicant: Richard Barrette, 924 Brentwood Dr., Apopka, FL 32712
Owner: Suzy and Jay Shafer, 339 Cherokee Dr., Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Cherokee Historic District (Commission District 4)

Request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to replace east and west walls of connector structure with 3 single, 6/1 windows on each side; and to replace glass roof framing with conventional system and install slate roof to match existing house.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. Mullions between ganged windows shall be a minimum of 8 inches so as to be similar to the triple window set on the front façade of the house.
3. Window proportions and resulting multi light pattern shall be similar to the existing house windows.
4. Any new window trim shall be appropriate to the style of the house.
5. New fascia and eaves shall be compatible with the existing house.
6. Both east and west proposed elevations shall be identical.

Jeffery Thompson MOTIONED to Approve the Consent Agenda subject to Staff Conditions. Catherine Price SECONDED the motion. The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

REGULAR AGENDA

2. Case No.: HPB2014-00143, 1525 Harwood St.

Applicant: Dean Bolaris, 7911 Thurmond Ct, Winter Park, 32817
Owner: Minsh Patel, 5 Hill Ave., Orlando, FL 32801
District: Colonialtown South Historic District (Commission District 4)

Request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to construct an attached garage to the house, relocate the entry, add a new front porch, add a dormer to the second floor and make alterations to the existing east facing porch.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.
2. The proposed dormer is out of character with the house and should not be constructed.
3. Recommend a concrete walkway be extended from new front porch to sidewalk.
4. New windows shall match the historic double hung windows in material and 6/6 pattern with exterior mounted dimensional muntins to emulate the historic divided light windows.
5. Step the roof of the proposed garage down from main roof and recess face of garage from face of house.
6. Chimney shall remain.
7. Garage door and new front door shall require additional review.
8. Eave conditions on proposed additions shall match the existing.

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer, introduced the subject property through a PowerPoint presentation with photos from the field, proposed elevations, and site plans. The contributing Minimal Traditional house faces Harwood Street. Originally, there was a garage that faced North Fern Creek Avenue. In 2004, the HPB denied the demolition of the garage and the moving of a bungalow from Winter Park to the property; however, that case was appealed and overturned. At that time the existing driveway facing Fern creek was moved north to serve the relocated house and a new curb cut and driveway was constructed facing Harwood St. to serve the existing house. Mr. Forbes reviewed the Conditions of Approval.

Jeffery Thompson asked if a balustrade is proposed on the front porch; Mr. Forbes answered that there is not but it is not required by code. The Board could make additional review by Minor Review Committee a Condition of Approval. Sean Lackey discussed the gable material, which will match the existing. Michael Arrington inquired about the driveway and if it meets Code. Mr. Forbes explained that the property is Zoned O-1 and that the plans were changed to reflect the zoning requirements, however may not have been updated on the provided plans.

The Applicant agreed with the Conditions and did not wish to speak; there were no other public appearances.

Keith Oropeza MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to staff conditions with the Additional Conditions (9.) The addition of a balustrade, subject to Minor Review approval; and (10.) The driveway shall be reconciled to meet all appropriate Codes. Jeffery Thompson SECONDED the motion. The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED by unanimous voice vote.

3. Case No.: HPB2014-00177, 416 Cherokee Drive

Applicant/Owner: Walker and Emma Starling, 416 Cherokee Dr., Orlando, FL 32801
District: Lake Cherokee Historic District (Commission District 4)

The applicant is requesting a Major Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing one story addition and construct a new two story addition and add a balcony, breezeway, and portico to the south (rear) facade.

Recommended Action: Approval of the request subject to staff conditions of approval as follows:

1. All changes to this proposal shall be reviewed and approved by HPB Minor Review Committee prior to permitting.

2. All new windows shall have dimensional, exterior muntins to simulate the original historic divided light casement windows and shall be reviewed by Minor Review.
3. All new stucco shall have a finish and texture that matches the existing historic stucco.
4. Proposed parapets on the west side of the building shall match the existing front parapet.

Richard Forbes introduced the subject property through a PowerPoint presentation with pictures from the field, 1920s construction photos, the roof plan, surveys, and proposed elevations and floor plans. Mr. Forbes described the original French casement windows. He discussed appropriate roof styles (hip) and windows (casements) appropriate for this Mediterranean house. He also stated that the HPB approved a previous addition to the house in 2012, however that work was not done and the Certificate of Appropriateness has expired.

Mr. Thompson asked if the rear elevation is in the purview of the Board; Mr. Forbes stated that all elevations are reviewed in the Lake Cherokee Historic District. The Board discussed the differences and pattern of the windows and arches of the existing structure and the proposed addition. There is no record of the changes to the original windows, which were most likely altered after 1962. Mr. Lackey asked if the Secretary of Interior's "Standards for Rehabilitation" apply, as some changes over time can become historic in their own right. Mr. Forbes stated that the changes to the windows did not achieve any significance, as they were not related to any particular architect, builder, or master. The Board also discussed overhangs, the roof line, and the proposed elevations.

Owner, Emma Starling, 416 Cherokee Dr., Orlando, FL 32801, spoke on her and husband's behalf. Mr. Thompson asked if they would be opposed to changing the rear single-arched 2nd story porch to be more compatible with the other arches on the rear façade. Mrs. Starling stated that the porch is to give the master bedroom shade and privacy and could consider an alternative design. The Board also discussed various brands of windows to be used; which has not been determined yet.

Keith Oropeza MOTIONED to Approve the request subject to staff conditions with the Additional Condition (5.) An alternative to the singular-arched rear second-story porch shall be proposed to Minor Review. Catherine Price SECONDED the motion. The Board voted on the Motion which PASSED by an 8-1 voice vote (Lackey OPPOSED).

OTHER BUSINESS

- There were no General Appearances.
- Mr. Forbes reported on the Minor Reviews for August.
- Richard Forbes introduced the Board to Molly Delahunty, the HPB's Liaison to the Nominating Board.
- Election of Officers:
 - Keith Oropeza NOMINATED Margaret Brock for Chairperson. Alyssa Benitez SECONDED THE NOMINATION. Margaret Brock DECLINED THE NOMINATION.
 - Jeffery Thompson NOMINATED Dena Wild for Chairperson. Sean Lackey SECONDED THE NOMINATION. The Nomination was voted on and passed by a Unanimous Voice Vote (8-0).
 - Mark Lewis NOMINATED Jeffery Thompson for Vice-Chairperson. Keith Oropeza SECONDED THE NOMINATION. The Nomination was voted on and passed by a Unanimous Voice Vote (8-0).

ADJOURNMENT

Dena Wild, Chairperson, adjourned the meeting at 5:05 p.m.

STAFF PRESENT

Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer
John Groenendall, Permitting Services Division

Heather Hohman, Recording Secretary
Kyle Shephard, Assistant City Attorney



Richard Forbes, Historic Preservation Officer



Heather M. Hohman, Recording Secretary